

WORLD BANK ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL REPORTS

CUMULATIVE INDEX
DECISION 1-551

INDEX BY SUBJECT

Note 1. The index is largely limited to identification of the legal issues raised in the decisions of the Tribunal. Facts and parties' arguments are indexed only to the extent that they are necessary for an understanding of the legal issues. Where article numbers have been included in the index they refer to the article numbers as used in the case under consideration. It should be noted that the documents in question, in particular the Staff Rules, are subject to continuous revision and both the substance and numbering of articles will change from one case to another. Article numbers in square brackets indicate the numbering of a later version of a Rule addressed previously by the Tribunal.

Note 2. References are to the decision number in bold followed by the paragraph number.

Note 3. Except where a clear indication to the contrary is given, terms used in the index are neutral, indicating only that a point has been discussed, and not the outcome of that discussion.

abandonment of office: *see* termination for abandonment of office (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 9) (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion/fairness)

abolition of post: *see* redundancy consequent on abolition of post (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8.02(b)) (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion/fairness)

abuse of discretion

Note: references under this heading are limited to points of general application. For specific examples *see* individual subject headings such as "administrative leave (Staff Rule 6.06, para. 9) (including allegations of abuse of discretion)".

attributability to Bank, need for **239.39–41**

burden of proof/standard of proof **10.35, 38.97, 81.20, 85.57, 245.46–8**

staff member's distress **239.54, 393.59, 402.76**

definition **85.67, 226.21, 315.19, 408.41**

Note: Decisions 408-413 and 416-423 have an identical para. 41. Decisions 414-15 have the identical text as para. 40

prejudice, relevance **271.181–5, 276.53**

time limits for challenge to decision, effect on **269.7**

access to Bank premises, Bank's right to impose restrictions/flag in file

see also flags in file, allegations relating to due process

Credit Union facilities, conditions **447.123–9**

due process requirements

Bank's failure to meet **447.130–1, 474.61**

decision of Tribunal (*Yang-Ro Yoon*) as statement of principles **447.131**

timely notification of restrictions/changes in restrictions **447.131**

former members of staff **243.27, 247.27–30, 318.19, 318.33–6, 335.44, 370.37, 370.51, 381.69–70, 387.38, 438.36, 447.97–102, 447.116–17, 447.121**

ID cards and **447.123–7**

Joint Bank/IMF Library **47.103–11**

legitimate business reason for access, need for **447.38, 447.47, 447.108, 447.111, 447.114**

member of staff on administrative leave **147.57, 447.67–71, 447.76–81, 474.61**

notification and right of reply **243.26, 370.41, 447.76–81**

obligation of staff member to behave reasonably **447.130**

as preliminary safeguard **447.81, 447.97–102**

notification to staff member, need for **447.81, 447.102**

as reasonable measure **31, 438, 447.102**

as reasonable and appropriate disciplinary measure **378.56–8, 381.69–71, 387.38–9, 396.43–4**

review of access restrictions **447.38–40, 447.48–51, 447.112–22**

delay in completing/notifying applicant of outcome 447.119, 447.122
opportunity for improvement of behaviour, need for 447.120–2
as security precaution 370.37–40, 438.31–8, 447.79–81, 447.84, 447.97–102, 447.112–22

access to work space, alleged breach of MOU provisions relating to 443.51–3

accrued leave, withhold as disciplinary measure (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 4.01(c)/para. 4.01(d))
see also claims for money owed and claims accrued (Staff Rule 11.01)
accrued leave as claim for money owed and claims accrued (Staff Rule 11.01, para. 2.01)
138.17–18, 138.20, 138.27–8, 138 Decision, 272.30, 305.12, 305.14, 305.74, 353.17–19
as property right 353.26
accrued leave as essential right (Principle 2.1) 353.27
as breach of obligation not to deprive retroactively of compensation for services already rendered
(Principle 2.1(c)) 305.12, 305.14, 305.74, 305 Decision, 353.2–42
withhold pending outcome of INT investigation (including allegations of breach of due process)
353.2–43
absence of provision for in Staff Rules/desirability of amendment 353.32–40

accrued/acquired rights (Principle 2.1(c))
see also legal/legitimate expectation; salary review including periodic review obligation and right to
automatic adjustment reflecting cost of living increases (*de Merode*)
employment rights of long-term consultants 214.39, 215.48
expectation distinguished 265.26
grandfathering, as remedy 99.40–1, 173.10
pension 216.7
pension contributions, relevance 205.34, 212.11
Rule of 50 205.18–21
severance distinguished 205.18–21
retroactive/unilateral amendment of conditions of service as alternative formulation 1.15, 1.33–4,
1.44

administrative decision, definition (Staff Rule 9.03, Annex B) 392.23, 393.25, 394.14
see also jurisdiction (Tribunal), “decision” capable of challenge, need for; time limits (appeal to
Appeals Committee against administrative decision (Staff Rule 9.03, para. 5.01)/*dies a quo*)
(post-2000)

administrative leave (Staff Rule 6.06, para. 9) (including allegations of abuse of discretion)
see also maternity leave (Staff Rule 5.01); special leave (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 13)
assistance during including help in job search 443.70
at direction of VPHR (para. 9.09) 392.10, 392.23–32, 393.11–13, 393.25–34
“special” investigation 392.31–2, 393.38–9
sufficient reason requirement 392.27–9, 393.29–34
benefits during (Staff Rule 6.06, para. 6.06) 227.34
conflict of interest, possibility of 392.44–5
definition 157.31
disciplinary measure distinguished 157.31, 293.73, 305.54
discretionary nature 305.54, 340.67–9, 392.24–32, 393.27–36, 447.72, 474.61
discussion with staff member prior to imposition 393.47
distress caused by, as evidence of abuse of discretion/ground for compensation 239.54, 393.59
due process/proper procedure 198.12, 304.70, 392.30–45, 393.38–54, 447.72–5, 474.61
see also email accounts, Bank’s right of access to (Information Security Policy (AMS 6.20A))
attorney-client privilege 392.33–4
notification of reasons for decision 447.74–5
extension in order to prepare appeal, refusal 241.16, 241.18, 241.43
following non-confirmation of probation 157.32, 293.73
G-IV visa status and 393.55–7

improper motivation 181.8–13
as interim/provisional measure 393.33–6
as means of facilitating recall from external service 457.68
“no requirement for ... daily presence in office” (para. 9.07), citation in error for para. 9.09 as basis
of decision 447.64–6, 447.72–5
use of language of para. 9.07 and 447.74
violation of a fair and reasonable procedure 447.75
pending/during investigation 197.24, 201.9, 244.45, 304.68–9, 305.54, 340.67–9, 340.81, 373.83–5,
392.9–34, 393.35–7
possibility of damage to career prospects 340.83, 361.42
as remedy 239.34
Tribunal review 305.54, 340.67, 392.26–45, 393.28–47

administrative review (Staff Rule 9.01 (pre-2000))

see also Appeals Committee; exhaustion of internal remedies (Statute II(2)(i)); Workers’
Compensation Administrative Review Panel
Note: Administrative review (Staff Rule 9.01) was replaced in 1999 by mediation (new Staff Rule
9.01).
by Managing Director responsible for contested decision 236.9, 236.11, 236.15, 236.18–20
changes (February 2000) 295.15
decision less favorable than the contested decision (*Samuel-Thambiah*) 133.37, 133.41–3, 254.46,
256.18, 256.23, 256.25
“decision” for purposes of
“decision” capable of challenge, need for 167.21–2, 198.37–8, 201.16
Ethics Officer’s report absolving of misconduct but recommending inclusion of adverse
comments in performance review 167.1–11, 167.21–2
reasonable misunderstanding by applicant of requirements 78.35–8
salary merit award 167.22
direct appeal to Appeals Committee as alternative (Staff Rule 9.01, para. 2.02) 225.21, 236.9,
236.11, 236.15, 236.18–20, 237.9, 237.13
failure to follow correct procedure (applicant) (Staff Rule 9.01, para. 2.02), effect 95.30–3,
213.21–2, 241.40–3, 251.48–50, 256.18
flexible interpretation, need for 78.36–8
Job Grading Program (1982) and 56.10
mediation distinguished 211.46
obligation to seek 239.32, 261.21–3
of performance evaluation 200.15, 211.34
procedural flaws/abuse of discretion, allegations relating to
failure to complete within 30 days 147.9, 147.54, 147 Decision
undue haste 241.19, 241.40–3
procedure (para. 2) 89.40, 95.30
as satisfactory resolution of issue 239.46
time limits: *see* time limits (administrative review (Staff Rule 9.01, para. 2.01)/*dies a quo*)
(pre-2000)

admissibility (Tribunal)

see also Appeals Committee (admissibility, competence and procedure) (Staff Rule 9.03); direct
application by agreement of the parties (Statute II(2)(i)); exceptional circumstances justifying
failure to meet time limits for submission of application (Statute II(2)); exceptional
circumstances justifying non-compliance with exhaustion of internal remedies requirement
(Statute II(2)); exhaustion of internal remedies (Statute II(2)(i)); finality of Tribunal
decision/*res judicata* (Statute XI); jurisdiction (Tribunal); standing, requirements/right of
recourse to Tribunal; time limits (general)

application clearly irreceivable or devoid of all merit (Tribunal Rule 7(11)), indistinguishability from previous submission **Order 1997-1.4, Order 1997-2.4**
 “background evidence” to support claim: *see* time limits (general), events outside time limits as evidence of practice (“ball of wax” theory)
 claim based on facts identical to those dealt with in previous claim **363.31, 407.39**
 claim pending before Workers’ Compensation Administrator and **139.49, 144.59**
 conflicting provisions in MOU **442.32–7**
 issue for decision, need for **336.40–2**
 misconduct as litigant, relevance **259.16–17**
 moot/withdrawn claims, exceptions **464.36**
 new complaint introduced outside time limits **175.26, 190.8, 270.19**
 new facts directly connected with challenged decision **38.47–51**
 new facts in rejoinder **256.1**
prima facie case, need for/sufficiency: *see prima facie* case, need for/sufficiency
 Statute XVII “exceptional” provisions (applications filed within 90 days of entry into force of Statute) **3.23–32, 4.9–16, 8.12–20, 26.24–33, 307.9**
 Statute II(2)(i) distinguished **3.26–9, 4.9–11, 26.25–9**

adverse decision
see also time limits (appeal to Appeals Committee against administrative decision (Staff Rule 9.03, para. 5.01)/*dies a quo*) (post-2000)
 staff member’s entitlement to clear reasons for **90.42–3, 458.59, 482.104**

adverse inferences **332.59, 430.99, 431.86, 450.112**

advisory opinion, exclusion **41.20, 41.25–32, 106.19, 107.19, 108.24, 109.21, 110.23, 111.23, 152.40–1**
see also declaratory judgment, possibility of
 rejection of possibility (Statute *travaux préparatoires*) **41.28**

affidavit evidence **252.1, 252.32–4**
 confidentiality of signatory **141.1**

African staff, alleged discrimination: *see* Dewey Ballantine investigation into treatment of African staff (1996-7) (DB); Lynk Report into treatment of African staff (1999); nationality, discrimination based on; racial/ethnic discrimination

age
 Age Discrimination in Employment Act **391.37–8**
 disability pension, relevance to **177.33, 218.7**
 as limitation on regular, fixed-term or secondment staff appointments (Staff Rule 4.01, para. 4.01) **214.32**

age discrimination, allegations of **230.4, 260.37–8**
 as abuse of discretion **241.39, 297.48, 321.29, 321.57**
 alternative employment, obligation to assist search **321.76, 367.77**
 mandatory retirement **391.32–42**
 non-implementation of contract of employment and **15.38–40**
Palacios de la Villa (ECtHR) **391.37–41**
 redundancy and **165.2, 165.11, 165.20, 192.23, 203.17, 297.48, 321.29, 321.43–9, 321.52–4, 321.62–4**
 Rule of 50 **219.2–12, 220.2–11, 221.2–11**
 selection process **344.42–54, 367.77**

alcohol abuse **244.61, 244.64**

alternative employment in case of redundancy, Bank’s obligation to assist search (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8.06) **226.33–47, 273.50–4, 275.5, 321.51–70, 326.75–7, 331.50–63, 493.44–57**
see also consultancy appointments, severance payments, effect; reassignment following redundancy (Staff Rule 5.01); reassignment (PMS 4.04) (including allegations relating to due

- process/abuse of discretion in search for alternative position)
- 6-month search period **190.9–10**
 - applicant’s illness, relevance **331.64–78**
 - special leave, revision of start date and **196.11**
- abuse of discretion/due process, allegations relating to
 - age discrimination **367.77**
 - applicant’s lack of requisite skills and **191.31–5, 196.28–31, 226.35–8, 321.43–64, 326.58–62, 347.51, 367.73–4, 493.48, 493.51, 493.57**
 - bias **191.28–37, 226.30–2, 321.76**
 - delay in bringing case to PREM Board, effect **331.62, 331.82**
 - failure of NRS to seek on being informed of decision not to regularize **215.37–9**
 - failure to consider for alternative position **321.65–70**
 - failure to make genuine efforts to assist **347.48–9, 405.6–7, 405.31–7, 493.44–57**
 - failure to try to match redundant staff with appropriate position **405.31–4**
 - grading of staff member **200.17**
 - incompleteness of file and **191.4, 192.21, 200.17**
 - interference with job search **213.34**
 - lack of success, relevance (best efforts obligation) **11.20–1, 161.39–42, 162.39–42, 191.37, 241.44, 260.21, 260.44–8, 347.55–6, 363.28, 367.72–5, 482.67–8, 493.46, 493.51**
 - racial discrimination **367.76**
 - unreasonable exercise of discretion **185.22–5, 326.58–62**
- bad faith/*mala fides*, allegation of **196.32, 217.76–8, 297.44–5**
- evidence of active search by Bank **156.18, 203.15, 347.50–1**
- expiry of fixed-term contract distinguished **16.16–18, 187.17, 217.36, 247.26, 310.38, 482.62–4**
- fixed-term appointment and **16.16–18, 16.41–4, 103.41, 183.9, 187.17, 217.36, 247.26, 310.38**
- Job Search Center/Job World and **347.48–9, 405.33, 482.68**
- mismanagement/administrative error, liability of Bank for **97.48–9, 192.21, 200.17**
- possibilities
 - opportunity to apply for another position in department **321.65–70, 321.76**
 - opportunity to apply for redesigned position **261.40–4**
 - placement in unit continuing to use abolished function **347.33**
- reassignment to lower level position **493.52–4**
- regular staff, entitlement to preferential treatment **156.18, 196.31**
- review of Bank’s handling of job applications by staff declared redundant **260.22**
- Rule of 50 and **219.11, 220.11, 221.11**
- staff member’s obligation to take active steps **94.46–7, 97.48–50, 226.14, 226.45–7, 321.58, 321.76, 331.76, 347.54–5, 482.68, 493.46, 493.55**
- time limits
 - Bank’s obligation **482.66**
 - for challenging administrative decision, unwillingness to prejudice chance of employment and **269.10**
 - for seeking free-lance work with Bank **178.15**
- amicus curiae** brief
 - procedure
 - amendment of brief **271.41**
 - late submission **139.1, 205.1**
 - rejection of brief **139.1, 144.1**
 - simultaneous request and filing of brief **152.38**
 - scope/limitations of brief **40.88, 152.39–42**
 - award of costs, exclusion **22.6, 76.22**
 - standing (“person or entity with substantial interest”)

Government Accountability Project 442.2

Staff Association as 40.88–9, 76.1, 76.5, 86.1, 106.1, 106.39, 107.1, 107.31, 108.1, 108.54, 109.1, 109.31, 110.1, 110.34, 111.1, 111.32, 152.1, 152.38–42, 205.1, 205.12, 208.1, 208.10, 208.29, 214.1, 214.36–7, 215.1, 215.45–6, 232.1, 232.16–20, 233.1, 233.15–18, 234.1, 234.15–18, 235.1, 235.15–18, 240.20, 271.41, 373.1, 425.4, 430.1, 431.1

World Bank Family Network 383.1

Tribunal discussion of substance of brief 152.38–45, 214.36–7, 215.45–6, 271.45, 271.60, 271.125–7, 271.158, 271.179, 373.40–2

annualization: *see* tax allowance (Staff Rule 6.04)

anonymity of allegations (due process)

see also confidentiality of contributions of colleagues to performance evaluation (OPE)

360 degree feedback procedure and 271.180

in absence of action based on allegations 313.63–5

assurances to staff, timing 271.167

burden/standard of proof 159.27, 159.35–8, 209.6–7, 277.15, 401.27

confidential contributions to performance evaluation (OPE) 247.20

Dewey Ballantine investigation into treatment of African staff (1996-7) (DB) 254.34–8, 254.45, 338.28

disciplinary proceedings (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 5.01) 401.31–5

right to call witnesses and 28.42–4

transparency and 313.63–5

anonymity of applicant (Tribunal Rule 28)

agreement to 247.1, 268.1, 312.1, 325.1, 342.1, 356.1, 370.1, 371.1, 373.1, 375.1, 376.1, 378.1, 379.1, 380.1, 381.1, 384.1, 387.1, 388.1, 389.1, 392.1, 393.1, 394.1, 397.1, 402.1, 408.1, 426.1, 427.1, 428.1, 434.2, 435.2, 439.2, 444.2, 445.2, 450.2, 453.2, 455.2

at suggestion of Tribunal 443.80, 456.3

finality of ruling on 171.10–11

hardship to applicant, need for 197.41

prejudice to applicant, need for (Tribunal Rule 28(3)) 171.11, 273.4–5, 314.1, 318.1, 319.1, 320.1, 352.1, 353.1, 362.1

refusal 73.46, 147.2, 148.2, 156.1, 314.1

timing of request 350.28

withdrawal of request for 39.2

Appeals Committee

see also Peer Review Services (PRS) as replacement for Appeals Committee (Staff Rule 9.03)

Note: In 2009 the Appeals Committee was renamed Peer Review Services (PRS) (Staff Rule 9.03)

Appeals Committee (admissibility, competence and procedure) (Staff Rule 9.03)

administrative review process, part of 152.43, 174.3

admissibility

see also time limits (appeal to Appeals Committee against administrative decision (Staff Rule 9.03, para. 5.01)/*dies a quo*) (post-2000)

applicant's acceptance of outcome of administrative review and mediation, effect 276.26

claims not included in statement of appeal 208.10, 275.17, 323.19, 334.36–41, 335.44

compliance with Statute, obligation 251.54

new unrelated allegations by Bank 105.54

prima facie case, need for 130.14, 187.4

Appeals Committee Annual Report (2008) 433.9, 436.17

competence

administration decisions affecting contract of employment, limitation to 312.6, 329.7, 343.10, 368.10

advice to management on appeals (para. 4.01) 174.3, 175.20, 436.16

appeals against

- decisions leading to non-renewal of contract 213.15
- implementation of JGAB decision 69.30
- job grading decisions 65.9, 69.4–15, 69.30
- Tribunal decision 18.21–2, 19.17–18, 20.17–19
- compliance with due process/exercise of discretion requirements 144.16, 276.26, 320.8, 355.12, 361.12, 394.10, 401.10, 401.12
- matters within jurisdiction of national authorities **Order 1998-1**
- submission of report to management (Staff Rule 9.03, para. 9) 174.3, 175.20
- compétence de la compétence* (Staff Rule 9.03, para. 4.03) 174.3, 175.20, 385.30, 433.17
- direct appeal to: *see* administrative review (Staff Rule 9.01) (pre-2000), direct appeal to Appeals Committee as alternative (Staff Rule 9.01, para. 2.02)
- dissenting opinion 404.48
- in camera* hearings, confidentiality of evidence presented to and general confidentiality of proceedings distinguished 147.58
- letter communicating Committee's Report as decision for purposes of application to Tribunal 175.20
- procedural defects, allegations/finding of 28.14, 93.42
- reopening of proceedings in light of significant new evidence 105.54
- report, failure to meet time limits for 249.21
- revised statement of appeal 335.20–2
- strict compliance with Statute, need for 251.54
- time limits for appeal to: *see* time limits (appeal to Appeals Committee against administrative decision (Staff Rule 9.03, para. 5.01)/*dies a quo*) (post-2000)
- withdrawal of appeal 118.10, 119.10, 335.19
- withdrawal of performance evaluation at issue, effect 334.17–18, 334.26–7

Appeals Committee (findings/recommendations)

- Bank's acceptance with minor qualification 139.17, 139.42
- Bank's acceptance of recommendation denying requested relief
 - as abuse of discretion 201.21–5
 - as "adverse" decision 157.26
 - effect on applicant's right to take underlying issue to the Tribunal 206.25–6
- Bank's obligations in respect of
 - acceptance of recommendation precisely interpreted 146.11–18, 146.46–9
 - compensation for flaws in implementation 274.17
 - consideration of reasons 175.25
 - findings 239.43
 - implementation of accepted recommendations without abuse of discretion 175.25–6, 239.64, 274.13–19
 - non-cooperation of applicant 16.16–18, 155.33
 - partial acceptance 178.15, 191.5–6, 229.28–9
 - time limits for decision on report (Staff Rule 9.03, para. 9.01) 249.22
 - voluntary redress distinguished 239.64
- Bank's rejection of recommendation
 - to delete material from file 131.11
 - to improve separation terms 83.19–20, 83.60, 91.8–9
 - to increase termination indemnity 11.7
 - to postpone decision under Job Grading Program 73.9–11
 - to provide opportunity to demonstrate skills 84.15–17
 - to reinstate [in TAP] 96.18–19, 144.17
 - to revise merit rating/job grading 72.20–1, 74.13

- without explanation 315.17
- Bank's response to as alleged abuse of discretion 173.27, 201.21–5, 229.27–32, 246.17
 - accuracy of allegations 175.23
- Bank's right of rejection 23.57, 152.43–5, 173.11, 173.27, 246.17, 274.14, 304.20
 - decision to accept/reject as matter of managerial discretion 152.34–7
- date of receipt by applicant 249.11–24
- “decisions”, inappropriate use of term 174.3, 175.22, 201.18
- findings and recommendations distinguished 239.43
- majority finding 366.10
- recusancy from decision relating to of persons with personal or professional involvement 157.18–24
- request for clarification of findings, refusal 18.6
- time limits
 - 45-day target period (Staff Rule 9.03, para. 8.05), failure to meet 249.21
 - appeal against (applicant) 75.20–5
- Tribunal dissent from 89.35–6
- Appeals Committee (findings/recommendations), Tribunal review of**
 - appeals against findings/recommendations of Appeals Committee filed after establishment of Peer Review Services (1 July 2009) 433.11, 436.15
 - appeals against procedural decisions, exclusion 433.16–17, 436.21–3, 443.29
 - appeals distinguished 18.20, 85.54–5, 152.43–5, 174.3, 275.20, 344.37, 355.29, 356.35, 433.14–17, 436.18–21, 440.22–3, 443.28–9
 - challenge to underlying issue 85.55, 152.44–5, 174.3, 201.19, 206.25–6
 - consideration of Appeals Committee's handling of case, exclusion 175.22, 217.89, 229.27–9, 246.17, 260.55, 261.16, 275.19–20
 - decision violating staff member's rights 433.16, 440.23
 - implementation by Bank of accepted recommendations 173.27, 274.13, 355.2–33
 - independence of Tribunal 85.54–5, 211.53, 433.14–17, 436.18–23
 - jurisdictional findings 18.23, 251.25–32, 251.51–7, 275.21, 443.30–44
- applicable law (other than Bank's internal law)**
 - see also* IMF, parallelism with
 - decisions of national courts 349.46–8, 358.32–8
 - decisions of other international tribunals
 - ADBAT 362.37
 - binding, whether/harmony of views, desirability 1.28, 214.19, 215.25
 - ECtHR 391.37–41
 - ILOAT 242.23, 373.67, 453.71
 - IMFAT 383.33, 383.35, 384.49, 424.61
 - UNAT 361.30–1, 380.20
 - general principles of law acknowledged by Bank 1.25
 - human rights conventions
 - American Convention on Human Rights (1969) 251.56
 - European Convention on Human Rights (1950) 251.56
 - International Convention on Civil and Political Rights (1966) 251.56
 - international administrative law 1.26–8
 - national law
 - Age Discrimination in Employment Act 391.37–8
 - D.C. taxation laws 208.8–28
 - D.C. Workers' Compensation Act (Staff Rule 6.11, para. 2.01): *see* Workers' Compensation Program (Staff Rule 6.11) (including allegations relating to due process/fairness), D.C. Workers' Compensation Act as applicable law (para. 2.01)

exclusion by Tribunal 1.36, **Order 1998-1**, 210.23–4, 242.23, 330.13–16, 358.27–9, 383.34, 391.37–40, 424.57, 484.40, 484.48

French law relating to legal guardianship **Order 1998-1**

labor protection laws 298.11

legal/legitimate expectation 301.24–5

US Constitution 358.25–39

US disability laws 177.21

US Employee Retirement Income Security Act 1974 (ERISA) 330.26

US Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act 210.24

US hardship allowance index 184.3–21

US Internal Revenue Code 210.23–4

US International Organizations Immunities Act 210.24

US rules on burden/standard of proof 427.41–4

appointment: *see* letter of appointment (including allegations of abuse of discretion)

arbitrary act/unreasonableness, allegations relating to: *see individual headings such as salary review increase (SRI)/merit award (including allegations of arbitrary and unfair decisions relating to)*

Articles of Agreement, as source of terms and conditions of service 1.18–19

as discretionary act/alleged abuse of discretion abuse of discretion, allegations relating to, earlier inadmissible challenges as evidence 117.30

assurances, evidence of 103.25–8, 159.27, 159.35–8, 176.7–8, 209.6–8, 316.36–40, 328.41–5, 339.34–41, 365.38, 402.18–37, 454.28–33

see also consultancy appointments, assurances of right to seek following termination; fixed-term contract, renewal or extension, allegations relating to abuse of discretion/*détournement de pouvoir*/discrimination (*Carter*); reentry, right to/assurance of; regularization of Non-Regular Staff (NRS)/conversion of fixed-term contract (Staff Rule 4.01, para. 7 (pre-1998)), assurances relating to

burden/standard of proof 176.7–8, 209.6–7, 277.15, 316.40, 328.41, 328.45, 402.27, 441.29, 454.28

circumstances clearly warranting inference, need for 299.10, 316.29, 328.41, 339.32–3, 348.32, 365.38, 402.35–7, 441.29–31, 454.28

attorney's fees: *see* costs

authority to commit Bank: *see* responsibility of Bank/IFC for acts of

bad faith/*mala fides*: *see* improper motivation (including bad faith/*mala fides*), allegations of

Bank practice: *see* practice of Bank as term and condition of employment (*de Merode*)

Bank's role in investigation into sexual harassment 197.55

Dewey Ballantine investigation into treatment of African staff (1996-7) (DB) 254.33

evidence, absence 181.15

performance evaluation 197.94, 199.13

PIP and termination 256.21–30

prejudicial intervention by Vice President of Human Resources 242.38

redundancy decision 169.16–17, 181.15

selection process 255.24–30

benefits on ending employment (Staff Rule 7.02): *see* resettlement benefits (Staff Rule 7.02)

bias: *see* fairness, impartiality, non-discrimination and proper process (Principles 2.1 and 9.1)

Board of Governors, role 212.16–17

breach of promise: *see* assurances

break in service rule: *see* fixed-term contract, renewal or extension, allegations relating to abuse of discretion/*détournement de pouvoir*/discrimination (*Carter*)

burden/standard of proof: *see* evidence; *and under individual subject headings such as* misconduct, evidence of

career mismanagement/damage to career aspirations, alleged abuse of discretion/fairness

139.52–8, 200.2, 200.13, 239.62–77, 266.25–6, 332.70, 444.57, 454.39–44

failure to substantiate claim 485.60–2

Claims Administrator: *see* Workers' Compensation Program (Staff Rule 6.11) (including allegations relating to due process/fairness), Claims Administrator's obligation to act with fairness and objectivity (Principle 2.1)

claims for money owed and claims accrued (Staff Rule 11.01)

action for recovery in local courts as risk to Bank's immunity 353.15, 353.38–9

definition/classification as (para. 1.03)

see also disciplinary measures (Staff Rule 8.01 [Staff Rule 3.00, para. 10.06]), classification as, deductions or forfeitures from pay; disciplinary measures (Staff Rule 8.01 [Staff rule 3.00, para. 10.06]), classification as, deductions or forfeitures from pay

accrued annual leave 138.17–18, 138.20, 138.27–8, 138 Decision, 272.30, 272.34, 305.12, 305.14, 305.74, 353.17–19

“any amounts owed by a staff member to the Bank Group” 353.23–6

monies relating to work performed for the Bank 272.29, 272.34

interest on (para. 3.04) 32.59, 32 Decision, 312.15

in absence of wrongful or unjustified act 39.29

claims for money owed and claims accrued, time limits (Staff Rule 11.01, para. 2.01) 230.14,

253.30–1, 262.7, 262.8, 262.13–14, 262.17–20, 262.22–7, 263.8–13, 264.8–13, 281.17, 281.19–24, 282.3–4, 283.3–4, 284.3–4, 285.3–4, 286.3–4, 287.3–4, 288.3–4, 289.3–4, 290.3–4, 291.3–4, 324.21–8, 333.23–5, 336.24–7, 440.23–5

claims arising under forfeitures from pay under Staff Rule 8.01 (disciplinary measures) distinguished 268.24, 272.31

dies a quo

15 April 1998, relevance to specific cases 270.13

date of awareness of deficiency 336.25

date of retirement 336.25

payment of termination grant on taking up appointment at Headquarters as “decision” 262.18, 263.10, 264.10, 281.16–17

regularization of appointment 263.12, 264.12, 281.20–2

Staff Association activities, relevance 240.19–20

termination of employment 240.21

PBAC claims applications distinguished 240.22

class actions, exclusion: *see* standing, requirements/right of recourse to Tribunal

CLED (IFC Legal Department) (including allegations of conflicts of interest/hostile working environment) 426.6

see also sexual relationships between supervisors and subordinates, failure to resolve conflicts of interest

INT investigation 426.7–38, 426.56–119

Notice of Alleged Misconduct 426.16

relationship counsel programme 426.4

reorganization (2005) 426.5

sexual relationships between supervisors and subordinates, allegations of 426.16–19, 426.56–119, 427.3–10

Code of Ethics

evidence of breach 211.76

obligation of staff members to provide decision makers with candid advice 211.76

Bank's obligation to encourage 211.76

collateral estoppel: *see* estoppel; finality of Tribunal decision/*res judicata* (Statute XI); legal/legitimate

expectation

compensation as alternative to rescission or specific performance (Statute XII)

see also remedies (miscellaneous); Workers' Compensation Program (Staff Rule 6.11) (including allegations relating to due process/fairness)

in absence of entitlement to employment during period for which lost salary claimed 105.56

in absence of evidence of injury/prejudice 73.44, 113.43–4, 341.92–3, 398.32

in absence of request for rescission or specific performance 153.63

as adequate reparation of actual injury 225.59, 326.78

actual loss, limitation to 16.45, 319.19, 319.34, 319.40–1

punitive damages, exclusion 157.61–2, 370.54

inappropriateness of rescission or specific performance and 2.29, 7.30, 27.40, 28.48, 31.27, 73.41, 92.34–5, 99.39, 133.41–2, 258.44–5, 267.15, 344.75, 437.69, 444.47

termination of term appointment and 366.63

as option 227 Decision

as reminder of importance of following correct procedures 30.28

as right of Bank 259.11–13

specification of amount requested, need for (Tribunal Rules 7(d)) 73.44

compensation for

administrative review decision less favorable than initial decision 133.37, 133.42–3

arbitrary decision not to consider for lower-level position 302.5, 302.57

breach of confidentiality undertaking 32.58, 32 Decision

breach of rules relating to medical clearance 98.44

career mismanagement 139.58, 139 Decision, 176.30, 200.19, 200 Decision

confiscation of driver's license 247.31, 247 Decision

damage resulting from redundancy decision, moral and material damage 248 Decision

damage to career prospects and reputation 417.50, 417 Decision

improper handling of disciplinary proceedings 362.31–3

nexus, need to demonstrate 471.5052

public notification of termination of employment 246.59

retaliation and 419.46–9, 419 Decision, 420.48, 422 Decision

unfair handling of performance evaluation 211.78, 338.64–9

damage to personal and professional life 366 Decision, 369 Decision

damages resulting from flawed decisions 242.42, 242 Decision

denial of access to Bank's internal grievance mechanisms 408 Decision, 409 Decision, 410

Decision, 411 Decision, 412 Decision, 413 Decision, 414 Decision, 415 Decision, 416

Decision, 417 Decision, 418 Decision, 419 Decision, 420 Decision, 421 Decision, 422

Decision

deprivation of property rights without legal basis 353.42, 353 Decision

disclosure of personal information [causing prejudice to staff member's ability to defend himself]

147.56, 272.32

delay in notification of referral 451.18, 451.98

discrimination and lack of transparency in application of on-call compensation policy 488 Decision,

491.30, 491.91

disproportionate disciplinary measures 142 Decision, 143 Decision, 158.44–6

distress caused by administrative leave 239.54, 393.59

due process violation (general) 242.43, 242 Decision, 244.76, 244 Decision, 246.59

in case of applicant's contributory fault 396.60, 430.106, 431.92, 478.51

failure to

actively assist search for alternative employment 49 Decision, 226.14, 226.47, 405.8,

405.36–7, 405 Decision, 493.54, 493.63

assist in finding external service arrangement 404.47–9

create supportive conditions **211.80, 225.23, 225.29**
determine non-confirmation on basis of fair and objective evaluation **474.63**
draw applicant's attention to risks of accepting withdrawal benefit **265.31**
follow correct job grading procedures **92.34, 92.36**
follow correct reassignment procedures (Staff Rule 5.09, para. 1.05(b)) **91.32-5**
honor assurances relating to regularization of appointment **209.23**
honor MAS assurances of diligent and good faith efforts to find alternative position **144.58, 144 Decision**
indicate clearly nature of applicant's position and reason for redundancy decision **260.36, 260.56**
investigate leaks to the press **389.154-5, 397.18, 397.51, 451.98-9**
keep written record of redundancy evaluation process **241.37, 241.46, 273 Decision**
notify applicant of adverse tax implications of pension payments **78.47-8**
notify applicant of amendments to investigation report **305.75, 305 Decision**
notify applicant promptly of decision not to proceed with contract **15.42**
notify applicant promptly of downgrading under Job Grading program **73.41**
notify applicant promptly of reassignment decision **113.12**
notify of flags in file **243.16, 243.28, 243 Decision, 370.52, 370 Decision**
observe correct probation procedures **7 Decision, 157.63, 225.59, 293.74, 293 Decision, 327 Decision**
observe Staff Rules governing redundancy procedure **165 Decision, 227.53-6, 248.26, 256.5, 274.7, 294 Decision, 302.57, 302. Decision, 321.29, 321.71-3, 321.76, 331.63, 331.82, 331 Decision**
observe Staff Rules governing review of grades **319.19, 319.39-40**
observe terms of MOU **428 Decision**
protect against sexual harassment **197.80**
protect from sexual harassment **197.97**
provide applicant with copy of INT report in timely fashion **325 Decision**
provide applicant with sufficient information on career prospects **24.35**
provide counselling and support **31.8**
provide means to complete project **217.93**
provide member of staff with written copy of OPE report **207.36**
provide opportunity to answer allegations **157.63, 225.23, 225.46, 225.56, 243.23, 266.52**
provide reasonable chance of success **225.23, 225.46, 225.59, 266.25-6, 266.52**
provide training **31.8, 31.27, 31.32, 132.48, 132 Decision**
require a fitness for duty assessment **470.51**
respond to points made by applicant with regard to performance evaluation **85.74-5**
flawed decision to reassign to non-managerial role **254.48**
improper imposition of PIP **256.18, 408.48-9, 434.20**
inappropriate assignment of work during special leave **196.11**
injury demonstrably in excess of contractual payment already made, limitation to **53.30, 54.27, 91.33**
INT's failure to take exculpatory evidence into account **427.64**
INT's improper conclusion as to the status of applicant **427.64**
loss of opportunities for consultancy work arising from improper application of amended Staff Rule **159.43-5**
lost earnings in case of
 delayed implementation of Tribunal decision **317.56**
 prospective reinstatement **317.56**
moral/intangible injury **2.29, 7.30, 24.36, 27.40, 32.57, 32 Decision, 54.50, 58.49-50, 59.37, 60.37, 61.37, 62.38, 63.38, 64.38, 73.41, 74.52, 78.47, 92.34-6, 100.63-4, 101.53-4, 131.82, 132.48,**

133.43, 147.56–7, 147 Decision, 157.63, 176.31, 188.26, 192.25, 197.80, 201.37, 243.23, 248 Decision, 274.16–17, 274 Decision, 321.29, 355.13, 361.13, 362.34–8, 370.52–3, 370 Decision, 387.9, 430.106, 434.20, 434.60, 434.64
 possible losses from Bank’s delay in notifying pension arrangements **398.30–2**
 procedural flaws
 in absence of effect on outcome of decision-making process **11.27–8, 131.159, 319.34, 485.59**
 by Claims Administrator **349.58, 349 Decision**
 communication of administrative decision to applicant **146.45, 146.51, 146 Decision**
 implementation of Appeals Committee recommendations **274.16–17**
 implementation of Job Grading Program (1982) **74.52, 74 Decision**
 investigation by Ethics Office/INT **201.16, 201.37, 304.72, 397.18, 397.51**
 performance evaluation **27.40, 157.63, 164.22, 164 Decision, 188.26, 211.78–80, 213.37, 313.71, 313.85, 315.16, 315.37, 421.42–7, 439 Decision, 462.56**
 PIP process **257.41, 257.58, 332.71, 334.20, 337 Decision, 338.17, 341.34, 437.69**
 probation process **351.59, 351 Decision**
 salary merit award/SRI **164.22, 164 Decision, 434.20, 434.64**
 selection process **257.41, 326.78, 344.76, 444.57, 453.72, 458.17–18**
 supplementary performance evaluation **450.119**
 Workers Compensation Program **445.37**
 regular work carried out while on special leave **115.44, 115 Decision, 138.27–8**
 shipment of personal and household effects **225.23**
 unfair treatment **217.93, 241.46**
 failure to acknowledge satisfactory work **217.93**
 failure to implement MOU in timely fashion **456.72**
 failure to notify in writing of change to terms of reference **217.93**
 unbalanced performance review report **211.80**
 unreasonable handling of reassignment following redundancy **185 Decision**
 wrongful determination of redundancy **85.74–5**
 wrongful termination **188.26, 304.72, 416.50, 416 Decision, 437.69, 455 Decision**
 wrongful termination of contract **366.63, 366.75, 366 Decision**
 wrongful use of INT Report **366.75, 366 Decision**
compensation, measure 31 Decision, 58.50, 59.37, 60.37, 61.37, 62.38, 62 Decision, 63.37, 63.38, 63 Decision, 158.44–6, 165, letter relating to, 189 Decision, 293 Decision, 315 Decision, 321 Decision, 338.69, 338 Decision, 344 Decision
 actual financial injury **78.48, 78 Decision**
 aggravation of injury by applicant, effect **180.33–4**
 of damages **157.63, 176.31, 188.26, 192.25, 201.37, 321.29**
 equitable **7.30, 27.40, 70.41, 98.44, 145.21, 145 Decision, 157.63, 176.31**
 increased settlement benefits **85.74–5**
 interest **131.80**
 loss of benefits resulting from improper redundancy decision **165.28**
 lost earnings **15.42, 100.63, 146.129, 146 Decision, 304.72, 366.63, 366 Decision**
 lost future earnings/career prospects **100.64, 100 Decision, 101.54, 101 Decision, 145.18–20**
 “modest contribution towards expenses” **445.37**
 “net of taxes” **312.16–19**
 lost opportunities **444.57**
 nominal sum **30.28**
 non-reimbursement of out-of-pocket expenses **217.93**
 offset/obligation to mitigate losses **177 Decision, 426.130**
 contributory fault in case of sexual harassment **197.80**
 ex-gratia payment **115.14, 115 Decision**

pay and benefits under settlement package (*Harrison*) including possibility of retention **10**
Decision, **53.30, 54.27, 81.21, 100.62–3, 100** Decision, **101.52–3**
sick leave written off by Bank **98.44**
prevention of repetition as objective **362.38, 370.54**
punitive award, exclusion **408.27**
relevant factors **227.54–6**
age **11.29, 91.34–5**
applicant’s rejection of Bank’s offer to suspend action complained of **325.67**
compensation already paid by Bank following Appeals Committee recommendation **372.66**
contributory negligence of applicant **105.57, 470.51**
loss of pension rights **91.34–5**
misconduct **304.72, 451.99**
opportunity to pursue career **28.48, 131.82**
restoration to position prior to rescinded decision **28.48, 28** Decision, **100.62–3, 131.82, 131**
Decision, **184** Decision
“salary” **138.16–18, 138.27–8**
salary arrears and pension enhancements **131.80**
salary merit award, presumption of 165, letter relating to
shortfall between amount due and amount actually paid **32.58**
social security tax **32.59, 32** Decision
“tangible and substantial” injury **91.34–5**
travel expenses **15.42**

composition of Tribunal

Note: The composition of the Tribunal is set out in the first paragraph of every decision. Such references are not indexed unless there is an unusual feature.

Muslim membership **424.55**

computer records: *see* email accounts, Bank’s right of access to (Information Security Policy (AMS 6.20A)) (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion); staff records (Staff Rule 2.01)

confidentiality of Bank documents: *see* disclosure of confidential Bank documents/leaks to the press

confidentiality of contributions of colleagues to performance evaluation (OPE) **156.19–20, 247.20, 390.83–7**

see also anonymity of allegations (due process)

confidentiality of IAD Investigative Panel Report (1987) **100.66, 101.1, 101.14, 101.55**

confidentiality of personnel information (Staff Rule 2.01)

see also disclosure of personal information to outside authorities (Staff Rule 2.01, para. 5.01);
medical records, confidentiality (Staff Rule 2.02)

access to document placed under seal as breach **147.55, 147** Decision

applicant’s tax details **32.1, 32.10–11, 32.18–19, 32.48–57**

compliance with applicant’s request for clearance letter and **361.39**

identity of staff member accused of misconduct **401.31–5**

Information Security Policy (AMS 630A), importance of strict compliance with **390.113–15**

INT report **345.10, 345.13–17**

JGAB report, transmission to line manager **58.51, 62.37, 62** Decision, **63.37, 63** Decision, **64.37, 64**
Decision

management attempts to be helpful at time of stress and **314.39–40**

obligation of Bank to protect privacy and confidentiality of personal information (Principle 2.01(a))
243.15, 371.2–52

OPE report, right of reviewers to see draft **332.39[7], 332.69**

staff member’s email accounts, Bank’s right of access to (AMS 6.20A): *see* email accounts, Bank’s
right of access to (Information Security Policy)

confidentiality of pleadings 131.1

confidentiality of signatory to affidavit 141.1

confiscation of driver's license, compensation for 247.31, 247 Decision

Conflict Resolution Centre (CRS)

complaint to as alleged cause of retaliation 322.28

right of access to 408.30-4, 409.30-4, 410.30-4, 411.30-4, 412.30-4, 413.30-4, 414.30-4, 415.30-4, 416.30-4, 417.30-4, 418.30-4, 419.30-4, 420.30-4, 421.30-4, 422.30-4

Staff Association and 335.36

conflicts of interest (Staff Rule 3.01, para. 4)

see also CLED (IFC Legal Department) (including allegations of conflicts of interest/hostile working environment); disclosure of financial and business interests (Staff Rule 3.01, para. 8.01 [para. 5.01]); public office, candidacy, appointment or activity in pursuit of (Staff Rule 3.01, para. 5.02)

administrative leave, decisions relating to 392.44-5

burden/standard of proof 242.31

clarity of Rule 389.53

benefit of the doubt in case of ambiguity 242.31

consultancy appointment within two years of separation (Staff Rule 3.01, para. 4.03(b)) 179.13

failure to substantiate allegation 369.75-80

interest-free loan to Bank client, potential for 304.17-20, 304.24-40

investigator in sexual harassment case 197.54

as objective rule 389.54

preliminary inquiry and 393.44-5

representation of Bank at appeals procedure by applicant's acting line manager 390.117

sexual relationships between supervisors and subordinates: *see* sexual relationships between supervisors and subordinates, failure to resolve conflicts of interest

Workers' Compensation Administrative Review Panel membership 193.15

consolidation of proceedings (Tribunal Rule 27)

administrative review/Appeals Committee 19.5, 184.9, 184.12, 192.7, 249.8, 256.18, 257.40, 324.20, 328.35, 329.3-4, 390.39, 402.14, 443.11

appeals 256.18

applications from same applicant 390.1, 448.2

applications from several staff members covering same claims and responses to jurisdictional challenge, handling of Decision 14.1, 38.1-2, 39.2, 76.1, 86.1, 107.1, 108.1, 109.1, 110.1, 111.1, 219.5, 222.5, 223.5, 224.5, 281.8, 282.3, 283.3, 284.3, 285.3, 286.3, 287.3, 288.3, 289.3, 290.3, 291.3, 328.1, 375.2, 390.1, 408.3

at administrative review/Appeals Committee 184.12

cross-references between arguments and annexes in separate applications 40.2, 40.89, 41.2, 76.1, 118.2, 119.2, 120.2, 121.2, 122.2, 123.2, 124.2, 125.2, 126.2, 408.3, 409.3, 410.3, 411.3, 412.3, 413.3, 414.3, 415.3, 416.3, 417.3, 418.3, 419.3, 420.3, 421.3, 422.3

Note: an identical decision was taken in cases 41-54, 76, 118-124, 408-424

rejection of request for 40.2, 41.2, 42.2, 43.2, 44.2, 45.2, 46.2, 47.2, 48.2, 49.2, 50.2, 51.2, 52.2, 53.2, 54.2, 118.2

response to applications 257.1

withdrawal of request for 437.12

consultancy appointments

see also fixed-term contract; regularization of Non-Regular Staff (NRS)/conversion of fixed-term contract (Staff Rule 4.01, para. 7 (pre-1998)) (including allegations of abuse of discretion); terms and conditions of employment

appropriateness in case of task expected to be transitory 215.31-4

assurances of right to seek following termination

absence of restriction at time of appointment and termination, relevance 173.15–16
authority to give 159.37
in case of budgetary problems 159.2–45
essential term of employment, whether 159.38–41, 173.19
evidence of 159.36
as part of termination agreement 159.7–41
clarity, need for 180.14
classification, relevance 406.39
definition (Staff Rule 4.01, para. 2.01(f)) 175.12
definition (Staff Rule 4.01, para. 2.01(g) (1994 version)) 252.29
exceptions to two-year limit on appointment 252.29
Extended Term Consultant (ETC), definition (Staff Rule 4.01, para. 2.01(h)) 468.8, 468.15
following retirement, at discretion of Bank 179.12
long-term appointments (LTC)
acquired employment rights 214.39, 215.48
benefits, entitlement 215.3
long service, relevance 215.20–1, 215.25–39
burden/standard of proof 359.49, 365.26–8, 406.7–8, 406.31
four-year extension rule 309.7–9, 309.24–7
as maximum 146.46–9
increase in, reasons for 214.39, 215.48
long-term temporary appointments compared 215.2
maternity leave and 309.28–33
monthly salary as evidence of 369.44
phasing out post-1998 (Staff Rule 4.01, para. 2.01(f)) 233.5, 234.5, 235.5, 247.7, 247.15,
276.5
succession of short-term appointments distinguished 306.20–2
severance payments, effect
authorization for exemption from limitations, need for 146.40, 159.35, 173.8
confirmation as remedy 159.42
extension 159.42, 173.8, 203.15
on hardship grounds 191.4–5, 191.20
changes to the Staff Rules 159.7–41, 173.5–7
retroactive, whether 146.37–45, 159.7–41, 173.26
“revolving door” and 159.33, 173.8
terms at time of appointment, whether essential conditions 173.14–19

contract of employment

amendment, need for agreement 180.17–20
authority to conclude 15.28–31, 15.35
breach, allegations relating to
failure to meet legal/legitimate expectation 213.27, 384.34–46
limited access flags in applicant’s file 318.19, 318.33–6
non-implementation on medical/age grounds 15.36–41
non-regularization of appointment 209.20, 211.51
recall from external service earlier than expected 457.64–5
refusal to investigate complaint 318.19
change of conditions caveat 384.36–8, 384.41–3
commitment to enter into (PMS 2.21) 15.30–5
formation, requirements 15.21–30
applicant’s reasonable belief in compliance with 15.29–30, 15.35
implementation

choice of means 229.32
preconditions 15.36–41
third parties, dependence on 384.36–7, 384.41–2
initialled objection on letter of appointment, effect 295.32
interpretation
 contra proferentes rule 384.36
 parallel contracts with other parties, relevance 180.23–5
 specific terms to prevail over general 384.38
 subsequent practice and 180.22, 180.26–31
letter of agreement for external service 384.34–46
option to extend by “mutual agreement” 384.36–7, 384.40
rigorous application, need for 252.40–1

contractual fees

alleged unfairness 217.79
claims disproportionately in excess of estimate 180.9, 180.32–3
clarity, need for 180.14, 180.30
determination of 217.79
lump sum/pro rata payment, whether 180.2–33

costs 19 Decision, 92 Decision, 98 Decision, 99 Decision, 115 Decision, 142 Decision, 143 Decision, 144 Decision, 158 Decision, 164 Decision, 176 Decision, 178 Decision, 185 Decision, 188 Decision, 197 Decision, 200 Decision, 207 Decision, 209 Decision, 217 Decision, 225.59, 225 Decision, 241 Decision, 243 Decision, 244 Decision, 246 Decision, 248 Decision, 253 Decision, 309 Decision, 315 Decision, 321 Decision, 326 Decision, 331.82, 331 Decision, 334 Decision, 337 Decision, 338 Decision, 341 Decision, 343 Decision, 366 Decision, 369 Decision, 370 Decision, 380 Decision, 405 Decision, 434 Decision, 437 Decision, 444 Decision, 450 Decision, 455 Decision, 481 Decision

see also compensation for; remedies (miscellaneous)

in absence of finding of illegality 39.29
Administrative Tribunal 242.44, 242 Decision
amicus curiae brief on, exclusion 22.6, 76.22
applicant’s inappropriate presentation of case and 227.57–9
Bank’s inappropriate jurisdictional objection and 343.20
in case of important legal issues of general application 222.22, 223.22, 224.22, 245 Costs, 373.89
 where key issues already determined 281.25
in case of partial success of Applicant 483.48
for copying and dispatching 157.67
“each party to pay own costs” principle 76.28–32, 484 Decision
expenses incurred because of postponement of Appeals Committee hearing 260.22
finality of decision 87.15–17
inadmissibility of application, relevance 175.27–8
itemized statement, need for 73.45, 73 Decision, 87.2–17, 180.34
 time limits 177 Decision
for jurisdictional phase 173 Decision, 187 Decision, 194 Decision, 206.23, 207 Decision, 215 Decision, 233 Decision, 234 Decision, 235 Decision, 249 Decision, 265 Decision, 268 Decision, 312 Decision, 355.34, 355 Decision, 359 Decision
legal costs 78.49, 78 Decision, 100.65, 100 Decision, 101.55, 101 Decision, 145 Decision, 146 Decision, 159 Decision, 182 Decision, 192 Decision, 242.17, 353.43, 353 Decision, 356 Decision
see also legal assistance from independent adviser during disciplinary proceedings, rights under Staff Rule 8.01, para. 4.10
in absence of legal services 81.22, 157.67

Appeals Committee 28.15, 225.23, 229.18, 229.22, 239.34, 274.7, 321.29, 397.18
 Bank to pay 63.474, 488 Decision
 in case of extenuating circumstance 492.59
 in case of undue delay in decision on disciplinary measures 487.103, 489.89
 contribution towards 408 Decision, 430.107, 430 Decision, 431.94, 431 Decision
 Note: Decisions 408-422 included an identical provision
 INT investigation 146 Decision, 361.23–37, 426.132, 427.65–8
 partial 262.28–9, 263.14, 264.14, 274.19, 389.156
 PRS 451.18
 Tribunal proceedings 146.132, 146 Decision, 200 Decision, 315 Decision, 462 Decision
 unreasonable obstacles to applicant’s attempts to bring case 355.34, 355 Decision
 for merits phase 265 Decision
 nominal 177 Decision, 180.34, 271.181–5
 for oral hearings 226.47
 postponement of Appeals Committee hearing 260.22
 for preliminary objections phase 469 Decision, 473 Decision
 proportional 226.47
 respondent’s failure to give reasons for contested decision 262.28–9, 263.14, 264.14
 withdrawal of application on Bank’s offer to pay costs 186.1–3
coterminous appointment (Staff Rule 4.01, para. 2.02) 328.11
country office staff: *see* field staff
credibility: *see* evidence, credibility
criminal investigations: *see* national criminal investigations
currency speculation: *see* misconduct, classification as (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 3.01 [para. 2.01]/Principle 3/breaches of Staff Rule 3.0), currency speculation (para. 7.04)

death benefit (SRP)
see also surviving spouse benefit (SRP Art. 4, s 4.1(a)(ii))
 death of retired staff member not married on date of death (SRP 4.1(b)) 330.6
 payment to beneficiary designated by SRP participant (SRP 4.1(d)) 330.6
 abuse of discretion, allegations of 330.17–33
 divorce, effect on designation in absence of revocation 330.8, 330.17–33
 divorce settlement waiving claim to any portion of World Bank retirement plan, effect 330.5, 330.8, 330.30–2
 suspension pending outcome of dispute settlement proceedings (SRP 12.2) 330.9, 330.34
 US jurisprudence 330.26

decision for purpose of determining compliance with time limits: *see* time limits (appeal to Appeals Committee against administrative decision (Staff Rule 9.03, para. 5.01)/*dies a quo*) (post-2000)

decision of Tribunal: *see* Tribunal decision

declaratory judgment, possibility of 41.31, 152.41
see also advisory opinion, exclusion

delay: *see* exceptional circumstances justifying failure to meet time limits for submission of application (Statute II(2)); time limits

Department of Institutional Integrity (INT): *see* Ethics and Business Conduct, Office of (EBC); misconduct, classification as (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 3.01 [para. 2.01]/Principle 3)

détournement de pouvoir/détournement de procédure
see also fixed-term contract, renewal or extension, allegations relating to abuse of discretion/*détournement de pouvoir*/discrimination (*Carter*)
 definition 214.24, 215.30

development assignment
 Development Assignment Implementation Guidelines 454.30

promotion following, right to/assurance of 454.26–33
 reentry following, right to/assurance of 168.28, 181.8–13
Dewey Ballantine investigation into treatment of African staff (1996-7) (DB) 254.10–13
 anonymity of allegations 254.34–8, 254.45
 improper influence, whether 254.33
 individual’s personal record, relevance to 254.33–5, 294.16–17
 terms of reference, failure to conform to 254.34–5
differential treatment (Principle 2.1), grounds for 229.30–2
 age (mandatory retirement) 391.32–42
 see also age discrimination, allegations of
 diversity considerations 344.54, 344.64, 344.67, 367.54, 367.76, 367.77, 444.46, 444.52, 444.56, 453.64–7
 generous termination indemnity on grounds of age 12.45
 “highest caliber” obligation (Principle 4.1(b)) 391.31–2
 Human Resources Policy Reform 252.8–13, 253.10–13, 301.11–18, 391.2–43
 on-call compensation 488.57–73, 491.67–84
 redundancy and selection distinguished 367.54, 367.76
 RIMP/mandatory enrollment in Medicare 473.36–9
 Rule of 50: *see* Rule of 50, discriminatory, whether
 salary differences 360.19–21, 464.29
 Staff Retirement Plan (SRP) 205.24–6, 219.8, 220.8, 221.8, 222.11–14, 223.11–14, 224.11–14, 301.11–18, 391.32–42
 Strategic Compact 216.8, 222.17–19, 223.17–19, 224.17–19
 surviving spouse benefit 210.26
direct application by agreement of the parties (Statute II(2)(i)) 108.8, 231.8–9, 231.17, 232.9, 233.9, 234.9, 235.9, 271.40, 294.2, 306.9, Order 2003-1, 309.14, 325.18, 373.20, 378.7, 392.12, 393.16, 408.37, 427.19–20, 430.63
Note: Decisions 408-422 have an identical para. 37
 90-day limit 336.5, 336.21–3, 427.21–8
 in absence of Appeals Committee jurisdiction 118.10, 119.10, 120.8, 121.9, 121.27, 122.26, 123.10, 123.28, 124.26, 125.26, 126.27, 128.27
 applicant’s refusal of option, effect 394.23–4
 challenge to Rule of 50 decision 205.11
 claims not covered by 380.10
 contrary provision in MOU 442.45–9
 direct application despite refusal by Bank 425.19
 evidence of agreement to 333.36
 objection to jurisdiction on other grounds, effect on 232.9, 324.20
 revision of Tribunal decision (Statute XIII) and 138.26
 scope of review, effect on 380.21
 time limits (Tribunal rule 7(8)) 426.41–8, 427.18–31
 as waiver of exhaustion of internal remedies requirement 3.18
disability accommodations (including alleged failure to provide reasonable accommodations) 481.1–66
 Accommodations Guidelines (ADA) 466.54–6, 466.65, 466.71, 481.38
 evidence of offer, adequacy 481.41–51
 expeditious approach to, importance 481.66
 “reasonable accommodation” 481.38, 481.39
 cost, business needs and commonsense judgment as basis 481.59, 481.63
 determination on case-by-case basis 481.60
 staff member’s personal preference 481.63

reassignment to vacant position as reasonable accommodation, requirements
ADA/Disabilities Toolkit 481.52
change of supervisor/Region, medical recommendations 481.55–65
creation of new post, justification 481.63
good faith obligation to engage in interactive process to identify position 481.54
staff member's suitability for position 481.53
vacancy of position requirement 481.53

State practice 481.40

disability pension (SRP 3, s 3.4)

see also medical condition; Pension Benefits Administration Committee (PBAC); Pension Benefits Administration Committee (PBAC) decisions, appeal to Tribunal (including *Courtney (No. 2)* formulation of scope of review); Staff Retirement Plan (SRP); Workers' Compensation Program (Staff Rule 6.11) (including allegations relating to due process/fairness)

due process, factors militating against 177.37

evidence

of fibromyalgia 177.13–17
of permanent incapacity 177.19–31, 182.14–16
review by Tribunal 177.22–35
sufficiency 12.43

mutually agreed separation and 153.153.36

obligation of Bank to offer duties which applicant could reasonably perform 153.3, 153.35

requirements 177.7

ambiguity 177.37
certification by one or more physicians designated by PBAC 177.23
Medical Advisor, authority 177.23
medical examination (s 3.4(c)) 218.15, 218.21
mental or physical incapacity for any reasonable duty 177.21, 182.13
permanent incapacity 177.19–31, 182.14–18, 218.4, 218.7, 218.15–17
age, relevance 177.33, 218.7
total incapacity 153.4–5, 153.33–4, 177.18, 182.11–13
workers' compensation distinguished 177.20, 218.4–5, 218.12, 218.16–20

resettlement benefits

commencement date, complaints relating to 204.2–13
extension on grounds of hardship 204.19

termination (s 3.4(d)) 218.15, 218.21

US law, relevance 177.21

Disability Program

approval of benefit (Staff Rule 6.22)

challenge on legal vs medical assessment grounds distinguished 479.40
medical examination requirement (para. 4.02) 425.42–3
provision of further documentation (para. 4.03), limitation to relevant documentation 425.44–5
review of medical information (para. 4.03) 425.42–3

business needs of organization in relation to disabled persons 466.62–8

DAF (Disability Accommodation Fund), procedures for application to 466.70

Disabilities Convention (2006), relevance 470.50

Disabilities Insurance Program (Staff Rule 6.22, para. 5.06) 481.52

Disability Administrator's obligation to act with fairness and objectivity (Principle 2.1) 425.39, 425.45–6

Disability Toolkit 482.39

procedures, recommendation for improvement 425.46, 442.53

staff member's obligation to know the rules relating to 470.48–9

time limits to appeal “the final denial” (Staff Rule 6.22, para. 6.01), applicability to “decision”
479.36–9

amendment (2012) (Staff Rule 6.22, para. 9.01) 479.39

plain and ordinary meaning 479.38–9

disciplinary measures (Staff Rule 8.01 [Staff Rule 3.00, para. 10.06]), classification as

access to Bank premises, restriction on (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 3.03(c)) 378.56–8, 381.69–71,
387.38–9, 396.43–4, 487.67

administrative leave 293.73

applicability of rule in force at time of misconduct 304.49, 386.36, 396.41–2, 397.22

deductions or forfeitures from pay

see also claims for money owed and claims accrued (Staff Rule 11.01)

court-ordered spousal support 325.63

time limits for claims relating to 268.24, 272.31

withhold of accrued leave as: *see* accrued leave, withhold as disciplinary measure (Staff Rule
8.01, para. 4.01(c)/para. 4.01(d))

withhold of separation payment as 272.31

demotion (Principle 8.1) 28.38, 28.40–1, 131.10

finding of misconduct, relevance 430.71, 431.62, 450.88

loss of future employment and contractual opportunities with the Bank Group (Staff Rule 8.01, para.
3.03(1)) 381.39–40, 381.45–9, 381.66–8, 487.67, 487.70–82

mandatory termination: *see* mandatory termination (Staff Rule 3.01/Staff Rule 8.01)

negative comments in performance evaluation distinguished 198.31

temporary bar to hire pending review 487.88–92

use of terminology and procedures associated with disciplinary proceedings, relevance 430.72–3,
430.76, 431.63, 450.87–90

**disciplinary measures (Staff Rule 8.01 [Staff Rule 3.00, para. 10.09]), case-by-case approach/factors
affecting choice of**

see also mandatory termination (Staff Rule 3.01/Staff Rule 8.01), discretion not to terminate,
relevant factors

absence of previous adverse disciplinary findings 489.12

action by Bank in relation to similar misconduct by other staff 304.47–8

aggravating factors (including seriousness of matter and frequency of conduct) 142.43, 143.38–9,
373.55–8, 373.70, 380.34, 396.39–41, 455.35, 455.44–52, 487.14, 487.79, 489.67

absolute prohibition, relevance 487.77

frequency of offending conduct 142.43, 143.38–9, 158.40–1, 158.43, 207.28–9, 304.51–4,
373.68, 389.117

extenuating circumstances 373.59–61, 396.40, 448.49–53, 448.82–3, 492.28–59

absence of effect on work 492.53

cooperation with investigators 492.53

junior status of Applicant 492.55

single act 492.52, 492.58

failure of Bank to observe due process 305.73, 305.75

fraud 142.44, 142.46, 143.39, 158.39, 158.40, 158.43

good record of applicant 142.44, 487.73

interests of the Bank 373.64–7

length of service 142.44, 143.40, 158.39, 158.42, 187.73

management responsibilities of applicant 142.44, 143.40

measure of “unjust enrichment” 142.44, 143.40

misconduct falling short of actual conflict of interest or abuse of position 304.38–40

motivation 489.12

offer to rectify/make restitution 158.42, 304.48, 352.41, 487.76, 489.12

proportionality **14.47–8, 28.41, 105.53, 140.41–2, 142.43–6, 143.37–42, 158.37–44, 207.28–9, 242.33–5, 300.37, 304.49–54, 305.16, 305.70–5, 352.38–42, 369.54–5, 369.82, 373.49–51, 378.41–6, 389.114–18, 448.45–53, 448.83, 455.32–56, 487.68–82, 492.30–59**
 seniority of staff member **389.118**
 situation of staff member **158.40–2, 304.51–4**
 staff member’s perception that his conduct was in the Bank’s interest **352.38–41, 487.80–1, 489.55, 489.59**
 technical nature of offence **304.46**
 termination, appropriateness except where mandatory **492.27–59**
 continuation in employment following emergence of misconduct **492.56, 492.59**
 review of Tribunal jurisprudence **492.49–51**
 termination on grounds of misconduct rather than redundancy, effect **158.42**
disciplinary measures (Staff Rule 8.01 [Staff Rule 3.0]), limitation to misconduct adversely reflecting on reputation or integrity of Bank or IFC 140.24–36
 action incompatible with the proper discharge of duties (Principle 3.3(g)) **143.23**
 determination on case-by-case basis **140.28**
 failure to observe host State law (Principle 3.3) **140.36**
 failure to pay agreed salary above minimum wage **140.34**
 failure to pay minimum wage **140.34–5**
 failure to pay personal debt **140.27–9**
 misrepresentation using Bank stationery **381.64–5**
 misrepresentations relating to G-V visa application **140.30–3**
 privileges and immunities (Principle 3.3) and **140.26–7, 140.33**
 social security tax reports, negligence relating to **140.36**
 use of official Bank signature on private emails **487.78**
disciplinary measures (Staff Rule 8.01 [Staff Rule 3.0]), rescission of decision
 compensation as alternative **28.48**
 disciplinary actions and discretion acts distinguished **131.72–4**
 lifting of employment ban **105.55**
 OPE/INT investigation report **242.40, 242 Decision, 304.72, 304 Decision**
 reinstatement and restoration of employment benefits **131.10, 131.69, 158.45**
 removal of reprimand and warning from file **131.75**
 replacement with more appropriate measures **380.42–3, 380 Decision**
restitutio in integrum principle and **131.66–82**
 revival of right to impose proportionate disciplinary measures **158.45**
 severance payments, applicant’s obligation to repay **158.45**
 termination of appointment **142 Decision, 143 Decision, 158.44, 304.72, 304 Decision, 369.100, 369 Decision, 380.42–3, 380 Decision**
disciplinary proceedings (Staff Rule 8.01), procedure and scope (including allegations of procedural flaws/abuse of discretion) 131.29–61, 194.3–5, 194.10–13, 242.13–17, 242.36–9, 243.14–17, 244.44–54, 246.41–54, 304.55–71, 455.15–31, 476.42–7
 administrative leave (para. 5.05): *see* administrative leave (Staff Rule 6.06, para. 9) (including allegations of abuse of discretion), pending/during investigation
 administrative nature, relevance to due process requirement **197.57, 206.33, 207.32, 244.45, 300.29, 304.55, 340.80–1, 361.26, 389.120, 396.50, 476.43, 489.69**
 anonymity of allegations **401.31–5**
 applicable law
 improper choice of **427.41–4**
 Rules in force at time of investigation **396.47, 448.59–60**
 assistance during an investigation (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 4.10), *see also* legal assistance from independent adviser during disciplinary proceedings, rights under Staff Rule 8.01, para. 4.10

Bank guidelines

- Guide to the Staff Rule 8.01 Process* (2008) **389.112–13**
- Standards and Procedures for Inquiries and Investigations* (2001) (INT Standards) **304.55, 304.58, 304.63, 340.80, 352.28, 426.58**
- comparison of similar cases **380.38–40**
- complaint of alleged misconduct, need for **371.52**
- conduct of investigation, responsibility for (para. 5.03)
 - interpretation arrangements **305.60–2, 305.73**
 - investigation away from headquarters **207.31**
 - involvement of Ethics Officer in unrelated proceedings concerning the applicant **143.36**
- confidentiality of personnel information (Staff Rule 2.01) and **345.10, 345.13–16**
- criminal investigation model, relevance **272.25, 300.29, 389.128, 396.48, 396.50**
- decision on initiation of investigation **371.40–52, 426.58–67, 451.41**
- delay in completing investigation/length of proceedings **381.72–3, 387.41–4, 388.71–2, 389.152, 396.51–2, 426.103, 426.118, 426.123–4, 451.75–6, 451.97, 487.96–8**
 - complexity of case (Volcker Report) **487.84–7, 489.86**
 - HRVP's decision **487.87, 487.100–1, 487.103, 489.86–7**
 - “reasonably proportionate” (*L*) **353.31, 388.71, 396.52, 426.123–4, 451.49, 487.100**
- determination of measures/exercise of discretion as responsibility of HRSVP **455.15–18**
- discretionary nature of proceedings **145.8–9, 371.40–52**
 - Bank's right to make alternative arrangements **325.53–7**
 - decision not to proceed with investigation into allegations being considered elsewhere **271.40**
- due diligence requirement
 - fairness and impartiality (Principle 2.1) and fair treatment (Principle 9.1) **362.3–30**
 - HRVP's independent review of INT report **487.87**
 - IAD travel management audit **362.6–19**
 - OPE/INT **246.49–51, 362.20–30, 369.92–9, 369.103, 370.47–9**
- due process requirements (*Kwaka* summary) **487.83**
- ethical matters, limitation to/exclusion of management matters **211.32, 334.13–14, 338.13–14, 369.75, 426.61–3**
- evidence, evaluation and use of
 - credibility of preliminary inquiry evidence **430.99, 431.86, 450.112**
 - currency transactions **300.35**
 - delay between hearing witnesses against and for the applicant **369.85**
 - evidence not focused on factors bearing on exercise of discretion **455.16–17**
 - failure to consider corroborative evidence **201.23–4**
 - failure to review documents other than preliminary inquiry report **246.50**
 - failure to seek evidence **388.74–5**
 - failure to take account of exculpatory evidence **145.11, 340.72–3, 362.35, 378.48, 380.34, 388.75, 426.79, 426.86, 426.95–101, 426.106–11, 426.121, 426.132, 427.56–9**
 - good faith/best efforts, sufficiency **370.50**
 - harassment **201.21–5**
 - right to male interviewer **366.74**
 - sufficiency of evidence **105.41–53, 366.32–73**
 - timeliness **366.74, 369.85–6**
 - unsupported evidence **305.43, 305.67–8**
 - written declarations subsequent to conclusion of investigation report **352.32, 352.44**
- as fact-finding process **426.84, 426.119, 455.19–31**
- failure of applicant to provide satisfactory explanations **352.25–8**
- failure of OPE/INT to communicate with parties **246.50**
- failure of OPE/INT to investigate alleged disclosure of confidential information by former member

of Bank's staff 371.49–50

failure to carry out proper preliminary enquiry 343.15–18, 352.15–18

failure to find effective solution to informal complaint 206.27

failure to interview applicant 257.43, 257.75, 426.101

failure to investigate leaks to the press during investigation 369.96–8, 387.17, 389.142–50, 389.154–5, 397.13–14, 397.38–50

failure to protect dignity of applicant 389.138–9

Guide to the Investigative Process (2011) 486.209, 487.99

INT lobbying for imposition of particular disciplinary measure 38051–2

investigation report (para. 5.07)

- accuracy, line manager's right to assume/responsibility for (*Koudogbo*) 246.54, 340.76
- Bank's action in relation to as matter of discretion 206.35, 338.56
- Bank's wrongful use 366.9, 366.61–2
- burden/standard of proof, failure to meet 366.32–60
- conclusions, investigator's right to include 304.71
- correction of inaccuracies pointed out by applicant 352.31
- delay in presenting report to applicant 325.58, 325.67, 369.87, 427.62–3
- desirability of correspondence with alleged categories of misconduct 486.46
- inclusion of performance-related issues 430.89–101, 431.77–88, 450.91–114
- inclusion of potentially prejudicial statements not fully supported by evidence 352.24–8
- inclusion of staff member's comments 489.88
- inconsistencies and failure to distinguish between factual determinations, inferences and subjective opinions 366.34–6
- INT's failure to take account of staff member's comments 426.92–101
- obligation to address all allegations 206.34
- as part of staff member's record 384.54
- rescission for substantive and procedural irregularities 242.40
- right to electronic copy 448.73–5
- right to see comments on comments on draft Report/Final report 305.63–6, 305.73, 378.54, 380.47–50, 388.66–70
- right to see/comment on report 145.14–15, 207.33–5, 242.36–7, 244.48–53, 246.52, 305.58, 305.65–6, 305.73, 325.58, 378.53, 380.49–50, 396.51–9
 - administrative difficulties, relevance 396.57–9
 - Non Disclosure Agreement (NDA) 486.210–12
 - review in INT's office 486.210–12

investigation of serious cases of misconduct (para. 5.03), improper assignment to line manager 246.45–6

- failure to supervise 246.50
- inadequacy of resources as justification for OPE/INT's failure to undertake 246.46
- instruction to continue preliminary inquiry despite seriousness of matter 246.44

investigators' unsatisfactory performance/liability to PIP 369.95

legal basis for decision 131.66–7, 143.27, 242.33–5, 300.30

loss of financial disclosure form 389.141

membership of investigation team in absence of alleged bias 305.55

minor/*de minimus* infringements 341.92, 389.153

Notice of Alleged Misconduct 352.9, 393.46

- change of Staff Rule relating to (March 2009) 48.59–60
- delay in providing copy 242.36–7
 - telephoned extracts, sufficiency 242.37
- initiation of formal investigation on insufficient basis 362.15, 362.23–9, 393.46, 489.72
- supplementary notice, need for 451.42–7, 451.97

notice of investigation **389.110–13**
notification of
 decision of “no violation of Principles of Employment or Staff Rules”, arbitrariness **355.13, 355.57**
 decision/reasons to person concerned **131.33, 131.61, 145.13, 207.35, 246.53**
 decision not to pursue **188.19**
 in writing **145.13**
 factors for purpose of deciding appropriate measure and allegations distinguished **448.81**
 initiation of preliminary inquiry **304.65, 340.80–1**
 investigation procedures and standards **396.49**
 possible termination, relevance **143.32–4**
 precise charges and allegations **131.30, 131.33–60, 242.36, 246.44, 272.23–5, 300.29–30, 300.33–4, 304.19, 304.55, 305.56, 370.44–9, 389.121–4, 396.48, 451.42–7**
 reference to applicable standards/Rules allegedly breached, sufficiency **448.76–80**
 in writing **207.35, 243.23, 243.26, 300.30, 300.38, 305.56**
 specific Staff Rule on which decision based **218.31, 246.53**
obligation to cooperate (para. 4.06) **389.97–113**
obligation to support staff undergoing investigation **237.22**
observation or report of conduct possibly giving rise to (para. 5.01) **131.40**
omissions not amounting to abuse of process **381.72–4**
opportunity to respond to allegations/present case **131.48–60, 142.11–15, 142.31, 142.40–2, 197.59, 207.32, 243.23, 246.50, 370.44–9, 378.48–51, 380.45–6, 396.48–9, 448.54–60, 455.54–5**
 “all information and evidence”, right to (Guide to Investigative Process (2011)) **486.209**
 EBC decision not to undertake fact-finding exercise **455.20–31**
 electronic copy of INT report, relevance **448.73–5**
 hostile manner of investigating team **305.57, 380.44**
 joinder of charges and **369.94**
 written response to unsubstantiated allegations **246.44**
prejudice/bias towards applicant **366.63–7**
prejudicial intervention by VPHR **242.38, 304.71, 353.2–43**
refusal to allow independent legal adviser to attend interviews **389.132–6**
refusal to allow independent legal assistance **389.130**
responsibility for compliance **246.54**
right of accused and accuser to due process **194.12, 201.20, 206.23, 206.28–32, 325.42–67, 396.60**
right to comment on sanction **378.52–5**
right to consult attorney or other third party assistance **389.111**
spousal support claim procedures **325.52–67**
spousal support payments, OPE/INT responsibilities relating to **325.10, 325.21, 325.42–67**
subpoena powers **371.37, 389.152**
time limits for imposition of disciplinary measures **451.11, 451.76**
transcripts of interviews and evidence **197.60, 257.75, 369.88–91, 378.50–1, 389.140, 426.126**
 adequacy of summaries **369.91**
 change of practice relating to **378.51, 389.140, 426.126**
Volcker recommendations for changes (2007): *see* Volcker Report (2007)
willful misrepresentation of facts to Ethics Officer/Bank’s disregard of counter-evidence **426.91–103, 426.114–18**
withhold of accrued leave pending outcome of investigation, absence of provision for in Staff Rules/desirability of amendment **353.32–40**
witnesses, investigators’ improper pressure on **369.95**
witnesses, rights of person under investigation in respect of **197.59, 197.62, 206.28–33, 207.32–3,**

244.44, 244.46–7, 300.29, 300.32, 305.58, 396.50, 396.54–6, 426.125–6
 limitation of witnesses to persons still in the Bank’s employment 145.12
**disciplinary proceedings (Staff Rule 8.01), scope of Tribunal review of (including
Carew/Mustafa/Cissé/Koudogbo formulation)** 14.47, 28.40–8, 67.32, 105.53, 142.32, 143.24,
 153.29, 207.17, 207.30–5, 242.26, 242.36–9, 243.18, 243.23–7, 244.12, 244.44–54, 246.18,
 246.41–56, 300.20, 304.23, 305.16–17, 369.53, 378.28, 379.20, 380.18, 381.53, 387.18, 388.45,
 395.15, 448.31–2, 451.20, 486.39, 487.38, 489.22, 492.21
Note: It was established in *Carew* (Decision No. 142, [1995], para. 32) and confirmed *inter alia* in
Mustafa (Decision No. 207 [1999], para. 17) that when the Tribunal reviews disciplinary
 cases, it “examines (i) the existence of the facts, (ii) whether they legally amount to
 misconduct, (iii) whether the sanction imposed is provided for in the law of the Bank, (iv)
 whether the sanction is not significantly disproportionate to the offence, and (v) whether the
 requirements of due process were observed.” The index indicates under the present heading
 the points in the decisions where each of these elements is addressed. For more detailed
 indexing of the substance, reference should be made to separate headings such as “disciplinary
 proceedings/due process (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 5 [para. 4]) (including allegations relating to
 breach)
 administrative decisions for purposes of
 interim decisions 340.2, 340.23, 356.27
 Notice of Alleged Misconduct 356.25, 393.46
 referral to OPE/INT 356.24
 balance/standard of proof 243.21, 486.40, 487.39
 breach of confidentiality claim 379.21–2
 classification as misconduct 142.9, 143.24–30, 207.27, 244.60–70, 244.73, 244.74, 304.23–40,
 305.16–69, 352.33–7, 366.73, 369.81, 378.38–40, 380.18–43, 381.54–65, 386.25–30,
 387.20–30, 388.55–70, 389.–113, 396.27–37, 448.35–44, 451.63–74
 due process compliance 486.208–15
 inaction/omission 368.19
 “operation in good faith without infringing individual rights” test (*G*) 340.73, 345.73, 370.50,
 426.56–7, 427.40
 existence of the facts 142.32–9, 153.30–2, 157.39–42, 207.18–27, 242.27–32, 243.18–22,
 244.13–43, 244.55–9, 244.73, 246.19–40, 304.25, 305.16–69, 352.33–7, 366.32–72,
 369.56–80, 378.28–40, 380.18–55, 381.54–65, 386.20–4, 387.20–30, 388.45–54, 396.16–26,
 451.50–62, 476.31, 487.40–86, 489.23–35, 492.22–6
see also misconduct, evidence of, burden/standard of proof (“substantial evidence”/“reasonably
 sufficient” requirement) (*Arefeen/Dambita*)
 fairness and impartiality of proceedings (Principles 2.1 and 9.1) 206.23, 355.33, 426.52–4
 decision not to investigate allegations of misconduct 194.10–14
 micromanagement of INT activity, exclusion 340.73, 345.11, 352.20, 356.25, 366.74, 370.50,
 380.44, 384.45, 389.152, 396.52, 427.39, 433.16, 436.22, 447.96
 OPE/INT investigation, in absence of finding of misconduct 194.13, 304.57–8, 304.61, 304.65,
 340.2
 proportionality of sanction/accordance with the law of the Bank (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 4.01)
 14.47–8, 28.41, 105.53, 140.41–2, 142.43–6, 143.37–42, 158.37–44, 207.28–9, 242.33–5,
 300.37, 304.49–54, 305.16, 305.70–5, 352.38–42, 369.54–5, 369.82, 373.49–51, 378.41–6,
 381.66–71, 387.31–40, 389.114–19, 396.38–45, 448.45–53, 455.32–56, 476.31–5, 476.47,
 486.200–7, 487.67–82, 492.27–59
 review of finding of misconduct by national law enforcement authority 373.48
 substance of case against applicant 131.62–4
disclosure of confidential Bank documents/leaks to the press
 Bank Board minutes 448.35–44

disciplinary measures
 proportionality 448.48–53
 termination of employment as possibility (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 3.03) 448.47
Disclosure of Information Policy (2002) 448.40
failure to investigate leaks 369.96–8, 389.142–50, 389.154–5, 397.13–14, 397.38–50, 448.52,
 451.90–6
investigation procedure in absence of indication as to source 392.3–8, 393.5–9
“non-public information” (Staff Rule 3.01, para. 5.01) 448.38
as [serious] misconduct 448.35–44, 448.82
whistleblower protection 448.41–4
 see also whistleblowing

disclosure of documents, request for

agreement to 132.1, 197.41, 222.1, 223.1, 224.1, 226.1, 254.1, 362.2
Bank’s compliance with 38.31, 39.2, 90.1, 91.1, 157.28, 196.1, 272.9
 partial in absence of some of requested documents 326.1, 326.46, 326.54
IAD Investigative Panel Report (summary) 100.66, 101.1, 101.14, 101.55
job audit findings 69.31
letter of verification (para. 5.05) 428.34
partial acceptance 12.intro., 198.3
pleadings in proceedings relating to third parties 301.7
referrals to outside authorities 97.37
transcripts of interviews at special investigation 197.41

disclosure of documents, request for, refusal 16.2, 32.1, 112.1, 144.1, 217.1, 219.1, 220.1, 221.1,
 222.1, 223.1, 224.1, 257.1, 260.1, 277.1, 311.1, 316.1, 341.1, 369.6

after *in camera* inspection 362.2, 382.15
arbitrariness (reasonableness test) 382.22–8
correspondence between Bank and applicant’s estranged wife’s attorney, refusal 382.1–38
 Bank’s practice of informing both parties of the arguments made by the other 382.29–32
personnel records 10.31, 23.58
relevance to the proceedings 23.58, 26.1, 157.28
substantiation of allegations (*Malekpour*) 382.33–8
time and resources considerations 443.24
transcripts of interviews with non-party witnesses 197.41

disclosure of financial and business interests (Staff Rule 3.01, para. 8.01 [para. 5.01]) 389.43,
 389.59–61, 396.27, 396.35, 451.65–74

see also financial interests in Bank Group transactions, prohibition (Staff Rule 3.01, para. 7.01)
Bank Code of Professional Ethics 389.44, 389.62–3, 451.66
change in rule (2004) 451.65
financial statements of senior staff (Staff Rule 3.01, para. 8.02) 389.43, 389.62–3
ignorance of law, relevance 246.31, 389.55
malice or guilty purpose, relevance (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 3.01 [para. 4.02]) 451.74

**disclosure of personal information to outside authorities (Staff Rule 2.01, para. 5.01) (including
 allegations of breach of due process)** 268.12–21, 272.5–25

see also confidentiality of personnel information (Staff Rule 2.01)
authorization of staff member, documents not requiring
 employment data (para. 5.01(a)) 272.10
 information for legal proceedings or law enforcement efforts 272.11
 salary and benefits information in response to final court order/judicial or civil authority request
 443.54–61
 travel documents 272.11
Bank guidelines (2002)

- as incorrect interpretation of Tribunal's decision in *C* 397.27–34
- text (extracts) 397.25
- direction to Bank to provide list and description of released documents 268.22, 272.8
- failure to substantiate 179.13, 371.35–9, 396.45
- information falling outside the type of personnel information envisaged by rule
 - conditions limiting access to information, relevance 272.15
 - documents subject to attorney-client privilege or whose disclosure would prejudice an investigation 272.17
 - World Bank Policy on Disclosure of Information (1994/2002) 272.13
 - 2002 changes to 272.13, 272.16
- MOU between Bank and Staff Member, clause permitting use of MOU as evidence in case of alleged breach 425.47–8
- notification of any such release, staff member's right
 - criminal investigations 272.24–5, 397.22–36
 - as decision for purposes of internal remedies time limits 268.14–20
 - determination jointly with merits 268.17
 - exceptions to requirement 268.18, 268.21, 397.23, 447.95
 - notification of both fact of referral and contents, need for 268.20, 272.7–8, 272.20–5
 - notification as soon as reasonably possible 272.10, 451.82–9, 451.97
 - order to produce documents necessary for preparation of applicant's defense 272.33, 272
 - Decision
 - outside authority's right to request delay in notification 397.26–36
 - referrals to US authorities 397.2–12, 397.15–16, 397.22–37, 447.90–6, 451.82–9
 - time limit for exercise of right, whether 268.14–21
 - use of information by recipient authority, effect on 268.21
 - weapons check 447.90–6
 - within a reasonable time 397.16
- operational records of Bank distinguished 272.12
- partial disclosure, effect 272.25
- prejudice to applicant's preparation of his defense, relevance 272.11, 272.15, 272.17, 272.19–25, 272.32
 - compensation for 272.32, 272.33
- premature referral 451.81, 451.97
- procedural requirements
 - formal documented inquiry 447.96
 - formal record of disclosure 447.90–6
- references: *see* references on a personal basis (Staff Rule 2.01, para. 5.06)
- responsibility of Bank for unauthorized disclosure by staff members 384.47–50
- Spousal and Child Support Policy (1998) 443.57–60
 - MOU circumvention of legitimate objective, exclusion 443.60
- strict compliance with Rule, need for 390.113–15, 397.33–6
- Tribunal order to provide applicant with copies of all referrals 397.37
- discretion, limitation of Tribunal review of decisions involving to determination whether decision an abuse (*Saberi*)** 56.36, 74.44, 85.56, 97.51–2, 135.37, 150.40–57, 156.10, 156.21, 193.9–14, 206.35, 209.22, 225.27, 225.32, 225.36–56, 226.21, 227.24–7, 245.40, 247.14–31, 248.28, 252.12–41, 253.8–28, 255.34, 255.40, 257.61, 260.26, 261.29, 266.29, 271.79, 273.27, 274.14, 292.48, 292.65–9, 297.25, 297.28, 304.23, 306.21, 310.27, 331.47, 360.17, 441.45, 493.34
- see also* Appeals Committee (admissibility, competence and procedure) (Staff Rule 9.03), competence, compliance with due process/exercise of discretion requirements; disciplinary proceedings (Staff Rule 8.01), scope of Tribunal review of (including *Carew/Mustafa/Cissé/Koudogbo* formulation); Workers' Compensation Administrative

Review Panel Staff (Rule 6.11, para. 12), appeal to Tribunal (para. 12.04)/scope of review (*Chhabra (No. 2)* formulation)

Note: The leading case is Decision No. 5 (*Saberi*). “Abuse of discretion” has been regularly elaborated in the jurisprudence to include decisions which are arbitrary, discriminatory, improperly motivated or carried out in violation of a fair and reasonable procedure.

access to Bank premises, restrictions on **318.35, 370.117.37, 447.116–22**

administrative leave **305.54, 340.67, 392.24–32, 393.27–36, 401.29**

conversion of fixed-term appointment to regular appointment **16.39, 103.29, 209.22**

disciplinary cases distinguished **28.38–9, 131.72–4, 142.32, 143.24, 153.29, 340.67, 352.20**

evidence supporting applicant’s claim **206.35–6, 248.49**

flexible application of “six-month return” rule (PM Circular No. Pers. 2/82) **14.54**

general enquiry into Bank practice, exclusion **172.9, 271.48**

job grading **56.35–7, 57.20–35, 58.38–48, 60.22.4, 70.25, 70.28, 71.26, 71.29, 71.34, 92.29, 135.28**

mandatory enrollment in Medicare **473.34–5**

mandatory retirement age **348.26–7, 391.27–9**

“manifestly unreasonable” test **81.18, 85.72, 90.30–2, 96.31–3, 97.52, 100.30, 101.44–5, 139.50, 152.19, 211.68, 338.21, 351.39, 351.42, 390.64–5, 390.101, 434.35–7, 439.35–42, 444.14–45**

mobility premium **446.29**

monitoring of compliance with Bank policy **390.113–15**

performance evaluation including termination for unsatisfactory performance (*Suntharalingam/Broemser/Desthuis-Francis*) **5.24–5, 6.27, 10.50, 14.38, 14.47, 16.39–40, 17.43, 23.40, 24.25, 27.31, 28.37, 30.23–4, 72.43–4, 85.67, 88.43, 96.43–4, 97.54, 100.30, 101.31, 103.29, 117.26, 127.38, 131.72–3, 147.36, 150.41, 152.10, 152.19, 152.27, 164.13, 181.7, 188.9, 197.83, 198.26, 199.11, 206.35, 217.57, 297.36, 315.19, 322.15–29, 338.26, 341.39, 351.39, 390.53, 390.101, 430.77, 431.77, 437.19, 439.22, 439.32–4, 450.93, 480.18, 480.22**

PIP placement **402.109, 402.128, 408.42–9, 410.42–8**

policy-making functions **38.123, 391.27, 488.52–3, 491.62**

probation procedures **7.26, 10.30, 10.37, 10.60, 31.22, 157.29–30, 157.35–6, 157.44, 293.38–9, 327.31, 351.58, 461.31, 470.29**

promotion of staff (*Apergis*) **83.57, 131.78–9, 145.19–20, 148.40**

reassignment **23.40–3, 28.39, 70.24–7, 90.40–1, 254.29, 430.69, 430.73–5, 431.64–6, 434.58–61, 450.86, 457.45**

redundancy decision **166.20, 169.14–15, 178.21–3, 185.11, 191.9, 191.18, 203.6, 226.26, 241.31, 273.24–7, 292.48, 292.65, 292.67, 297.25, 302.23, 331.47, 347.31, 357.33, 357.36, 357.47, 367.61, 372.32, 464.36, 482.43–52, 493.36**

focus on genuine business reason (*Prakas*) **363.22**

review of process leading to decision **464.49–52**

renewal or extension of contract

rescission of decision, exclusion **176.30**

review of actions leading to decision not to renew **176.12–30, 482.42**

revocation of access to Bank’s email system for misuse **429.13–33**

RIMP decisions **473.43**

salary review decisions **38.69, 38.93–112, 38.123–4, 38.126, 97.58, 338.63, 354.15, 360.17–52, 458.31, 463.29–30**

selection/appointment of staff (*Riddell*) **21.26–7, 81.15, 88.21, 100.30, 100.37, 101.38, 103.29, 117.26, 169.18, 255.23, 257.61, 261.45, 326.73–4, 339.49, 343.39–41, 344.67, 401.41, 409.47, 419.49, 435.30, 435.34, 444.15, 444.20, 444.31, 444.41, 452.30, 459.36, 475.28, 475.30, 475.34, 475.50, 485.38**

special appellate jurisdiction: *see* Pension Benefits Administration Committee (PBAC) decisions, appeal to Tribunal

spousal support claims, handling 325.46–7, 484.57
SRP decisions distinguished 153.29, 306.17, 324.31–3, 383.31
transparency, Tribunal’s duty to require 85.72, 248.28, 273.27, 297.25, 302.23, 331.47, 372.33, 488.74

work programme 377.73–4, 390.56, 390.100, 432.30, 439.32

“discrimination” (*Crevier*) 205.25, 212.8, 301.17, 344.43, 367.76, 391.32, 400.47, 446.44, 475.44, 488.54, 488.55, 491.65

see also age discrimination, allegations of; Dewey Ballantine investigation into treatment of African staff (1996-7) (DB); differential treatment (Principle 2.1), grounds for; fairness, impartiality, non-discrimination and proper process (Principles 2.1 and 9.1); gender discrimination; Lynk Report into treatment of African staff (1999); medical condition; nationality, discrimination based on; racial/ethnic discrimination

dissenting opinions

Appeals Committee 404.48

Tribunal 441 (dissenting opinion).1–22

divorce, pension rights of spouse, effect on: *see* spousal support claims; surviving spouse benefit (SRP Art. 4, s 4.1(a)(ii))

double dipping: *see* Staff Retirement Plan (SRP)

due process: *Reference should be made to individual headings such as probation (PMS 4.02/Staff Rule 4.02), confirmation/non-confirmation of appointment (including allegations of unfairness/breach of due process in relation to); improper motivation (including bad faith/mala fides), allegations of; undue haste*

duress: *see* mutually agreed separation (MAS)/settlement agreement (MOU) including waiver of right of appeal, duress and (*Mr. Y/Kirk/Gamble*)

early retirement: *see* Rule of 50

educational qualifications as alleged basis for discrimination 260.37–8

effective remedy, need for: *see* exceptional circumstances justifying non-compliance with exhaustion of internal remedies requirement (Statute II(2))

email accounts, Bank’s right of access to (Information Security Policy (AMS 6.20A)) (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion) 304.57–60, 340.82, 390.106–15, 392.7, 392.35–43, 393.6, 393.48–54, 448.61–72, 451.33–7

approval requirements 392.41–3, 393.53–4, 448.62, 448.66–70, 451.33–7

obligation to provide staff member with proof of compliance 448.71–2

balance of interests of Bank and staff members 304.58, 448.64, 448.70

failure to substantiate 447.85–9

genuine business justification 304.58, 390.109–11, 392.36–9, 393.49–52

privacy rights and (para. 9) 390.110–13, 448.63–5, 448.70

strict compliance with, need for 390.113–15

email communication (AMS 12.10)

acceptability as method for communication intra-Bank information 399.18–29, 478.25

access to Bank system as privilege (AMS 12.10, para. 28) 429.20

alleged interference with 443.45–50

applicant’s contributory negligence 443.45–50

Bank’s obligation to protect from destruction in case of disciplinary proceedings 486.215

Bank’s policy

acceptance by staff member 429.16, 429.24

retention (two-year backup) 486.213–15

text (extracts) 429.16

challenge to authenticity 486.41–3

confidential attachments (AMS 12.10, para. 16) 429.19

date of receipt 399.20–8
 hostile working environment/harassment and 429.22
 mass mailings to air personal grievances as misuse of system 429.3–33
 Warnings to applicant 429.17, 429.27–8
 messages maligning staff member, Bank’s handling of 411.54–8, 412.55–9, 415.45–9, 419.50–4,
 422.49–52
 private communications, use for 443.45, 443.49–50, 487.45
 absolute prohibition 487.77
 inclusion of official signature 487.78
 quarantine of messages, Bank’s right to (AMS 12.10, para. 3) 429.32
 revocation of access to Bank’s email system because of misuse 429.3–33
 abuse of discretion, whether 429.13–33
 authorization 429.30
 detrimental effect on ability to carry out core Bank business 429.31
 disciplinary action, whether pre-requirement 429.29
 freedom of expression and 429.24
 violation as misconduct with possibility of disciplinary measures 487.46
employment outside the Bank Group (Staff Rule 3.02), restrictions on (Staff Rule 3.02, para. 3.01)
 civic responsibility as justification, classification as 478.40
 multiple conflicts 489.37–41
 obligation not to make use of Bank Group resources (Staff Rule 3.02, para. 3.03) 487.44
 obligation to seek advice from EBC 478.39
enforcement of decisions of national courts: see national courts
Enhanced Separation Package (Staff Rule 5.09, para. 7.06) (Package B)
 see also mutually agreed separation (MAS)/settlement agreement (MOU) including waiver of right
 of appeal; Standard Separation Package (Staff Rule 5.09, para. 9.03)
 assignment to TAP (Temporary Assignment Program) and 82.31–41
 compensation going beyond provisions of, desirability 90.6
 consensual nature 92.9, 92.33, 94.51
 erroneous decision of Bank leading to acceptance of package, effect 91.31–2
 non-selection after staff-at-large selection rounds and 90.32
 rejection of valid job offer, effect 92.9, 92.28–32, 92.35, 94.40–5, 94.49–50
 restitution of benefits following reemployment 84.46–7
 unsuccessful application for Standard Separation Package, effect 83.62
 waiver of right of appeal and (para. 12.01), validity/change of rule (*Harrison*) 53.26–30, 54.26–30,
 134.21
 notification to staff members 134.21, 134.25
Environment Sector Board, time limits for appeal against decision of 270.17–18
equity: see fairness
error in disseminated information, Bank’s responsibility for, detrimental reliance on 271.163
estoppel 187.14, 275.37, 349.45–50
 see also assurances, evidence of; finality of Tribunal decision/*res judicata* (Statute XI);
 legal/legitimate expectation
 detrimental reliance, need for 271.150, 271.163
 failure to honor assurances and 209.20–2
Ethics and Business Conduct, Office of (EBC)
 see also disciplinary proceedings (Staff Rule 8.01), procedure and scope (including allegations of
 procedural flaws/abuse of discretion); misconduct, classification as (Staff Rule 8.01, para.
 3.01 [para. 2.01]/Principle 3)
 advice on ethical matters, responsibility for 325.10
 spousal support claims 325.44–5, 325.47–8

initial review of allegation of misconduct (Staff Rule 3.00, para. 8.01) **457.78–82**
review by PRS, exclusion **457.80**
Tribunal findings **457.82**

INT role distinguished **325.10, 325.47–8**
communication of distinction to staff, inadequacy **325.48, 325.65–6**

ethnic discrimination: *see* racial/ethnic discrimination

evidence

see also affidavit evidence; witnesses

admissibility

additional evidence **198.1**

circumstantial evidence **369.60, 378.38–9**

evidence before Appeals Committee **315.22223, 444.22**

evidence not available to Ethics Office investigation **242.30**

evidence not considered by Appeals Committee **211.52–4**

evidence received illegally **486.41–3**

fruit of the poisonous tree doctrine **486.41, 486.43**

media reports **242.29**

telephone exchange during proceedings **239.39–40**

authenticity, challenge to **191.26, 203.11, 486.41–2**

corroboration, need for **201.4–10, 201.15, 201.23–4, 201.29–31, 369.69, 369.93**

submission after completion of investigation **201.23–4**

credibility **244.31–43**

see also preliminary inquiry (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 5.02 [para. 4.02]) (including allegations relating to due process), establishment of sufficient evidence to warrant further proceedings as key function

behavior undermining claims to **244.32–4, 271.74–107, 317.9–55**

claims of sexual harassment **197.27, 197.38, 197.74–6, 206.34, 207.22, 207.25, 207.27, 244.31–43**

confirmatory third party evidence **207.24**

consistency/inconsistency **202.22, 207.23–4, 246.20, 296.10, 300.5–9, 300.22–5, 305.32**

contradictory evidence **167.16, 173.20–1, 203.9–10**

delay in making complaint **206.34, 207.25, 244.35–6**

failure to correct misleading statement **239.51**

neutrality of witness **255.28**

procedural flaws in preparation of Ethics Office report and **244.43**

Tribunal's inability to determine **246.22, 271.8, 271.69, 402.37**

direction to Bank to provide documentation relating to redundancy decision **464.49**

direction to Bank to provide list and description of documents released to outside authorities under Staff Rule 2.01

Bank's failure fully to comply **272.8**

transmission of list and description to applicant by Executive Secretary of Tribunal **272.8**

evidence of designated Bank representative

conclusiveness **411.45, 412.47, 413.53, 416.50, 417.49, 419.46, 422.47**

'greater weight' **408.33, 415.52, 417.54**

Note: Decisions 408-423 have an identical para. 33

failure to link to applicant **244.57**

failure to submit

adverse inferences **332.59, 430.99, 431.86, 450.112**

alleged conspiracy **244.71–2, 339.41–2**

alleged improper motive **169.17, 226.18–20, 260.52, 261.30–3, 310.31**

as ground for nullification of decision **350.27**

harassment/discrimination 227.29–34

omission of key material 271.70–3

transcripts: *see* transcripts

**exceptional circumstances justifying failure to meet time limits for submission of application
(Statute II(2))**

burden/standard of proof 136.30, 137.31, 236.27, 320.22, 395.30, 478.46

case-by-case approach 151.28, 195.7, 394.16, 427.25, 478.46

conduct of applicant as counter-indication/evidence of intention to comply with time limits

delay in returning application form 174.10

delay in seeking clarification and 295.25–6

failure to make appropriate arrangements to avoid non-compliance and 81.13

negligence (*Agerschou*) 114.25–8, 114.45–8, 134.34–5, 141.30, 174.10–11, 195.10, 279.19,
295.29, 296.16, 318.27–30, 394.23–32, 427.27–8

extent of the delay, relevance 427.25–6

possibilities considered by Tribunal

absence of provision in Member State national laws which would offer protection 298.11–12

advice to applicant to await outcome of INT investigation 394.25–32

ambiguity of available information 167.17–18

applicant's absence abroad 81.13

applicant's concern about loss of position/prejudice to alternative employment 163.13, 269.10

applicant's doubts as to Tribunal's jurisdiction 26.32–3

applicant's ignorance of the law 134.6, 134.21–6, 230.9, 236.21, 236.28, 237.21, 238.22–3,
240.27, 251.52, 279.16–18, 280.14–18, 307.8, 346.22, 395.30

applicant's reasonable ignorance relevant facts 354.23–31

application for transfer to other employment as alternative to appeal 279.19

attorney's absence on holiday 174.10

attorney's inability to act for applicant 16.33

Bank's delay in meeting OPE/PPR obligations 167.19–20, 346.19–21

Bank's failure to respond to applicant's claim 251.54

clerical error, alleged presumption of 295.22–4

communication difficulties 174.5–6, 174.9, 405.28–30

lack of [electronic] access 237.19–20, 280.16

difficulty in retrieving old documents 359.41, 359.49

ex gratia action by Bank outside limitation period 298.15

exceptional circumstances pertaining to claims dismissed as unsustainable 456.14–17

financial difficulties (including inability to employ counsel) 3.12, 151.23, 151.29

improper behaviour by Bank 298.11–12

inability of local lawyers to assist 280.20

intervention in latter part of time limit, relevance 195.8

language difficulties

inability to read Staff Rules in English 280.12

English as sole language of Staff Rules 280.12–13

medical condition 134.30–2, 151.30, 182.9–10, 195.2–10, 236.17–18, 236.26–7, 238.24,
279.12, 333.27–30, 478.46

3-day absence to accompany spouse on visit to doctor 279.13

of relative 296.17

mutual settlement negotiations 478.46

natural justice, relevance 275.37

procedural error in challenge to implementation of Tribunal decision 267.16

redundancy notice 320.23

relevance in absence of application 69.32

relevant factors

Bank's agreement to late filing 16.33

shortness of delay 16.33

reliable contemporary proof, need for 279.15

report on termination for misconduct 237.16–18

staff member's obligation to protect own interests 8.19, 251.52, 270.22, 279.16–18, 280.14–18, 307.8, 318.27

training during preparation of appeal 279.14

exceptional circumstances justifying non-compliance with exhaustion of internal remedies requirement (Statute II(2)), possibilities considered by Tribunal

absence of effective remedy 229.26, 232.14–15, 232.22–5

illness 139.46, 426.28–36

mal-functioning of internal processes 51.30–4, 52.27

possible limitations on scope of Review Panel jurisdiction 425.28–36

Executive Directors

pension benefits, changes to 212.16–17

powers, amendment of SRP 212.16–17

exhaustion of internal remedies (Statute II(2)(i))

see also administrative review (Staff Rule 9.01); admissibility (Tribunal); direct application by agreement of the parties (Statute II(2)(i)); exceptional circumstances justifying failure to meet time limits for submission of application (Statute II(2)); exceptional circumstances justifying non-compliance with exhaustion of internal remedies requirement (Statute II(2)); mediation (Staff Rule 9.01); time limits

administrative review, need to seek 129.18–23, 239.32, 261.21–3, 262.19, 263.9, 264.9, 295.15, 298.7

evidence of request in respect of decision under challenge 139.48, 211.47–51, 213.19–22

form of request, relevance 213.22

where process would have been meaningless 229.26

advice, availability 214.31, 215.40

“all other remedies available within the Bank Group”, formal remedies, limitation to 279.20, 280.19, 295.27, 333.34, 335.36

appeal against Appeals Committee decision 75.20–5

appeal to Appeals Committee

decision on claim directly related to previous claim 405.23–30

decision, need for 320.24, 328.36, 346.22

discussion before Appeals Committee, sufficiency in absence of specific recommendation 334.30–5

interrelated claims 146.47, 335.42

issues covered 334.24–41, 335.37–44

issues included in statement of claim but not considered by Appeals Committee 335.41

need for 298.7, 320.20, 326.76, 328.37, 329.11, 332.61, 344.35, 344.45, 346.12, 374.17, 374.21–7, 374.30, 394.15

applicant's acceptance of

adverse decision 211.45–51

outcome of administrative review and mediation 276.26, 276.31–41

Bank's failure to challenge PBAC jurisdiction, relevance 214.17–18, 214.24

Bank's failure to provide essential information and 208.21

benefits claims procedure 258.14, 258.27–30, 262.14–16, 263.9–11, 264.9–11

complaint against implementation of Tribunal decision and 132.45, 138.25, 229.26, 267.6–16, 469.8, 469.37–42

effective remedy, need for 229.26, 232.14–15, 232.22–5

elements in investigation, need to challenge separately **304.66–7**
 failure to challenge decision
 alleged renegeing on promise **275.30**
 Job Grading Program decision **82.42**
 motivation, relevance **172.6**
 new decision **172.5**
 non-renewal of fixed-term contract **198.35–40**
 notification of non-renewal of contract **275.25–9**
 performance evaluation **97.53, 117.29, 185.15–16**
 placement on administrative leave **198.32–4**
 reassignment to a position outside the department **198.32–4**
 redundancy decision **97.45–7**
 new complaint **175.26, 270.19, 308.12–14, Order 2003-1, 332.9, 332.11, 332.21–2, 478.42–4**
 Orders dismissing application for failure to meet requirement **Order 2002-2, Order 2002-12**
 PRS proceedings
 in absence of PRS competence to deal with request **457.40–1, 457.80–2**
 review of termination of employment, right to take matter directly to Tribunal (Staff Rule 9.03, para. 6.03) **494.40–2**
 purpose
 as aid to prompt handling of cases by Tribunal **51.30, 75.22, 89.32, 151.26, 261.19, 267.15, 494.30**
 as opportunity for implementation of Appeal Committee’s recommendations **261.19**
 as opportunity for voluntary redress **51.30, 75.22, 89.32, 261.19, 276.34, 323.27, 334.23, 425.35, 440.21, 457.39, 479.35, 494.31**
 retaliation allegations, desirability of EBC review **494.42**
 review of termination of employment (Staff Rule 9.03, para. 6.03) **494.40–2**
 Staff Rule 5.09 (implementation of 1987 reorganization of Bank) and **51.31–5, 52.26–7**
 strict compliance, importance **51.30, 75.22, 89.32, 151.26, 425.35, 440.21, 478.44, 494.30–1**
 time limits, compliance with as essential element **75.23–5, 79.16–17, 89.32–3, 95.26–8, 134.23–36, 136.27, 137.30, 141.26–8, 144.44–7, 146.35–6, 172.2, 236.21, 240.17–28, 249.10–24, 250.2–18, 255.45, 258.27–30, 259.14, 261.21–3, 261.26, 262.12, 263.11, 264.11, 275.24–33, 276.34, 279.7–11, 280.7–11, 295.13–33, 320.13–24, 322.7, 323.26–7, 329.11, 329.19, 333.25, 335.34, 335.43, 346.12, 394.15, 395.27–8, 428.43, 440.20–6, 443.40–4**
 waiver of requirement **15.21, 118.20, 119.27, 120.27, 121.27, 122.26, 123.28, 124.26, 125.26, 126.26, 141.31, 309.14**
 agreement to direct submission to Tribunal as **3.18, 469.42**
 challenge to validity in absence of agreement to **51.36, 52.27**
 failure to raise matter before Appeals Committee as **139.48**
 refusal of request for **3.20**
 time limits/effective date of **426.46–7**
 Tribunal’s discretion **426.48**
expatriate benefits (Staff Rule 6.17 [6.13 and 6.14]), eligibility criteria
 see also home leave; mobility premium (Staff Rule 21), Bank/IMF couples (para. 3.05)
 Note: In 1998 “home country travel” (Staff Rule 6.13) and “education benefits” (Staff Rule 6.14) were replaced with the Mobility Premium.
 change to US citizenship, effect **450.118**
 changes (1985) **93.7, 118.6, 118.29, 119.6, 119.28, 120.5, 120.28, 121.5, 121.28, 122.5, 122.28, 123.6, 123.29, 124.5, 124.27, 125.5, 125.27, 126.5, 126.28**
 changes (1998) **446.5**
 continuation in post (Staff Rule 6.17, para. 2.01) **472.35–7**
 as general rule **118.29–31, 119.28–30, 120.30, 121.30, 122.28–30, 123.29–31, 124.27–39,**

125.27–9, 126.27–9

object and purpose of change of citizenship rule 93.39

relinquishment of US citizenship, effect 93.7–13, 93.32–41

staff request for change to 118.7–9, 119.7–9, 120.6–9

text 93.33

expert witness 239.33

external service (Staff Rule 5.02) (including allegations relating to due process)

applicant's failure to inform Bank of place she had secured 404.84–5

Bank's obligation to assist in arranging 404.46–9

definition/procedure 404.52

early recall

Bank's right to make salary deductions for replacement of non-recoverable Bank equipment

installed in residential accommodation 457.76–7

obligation to repay rental advance/loan 457.73–5

improper motivation/bad faith of line manager

failure to place at requested institution 404.78–9

HR manager 404.52–73

termination of negotiations 404.80–3

terms of reference/CV, HRSVP's handling of 404.74–7

letter of agreement for external service 384.44–5

ambiguity of terms 384.34–42

dependence on third parties for implementation 384.36–7, 384.41–2

option to extend by "mutual agreement" 384.44–5

reentry, right to/assurance of 168.28, 368.34–46, 384.44–5

special leave distinguished 222.15–16, 223.15–16, 224.15–16

fact-finding investigation: *see* Jennings Report into facts relating to Conthe case (Decision No. 271)

fairness, impartiality, non-discrimination and proper process (Principles 2.1 and 9.1) 74.48, 85.66, 194.12, 211.55, 321.65–70, 491.63

see also abuse of discretion; differential treatment (Principle 2.1), grounds for; fairness; INT, general allegations of mismanagement/hostile working environment; legal/legitimate expectation; presumption of innocence

and also under individual headings such as Workers' Compensation Program (Staff Rule 6.11)

(including allegations relating to due process/fairness), Claims Administrator's obligation to act with fairness and objectivity (Principle 2.1)

career management 139.57, 454.39–44

composition of investigating team 28.45

investigator's relationship with person under investigation 246.48

involvement of investigator/review body in matters under investigation 188.20, 246.47

findings of investigation based on investigator's personal interpretation of limited evidence 246.49–50

as general principle of law 1.34, 26.20–2

imposition of PIP 408.42–9, 410.42–8, 414.40–53, 434.49–54, 437.22–69

imprudence/lack of diligence 362.6–38

legal costs in relation to INT investigation 361.23–37

obligation to inform staff member of complaints against them 293.57

performance evaluation 211.55–78, 217.56–66

early notification of complaints 293.57

plausibility of claim relating to, sufficiency for establishment of Tribunal's jurisdiction

(*N/McKinney*) 183.17, 334.35, 356.20, 368.18, 368.25, 426.53, 427.35, 443.36, 453.49–50

reasonable and observable/objective basis, need for 315.23, 315.26, 382.24, 390.53–74, 434.19,

434.25–37, 434.62, 437.24–68, 439.28–45, 450.78, 453.69, 461.40–5, 461.48–54, 463.37
redundancy proceedings 196.13–32
right of accused and accuser to due process 194.12, 201.20, 206.23, 206.28–32, 325.42–67, 396.60
salary decisions 245.39–59, 361.19–21, 458.32
selection process 248.48–9, 453.68–72
Staff Rules as instrument for ensuring 188.21, 344.66, 455.30
work program/terms of reference 217.38–55

family obligations, spouse and/or child support (Staff Rule 3.06)
see also Spousal and Child Support Policy (1998); spousal support claims
amended rule (2 February 2009) 484.53–4
“final” order requirement
 discontinuance in Staff Rule 3.06 484.53–4
 object and purpose 48.61–2
 plain and ordinary meaning (including relevance of “non-appealable”) 484.58–60

fees: *see* contractual fees; costs

field staff
London Office 185.20–1
obligation to give particular care to 185.20–1, 194.8, 207.35, 213.37, 244.51, 279.18, **Order 2002-21.5, 293.74, 305.66**
time limits for challenging administrative decision 194.8

finality of Tribunal decision/res judicata (Statute XI) 13.21, 18.21–2, 19.17–18, 20.17–19, 87.15, 114.42, 171.4, **Order 2002-10.3-7, Order 2002-15.4, 310.31, 312.9–15, 329.12, 329.13–16, 329.17, 329.20, 329.24, 350.17–28, 396.45, 406.13–14, 406.31–4, 407.39–40, 442.50–2, 477.26–37, 490.27–8, 495.13–14**
see also admissibility; revision of judgment in the event of the discovery of a fact which might have had decisive influence (Statute XIII(1))
failure to contest in earlier proceedings **Order 2002-7.2-4**
identity of claims submitted by another applicant 450.82
identity of issues and parties, need for 258.31, 312.10, 336.39, 360.22
stare decisis and 302.7

financial interests in Bank Group transactions, prohibition (Staff Rule 3.01, para. 7.01)
see also disclosure of financial and business interests (Staff Rule 3.01, para. 8.01 [para. 5.01])
spouse’s activities 246.28–36

fitness for duty assessment (Staff Rule 6.07, para. 3.03), alleged abuse of discretion 407.30–8

fixed-term contract, renewal or extension, allegations relating to abuse of discretion/détournement de pouvoir/discrimination (Carter) 213.23–33, 214.36–41, 215.45–52, 217.28–36, 253.10–13, 316.28–45, 338.25–43, 475.36–44, 475.45–59, 482.42
absence of business rationale 247.15
alternative employment following expiry, Bank’s obligations 16.16–18, 16.41–4, 103.41, 187.17, 217.36, 247.26, 310.38
arbitrariness 441.34–8, 475.47–56
bias, allegations of 299.17–18
break in service rule 306.10–26, 309.15–33
discrimination 175.15, 175.17, 176.11, 183.15–16, 299.8–19, 316.28–45, 339.31, 441.34–8, 475.44
 nationality 316.42
 racial/ethnic 175.15, 175.17, 175.24, 175.26, 183.15, 299.9, 316.29, 339.40
failure to give opportunity to show full potential/error in job title 441.48, 441 (dissenting opinion).17
failure to give reasons for non-renewal 183.9, 187.8–13, 213.26, 217.36, 299.9
failure to honour assurances relating to 156.18, 176.3–9, 217.29–35, 217.92, 247.12–14, 276.42–51, 299.10–16, 316.28–46, 441.27–32, 441.48, 441 (dissenting opinion).2, 441 (dissenting opinion).20, 441 (dissenting opinion).2, 441 (dissenting opinion).20

evidence of assurances 176.7–8
standard/burden of proof (*Kopliku/Schlemmer-Schulte*) 316.36–40, 328.43–5, 339.34–41,
365.38, 441.29–31

failure to notify of intention to convert to open-ended appointment 408.50–2

failure to undertake promised performance evaluation 176.21–4

fairness 217.66

four-year lifetime limit, 1998/2002 policy on 339.25–8

gender 316.42

impairment of dignity and 187.18

inconsistencies in investigation of complaint by foreign government 176.25–9

medical condition 247.16–23

probationary period and 16.36, 316.38

retaliation 183.2–8, 401.42–4, 475.57–9

review of actions leading to decision not to renew, need for 176.12, 316.30

split of six-month contract into two short-term contracts 217.80–3, 217.93

staff member's right to evaluation following termination 440.20–1

timely notification of intention not to renew 441.38

fixed-term contract, renewal or extension, right to

see also consultancy appointments; temporary appointment; terms and conditions of employment

Bank policy, change in 441 dissenting opinion.18

dependence on terms of appointment (*Mr. X*) 16.35–6, 128.35, 187.10, 213.24–5, 250.19, 328.39,
365.38, 381.76, 441.28, 441.33, 441 dissenting opinion.17

discretionary nature (“may be extended” (Staff Rule 4.01, para. 6.01(a))) 339.30, 441.33, 475.38,
475.50

legal/legitimate expectation 187.14–16, 213.27–30, 339.30–3

non-renewal for business reasons 441.35–7, 441.48, 441 (dissenting opinion).2, 441 dissenting
opinion.13-15

performance evaluation and 16.33–8, 103.25–39, 176.8–9, 176.12, 176.21–4, 187.16, 209.11–19,
209.21–2, 213.25–6, 213.31–3, 217.56–7, 217.83, 247.23, 299.17–18, 441 dissenting
opinion.19

terms of reference, relevance 217.55, 441.39–47, 441 (dissenting opinion).5-8

reasonable and objective basis/business interests of Bank as justification for non-extension
475.36–43, 475.51–6

security of employment (Principle 2.1(d)) and 441.37

selection process, need for 255.23, 328.42, 328.45

special circumstances justifying, possibility of (*Carter*) 175.13–15, 176.4, 217.30, 247.14, 299.10,
328.14, 339.33, 401.44, 441.29

terms of reference, Bank's right to change 217.40–2

flags in file, allegations relating to due process

see also access to Bank premises, Bank's right to impose restrictions/flag in file; re-employment bar
(Staff Rule 4.01, para. 8.05)/no-hire flag, notification requirement

as breach of contract 318.19, 318.33–6

no-hire and no-access flags, confusion between 370.42–3

notification of decision and reasons/right of reply 243.16, 243.23–7, 243 Decision, 370.34–54,
447.77–83, 447.97–102, 487.89–90

compensation for 243.16, 243.28, 243 Decision, 370.52, 370 Decision

constructive notice, sufficiency 370.42

removal as remedy 242.40, 242 Decision, 243.28, 243 Decision, 370.51, 370 Decision

temporary bar to hire 487.88–92

fraud

Bank's concern to eliminate corruption 397.36

comparison of cases for finding misconduct/choice of sanctions 380.38–40
disciplinary measures and 142.44, 142.46, 143.39, 158.39, 158.40, 158.43
expense claims 352.2–44, 380.2–43
extenuating circumstances 380.28
intent/knowledge of falsity, need for 143.30
evidence of 352.11, 352.34–5, 380.20–42
“reckless failure ... to observe ... norms of prudent professional conduct” (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 3.01 [para. 2.01]) distinguished 380.27, 381.57–64
overtime claims 142.2–46, 143.2–42
freedom of expression, email access, effect of bar on 429.24
frivolous argument/unfounded allegations (Mahmoudi) 219.12, 221.12, 227.31–2, 324.31, 332.41–2, 332.62, 342.38, 368.27, 374.28, 404.94, 456.14–17

gender discrimination

see also sexual harassment

Bank’s actions to rectify as confirmation of 245.45

burden/standard of proof 245.46–8, 454.38

failure to substantiate 168.30, 245.39–58, 314.4, 314.27, 316.42

delay in making complaint 245.44

historical patterns as cause 245.58

maternity leave and 309.28–33

methodology problems 245.47–57

regression analysis, fairness of refusal to provide 245.25–30, 245.34–8, 245.49–56

Oaxaca and Ransom Study on gender comparisons (1993) 245.4, 245.42–3, 245.45

1999 updates 245.12–22

performance evaluation 314.33

promotion *in situ* 454.34–8

redundancy and 326.20

salary structure as cause for continuing concern 245.52, 245.58

good faith: *see* improper motivation (including bad faith/*mala fides*), allegations of

grandfathering (amendment of Staff Rule 4.01 governing reappointment of consultants) 146.2–51, 173.9, 173.10, 173.28–9

grandfathering (Job Grading Program (1982)/Staff Rule 5.06, para. 3.01)

assurance of indefinite continuation, allegations relating to 108.44–7, 109.27, 110.31–2, 111.31, 112.26–30

essential condition of employment, whether 56.37–40, 66.25–6, 70.29–30, 71.30–1, 73.43, 106.30–4, 107.22–6, 108.37–52, 109.25–30, 110.28–32, 111.28–31, 112.31

“mechanistic” approach to salary determination, whether 106.33, 107.27–9, 108.50–1, 109.29, 110.33, 112.32–3

post-*Pinto* revision of rule 106.23–5, 107.4–5, 108.4–6, 108.29–34, 109.3–5, 109.23–4, 110.3–7, 110.25–7, 111.3–7, 111.25–7, 112.11

text 56.39, 66.25, 70.29, 71.30, 73.42, 106.25

grandfathering (pension and social security rights), Human Policy Resources Reform (1998) 205.8, 205.30–2

Gross Plan: *see* Staff Retirement Plan (SRP)

harassment (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 3.01(f))

see also sexual harassment

abuse of email system 429.22, 476.36–41

failure to follow up complaints 338.51–6, 393.60–2

failure to substantiate allegations 237.51–3, 474.62

performance evaluation, close monitoring 199.15, 199.18
physical harassment 201.23–5
verbal harassment 201.21–2, 413.45–6

hardship

consultancy appointments following redundancy with severance payment, waiver of limitations 191.4–5, 191.20
reassignment on grounds of 227.7, 227.46–51
resettlement benefits, extension 204.19

hardship allowance (Staff Rule 6.17, para. 3)

alleged abuse of discretion 149.2–27
applicant's agreement to allowance, effect 149.22
Bank's right to "establish, change or delete" (para. 3.01) 184.16–17
criteria 149.23
definition 184.3
living condition considerations, limitation to 184.18–19
notification of changes to, requirements 184.10, 184.16
US index as applicable law 184.3–21
US index, change to (from UN system)
Appeals Committee rejection of complaint against 149.7
de Merode principle and 149.24–7
delay in introducing as alleged abuse of discretion 149.7, 149.21–7
internal equity (Principle 6.1) and 149.21, 149.27
Post Adjustment System Review recommendations/implementation 149.3–6

Hay methodology, use of/shortcomings 38.8–24, 39.28, 56.4, 70.26, 71.6, 71.27, 74.19, 74.44, 135.26

home leave

see also expatriate benefits (Staff Rule 6.17 [6.13 and 6.14]), eligibility criteria
staff member status requirement (PMA 3.45) 14.49–54

hostile working environment

see also INT, general allegations of mismanagement/hostile working environment
abuse of email system and 429.22
adverse performance evaluation and 314.34, 322.26–7, 327.52
burden/standard of proof 327.51–3, 331.79–81, 409.48–51, 411.59–62, 415.50–2, 417.51–4, 423.43–7, 482.102
cultural diversity and 314.41, 322.27, 331.79
as evidence of retaliation 273.61–6
sexual harassment allegations 197.95–6, 244.15–16, 244.31–43, 369.98

Human Resources Policy Reform (1998)

dies a quo for challenges/claims 270.13
differential treatment under, acceptability 252.8–13, 253.10–13, 301.11–18, 391.2–43
see also differential treatment (Principle 2.1), grounds for
evidence of decisions of Executive Directors relating to 301.7–10
grandfathering of accrued benefits and rights 205.8
long-term appointments, phasing-out 232.6, 247.7, 247.15, 276.5
retroactive, whether 205.18–21, 233.8, 234.8, 235.8, 252.8, 253.8, 265.26, 301.7
special leave, changes to 222.8, 223.8, 224.8
Staff Retirement Plan, changes to 205.4–5, 205.15–16, 258.6–7, 265.6–7
see also Non-Regular Staff (NRS), entitlement to benefits under SRP (Staff Retirement Plan);
Rule of 50
discretionary nature 205.17, 306.17
notification, limitation to former or retired staff affected by 212.18
special leave, introduction during, effect 222.4, 222.6–16, 223.6–16, 224.6–16

transitional arrangements 205.8
for staff adversely affected by, recommendation for 265.32

Human Resources reforms (2012)

presentation of changes (“Project Charter”) 482.9–11
reasons for 482.7
selection for post-reorganization positions
interview process 482.23–6, 482.90–105
compliance with *Perea/BK (No. 2)* criteria 482.105
shortlisting process 482.12–21, 482.72–89
reasonable and observable basis for 482.89

human rights, alleged breaches

surviving spouse benefit, denial to divorced person 210.25
waiver of right to severance 219.12, 221.12

IAD Investigative Panel Report (1987), disclosure of sanitized version 100.66, 101.1, 101.14, 101.55 identification cards (AMS 6.50)

access to Bank premises and 447.123–7
expired cards, obligation to return (para. 33) 47.124–6
failure to return expired ID, effect (para. 36) 47.124–6

ignorance of the law: *see* exceptional circumstances justifying failure to meet time limits for submission of application (Statute II(2)), possibilities considered by Tribunal; terms and conditions of employment, sources/applicable law, staff member’s obligation to familiarize him/herself with

IMF, parallelism with

see also mobility premium (Staff Rule 21), Bank/IMF couples (para. 3.05)
background to and operation of rule 38.13, 38.15–22, 38.26, 38.29, 38.32–43, 38.52–70
Bank’s compliance with principle/allegations of abuse of discretion 38.113–26
Bank’s right to adopt different human resource policies 38.69, 38.124, 38.126, 39.24, 205.35–6, 301.12–14, 391.42, 473.42
condition of employment (*de Merode*), whether 38.7, 38.62–7, 38.120
flexibility of rule 38.67–9
Joint Bank/IMF Committee on Staff Compensation (JCC) 86.5–10, 86.35–7
as legally relevant factor for adjustment of salary 38.103–5

immunity of Bank

collection in local courts of monies owed, risk to 353.15, 353.38–9
private obligations of staff members (Principle 3.3) 140.26–7
spousal support and 325.10, 325.20–2, 403.23, 424.58–9, 424.67–70
US legislation and 210.24

impartiality: *see* fairness, impartiality, non-discrimination and proper process (Principles 2.1 and 9.1)

improper motivation (including bad faith/*mala fides*), allegations of

see also intention, relevance; redundancy consequent on abolition of position or change in job requirements (general issues) (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8) (including allegations relating to abuse of discretion/failure to observe due process/fairness); retaliation
appointment without clear identification of task 217.67, 217.70–5
ban on consultancy appointment following retirement 179.8–12
burden/standard of proof (“clear evidence” requirement) 211.71, 226.18–20, 247.15, 255.42–3, 260.52, 292.29, 310.31, 328.51, 340.70, 344.59, 393.37, 443.50, 482.102
disclosure of personal information 179.13
due process violation in absence of 377.75–6, 426.120–4
failure to appoint to new post following redundancy 196.32, 303.13–16
failure to honor assurances relating to return following developmental assignment 181.8–13
failure to substantiate claims 313.66

INT reorganization and restructuring **415.41–3**
 intention to terminate employment **313.52–7, 313.66**
 job grading (Staff Rule 9, para. 8) **92.23–7**
 leave arrangements **310.27–38**
 managerial inefficiency/irregularity distinguished **188.22, 211.71, 319.38**
 non-material mistake **46155–7**
 misrepresentation of professional standing **179.13**
 performance evaluation **198.27, 211.71, 292.26–9, 313.58–62, 313.66, 332.46–57**
 President’s role in selection of staff **453.63**
 procedural irregularities giving impression of **248.25**
 salary review **156.20–1, 226.18–20, 303.23–5**
 severance payments on termination for unsatisfactory performance **188.22**
in camera examination of documents **179.17, 197.41, 206.31, 268.22, 271.42, 272.9, 300.1, 300.39, 332.52, 332.59, 362.2, 375.12–13, 375.15, 375.28, 382.15, 390.84, 390.111, 402.16, 402.74, 430.98, 431.85, 436.14, 451.93, 461.42, 474.60**
Information Security Policy: *see* email accounts, Bank’s right of access to (Information Security Policy (AMS 6.20A))
inhuman or degrading treatment, administration of health services **251.56**
Institutional Integrity Department (INT): *see* Ethics and Business Conduct, Office of (EBC)
INT, general allegations of mismanagement/hostile working environment **408.2–34**
Note: paras. 1–34 of Decision 408 (AK) are repeated verbatim in Decisions 409–423
 background **408.4–22**
 Conflict Resolution System (CRS), alleged denial of access to **408.29–34**
 Principle 2.1/*Merode* and **308.30–4**
 Grievance Panel
 Bank’s rectification of irregularities identified by **410.54, 412.54, 413.44, 414.42, 414.44**
 conclusions **408.21–2**
 Lead Institutional Integrity Officer’s comments on INT director **408.19–20**
 non-judicial status **408.27**
 Ombudsman’s attendance at **408.17**
 punitive/compensatory damages award, exclusion **408.28, 413.37**
 recommendations and advice
 Bank’s acceptance of **408.37, 410.37**
 Bank’s rejection of **409.37, 411.37, 412.37, 413.37**
 Bank’s right to reject **408.24–7**
 limitation to **408.24–7**
 right to pursue alternative remedy and **408.18**
 terms of reference **408.17**
 HR–INT relationship **408.12**
 reorganization and restructuring
 improper motivation **415.41–3**
 reversal **417.50**
 staff turnover **408.12**
 Volcker recommendations for changes (2007): *see* Volcker Report (2007)
INT process **430.100–1, 431.87–8, 450.113–14**
see also disciplinary proceedings (Staff Rule 8.01), procedure and scope (including allegations of procedural flaws/abuse of discretion); preliminary inquiry (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 5.02 [para. 4.02]) (including allegations relating to due process)
 consistency **295.30, 306.14–19, 306.26–9**
 fairness and **248.28, 266.50, 273.27, 292.49, 302.33–46, 331.47**
 Management Review Group, composition **150.47–9, 170.14, 188.20, 197.91, 198.9, 198.29**

PBAC decision-taking 177.37
performance evaluation 24.36, 85.72, 156.20, 188.20, 338.50, 338.60, 439.43–5, 439.50
redundancy process 85.66, 241.33–7, 248.28, 260.20, 266.50, 273.27, 292.49, 292.63, 302.24,
302.30–55, 326.34, 331.47, 357.57–62, 372.33, 372.44, 372.47, 405.31
selection process 344.66
severance payments 154.31–2
spousal support 325.56–67

intention, relevance

see also improper motivation (including bad faith/*mala fides*), allegations of; misconduct,
classification as (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 3.01 [para. 2.01]/Principle 3/breaches of Staff Rule
3.0), malice or guilty purpose, relevance (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 3.01 [para. 4.02])

due process 248.38–9, 266.33, 271.179

failure to notify of precise Staff Rule on which redundancy based 248.38–9

misconduct (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 3.01 [para. 4.02]) 246.34, 352.17, 352.35, 387.25–30, 388.58

interest: *see* claims for money owed and claims accrued (Staff Rule 11.01), interest on (para. 3.04);
compensation, measure, interest

interim measures: *see* provisional relief, request for

internal remedies: *see* administrative review (Staff Rule 9.01); exhaustion of internal remedies (Statute
II(2)(i))

international organization, national government, equivalence for conflict of interest purposes 242.32

interpersonal skills/personality/behaviours

arbitrariness in determination of ratings 351.45–6, 351.59

conflict management 357.53

evidence of 188.4–6, 188.18, 225.29–30

importance as element of performance evaluation 12.43–50, 147.38, 152.14–15, 176.11, 178.21,
188.9–10, 188.17–18, 322.24–5

IT skills, adaptability 152.11–15

PIP and 402.108–27, 437.22–4, 437.69

probation and 225.25–31, 271.96–104, 351.45–6

professional/technical competence distinguished 188.22, 351.43–4, 351.58

interpretation of contract of employment: *see* contract of employment

interpretation of Staff Rules and comparable documents

absence of provision, relevance 201.30, 202.14

aids/guidelines

benefit of the doubt, entitlement to 225.53, 242.31, 479.38

Checklist for Managing Staff on Probation 271.161–3

context 11.19, 208.13

effectiveness of all terms 11.19, 93.37, 214.34, 215.43

express language 154.31

Jennings Report (2002) 271.156

national legislation relating to facts 242.23, 242.28

object and purpose 48.61–2, 93.39, 205.27, 210.21, 242.23, 479.38

plain and ordinary meaning 210.13, 210.27, 214.34, 215.43, 348.28, 391.35, 460.20, 460.21,
479.38–9, 484.58–60

practice of Bank 205.27, 208.13, 210.27, 210.113–19, 214.35, 215.44, 242.32

text as a whole 400.41

ambiguity 225.52–4, 271.152–8

amendment of Rules distinguished 271.161–3

applicable law 242.23

interpretation of Tribunal decision: *see* Tribunal decision

intervention, right of (Tribunal Rules 21-23) 26.34, 40.87, 330.1, 383.1, 403.15

investigation (Office of Professional Ethics/INT) (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 5): *see* disciplinary proceedings (Staff Rule 8.01), scope of Tribunal review of (including *Carew/Mustafa/Cissé/Koudogbo* formulation); Ethics and Business Conduct, Office of (EBC); INT, general allegations of mismanagement/hostile working environment; Jennings Report into facts relating to Conthe case (Decision No. 271); misconduct, classification as (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 3.01 [para. 2.01]/Principle 3); preliminary inquiry (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 5.02); sexual harassment, independent investigation

Jennings Report into facts relating to Conthe case (Decision No. 271)

360 degree feedback procedures 271.180
360 Degree Feedback Update 271.169–70, 271.177
applicant’s reactions to 271.74–107
 ad hominem criticisms of persons offering critical comment 271.93
 challenge to witnesses 271.91
 investigator’s lack of Bank experience 271.92
 investigator’s prejudice 271.94
integrity of 271.82–4
Order of 26 April 2002 establishing 271.42

Job Evaluation (Staff Rule 6.05)

business needs of Bank as determining factor (Staff Rule 6.05, paras. 3.01 and 3.03) 458.49–54
discretionary nature 458.52

Job Grading Program (1982)/implementation (Staff Rule 5.09)

see also review of assignment of grade at staff member’s request (Staff Rule 6.05, Section 3)
 (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion)
allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion/fairness 56.35–7, 57.20–35, 58.38–48,
 106.27–9
 delay in correcting classification error 58.38–50
 failure to apply Staff Rule 5.09, para. 8.03 92.20–2
 failure to follow fair and reasonable procedures 74.43–5
 failure to give credit for language skills 70.24–7, 71.25–8
 failure to notify applicant of downgrading 73.35–40
 misgrading, allegations of 92.28–32
compliance with Staff Principles
 internal equity (Principle 6.1) 74.7–12, 108.53
 “reasonable measures to alleviate adverse effects” of grading or regrading at lower level
 (Principle 5.1(f)) (*Klaus Berg (No 2)*) 56.39–40, 66.25–6, 70.29–30, 71.30–1, 73.27,
 106.35–7, 107.28, 107.33, 108.53, 112.32–3
 systematic job evaluation programs (Principle 6.2(b)), compliance with 57.21–6
grandfathering: *see* grandfathering (Job Grading Program (1982)/Staff Rule 5.06, para. 3.01)
Hay methodology, use of/shortcomings 38.8–24, 39.28, 56.4, 70.26, 71.6, 71.27, 74.19, 74.44,
 135.26
implementation procedures, adequacy 73.35–41
Procedures Guide for Managers (“Blue Book”) (1984)/“Revised Evaluation Criteria” (1985) 58.4
reformulation of criteria, JGAB recommendation for 58.17–19
summary of provisions and implementation procedures 56.2–10
as term of employment 58.38, 58.46–8

Job Grading Program Appeals Board (JGAB)/appeals procedure (Staff Rule 9.04)
appeal to the Tribunal, right of 56.10
competence (para. 4.02) 56.10, 77.19
failure to challenge decision 82.42
failure to follow fair and reasonable procedures 74.8–12, 74.43–52

grounds for appeal (para. 3.01) **56.10**
JGAB's discretion to determine procedure (para. 4) **77.21**
re-opening of JGAB proceedings (para. 19)

at unilateral request of Bank **74.8–12, 74.43–52, 76.24**
in case of procedural irregularity affecting applicant **77.18–24**

joinder/disjoinder of jurisdiction and merits **12.intro, 29.1, 35.1, 79.1, 89.1, 89.28, 95.1, 104.1, 118.2, 119.2, 120.2, 121.2, 122.1, 123.2, 124.2, 125.2, 126.2, 129.1, 130.1, 134.1, 136.1, 137.1, 151.1, 163.1, 167.3, 173.12, 174.2, 175.3, 175.17, 179.7, 182.7, 183.1, 190.1, 194.1, 206.1, 206.22, 207.1, 230.1, 231.1, 232.1, 233.1, 234.1, 235.1, 249.1, 268.20, 442.7, 457.29**

see also consolidation of proceedings

judgment: *see* Tribunal decision

judicial economy

Note: For the purposes of this index, “judicial economy” refers to the manner in which the Tribunal has dealt with issues not essential to its decision.

admissibility of unnecessary evidence **177.34**

finding of inadmissibility **175.26**

finding on one complaint rendering consideration of other complaints immaterial **157.43, 164.21, 165.27, 189.17**

finding that “fact” not “decisive” for purposes of Art. XIII of Statute **170.23**

importance of issue as justification for considering, due process, complaints relating to **177.36–7**

partly justified complaints not causing material damage **185.26**

related point already decided **85.73**

return of applicant's personal possessions **157.64–6**

jurisdiction (Appeals Committee): *see* Appeals Committee (admissibility, competence and procedure) (Staff Rule 9.03)

jurisdiction (PBAC): *see* Pension Benefits Administration Committee (PBAC), jurisdiction

jurisdiction (Tribunal)

see also admissibility; exhaustion of internal remedies (Statute II(2)(i)); finality of Tribunal decision/*res judicata* (Statute XI); procedure (Tribunal); standing, requirements/right of recourse to Tribunal; time limits

“any cause of complaint subsequent to 1 January 1979” **1.10, 307.9**

Appeals Committee jurisdictional findings, dissent from **89.35–6**

best or more effective alternative to Bank's chosen policy, exclusion from consideration **205.17, 214.40, 400.46, 446.34**

challenge to

absence of, effect **323.30**

by intervenor **424.48**

consolidated challenge **375.2**

direct application by agreement of parties, effect **232.9, 324.20**

as preliminary question **53.23**

request for dismissal for failure to state cause of action **374.28**

reservation of right to **324.5, 324.20**

time limits (Tribunal Rules 8(1)) **314.3–6, 327.3–6, 429.12, 432.24**

Tribunal's obligation to examine **175.18**

clarification of issues/claims **18.20, 20.16, 38.43, 66.24, 68.35, 157.26, 201.19, 204.17–22, 227.4, 233.22, 234.22, 235.22, 248.4, 257.45, 258.23–5, 261.15–17, 275.17, 292.25, 335.28–33, 344.32, 346.18, 374.23, 377.69–70, 407.29, 441.27, 443.25–7, 453.25–6**

applicant's obligation to identify issue under challenge **198.35–40, 318.19, 318.30, 326.61, 443.27, 453.26**

compétence de la compétence (Statute III) **426.45**

“decision” capable of challenge, need for **179.14–16, 312.17–19, 343.12–20, 356.15–32,**

426.49–55, 427.32–5
 omissions or failure to act/non-feasance 78.39, 172.8, 179.15, 204.16, 204.21, 275.30, 356.31, 368.28, 453.51
 organs responsible for, relevance 38.46
 PBAC decision 424.49–52
 national criminal investigation, relationship 23.40, 23.59, 152.45, 268.9, 268.11, 272.26, 451.81
 applicability of amended Staff Rules 160.22–8, 304.49, 386.36, 396.41–2, 397.22
 applicability to former member of staff 179.16, 318.32, 343.18, 370.34–8, 387.31–6, 406.30, 426.34, 426.55
 “conditions of employment” 1.4
 existence of contractual relationship distinguished 160.28
 failure to consider for alternative position 190.5–7
 failure to offer new assignment 211.44
 “in force at time of alleged non-observance” 1.38, 15.21, 17.38, 104.15, 160.26, 343.12–20
 interpretation of SRP 424.47, 424.53–4
 non-renewal of fixed-term/consultancy contract 175.10–17, 183.12–16
 placement of flags in applicant’s file 243.18–27, 318.33–6, 370.35–8
 termination
 allocation of work following 250.19
 appointment of replacement 270.20
 observance of terms of contract of employment or terms of appointment, limitation to (Statute II(1)), individualized complaint, need for: *see* standing, requirements/right of recourse to Tribunal, non-observance of contract or terms of appointment of applicant causing individual harm or grievance (*Agodo*)
 omissions or failures to act/non-feasance 78.36, 78.40–6, 179.15
 plausibility of claim, sufficiency (*N*) 175.17, 183.17, 334.35, 356.20, 368.18, 368.25–6, 426.53, 427.35, 443.36, 453.49–50
 strict compliance with Statute, obligation 236.29, 237.23, 275.37
 Tribunal’s obligation to examine objections to 175.18
 Tribunal’s obligation to examine related but unchallenged decision 12.40
 Tribunal’s obligation to satisfy itself of legal issues 38.77
 Tribunal’s right to overrule Appeals Committee jurisdictional findings: *see* Appeals Committee (findings/recommendations), Tribunal review of
 Workers’ Compensation Review Panel decisions 193.2–15, 218.14, 218.16, 228.2, 228.9–10

Kafka System (1979)

see also tax reimbursement system (Personnel Manual Circular 1/80)
 background and implementation (Personnel Manual Circular 1/18) 1.6–10, 1.66–71, 1.87–8, 38.4–6, 38.32, 38.78–96, 39.18–28
 comparator principle 1.110, 38.4–6, 38.57–8, 38.79, 38.108, 39.28, 86.2–10
 discretionary powers of Bank 38.93–112
 legally binding nature (*Stauffenberg*)/as term of appointment 38.73–7, 39.24, 39.27, 86.30
 quality premium 38.80–2
 sharp deviation, Bank’s obligation to avoid 38.4, 38.10, 38.86–7, 38.89–91, 38.94, 86.2, 86.29
 Staff Association participation in review process 86.29
 triennial review, Bank’s obligations relating to 38.4, 38.84, 39.19–29, 86.2–39

language difficulties, as exceptional circumstance 280.12–13

leave

see also accrued leave, withhold as disciplinary measure (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 4.01(c)/para. 4.01(d)); administrative leave (Staff Rule 6.06, para. 9); leave without pay (Staff Rule 6.06,

para. 6.02); special leave (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 13)
“absences not approved as some other form of leave” (Staff Rule 6.06, para. 2.03) **310.36**
definition (Staff Rule 6.06, para. 2.01) **310.33**
refusal as alleged abuse of discretion **239.50–5, 390.71**
 advice against taking distinguished **17.46**
 applicant’s failure to seek clarification **239.52**
 discretionary arrangement, relevance **310.27–38**
 written refusal, desirability **239.52**

leave without pay (Staff Rule 6.06, para. 6.02)

allegations of delay **421.48, 421.50**
assistance in job search on return **435.52–7**
 Bank’s obligations **435.52–3**
failure to seek advice on implications **478.37–40**
reentry terms **168.28, 421.48, 421.50–2, 435.50–1**
to accompany spouses on overseas assignments (para. 6.04(e)) **421.48–52**

legal assistance from independent adviser during disciplinary proceedings, rights under Staff Rule 8.01, para. 4.10 **389.125–37, 396.49**

see also costs
change to rules **396.49**
channels of communication **389.137**
consultation with independent advisor prior to investigation interview **389.130**
fair treatment (Principle 9.01) and **361.22–37**
fairness (Principle 2.1) **361.22–37, 373.86–8**
presence of independent adviser at interview **389.132–6**
right of independent adviser to comment on report **396.55–7**
right to costs **361.22–37, 389.127**

legal representative, censure by Tribunal **317.58**

legal/legitimate expectation

see also accrued/acquired rights; estoppel
clear evidence to the contrary **187.14–15**
continued employment **183.9**
detrimental reliance, need for **301.26–7**
express and unambiguous promises, failure to demonstrate **482.36–9**
 performance, relevance **482.40–1**
failure to meet as breach of contract **213.27**
fixed-term contract, renewal or extension **187.14–16, 213.27–30, 339.30–3, 482.34–42**
mandatory retirement, extension of employment beyond **348.28–33**
national law **301.24–5**
promotion **83.57, 131.78–9, 145.19–20**
reasonable assumption of Bank’s intentions and **348.32**
reentry/reintegration to given position/office **168.29, 435.28–9**
SRP (Staff Retirement Plan), 2002 changes and **301.23–8**

letter of appointment (including allegations of abuse of discretion)

as evidence of staff member’s status **260.31**
failure to modify as appropriate **Order 2002-21.5-6**
initialled objection on letter of appointment, effect **295.32**
as restatement of general rule **118.31, 120.28–30**
as source of terms and conditions of service **1.16–29, 180.16–18, 180.1616–31, 262.15, 264.8, 412.49–53**

Loan Department (LOA)

acknowledgment of longstanding unfair practices **255.47**

investigation and remedial action, recommendation for 255.47

long-term consultancy appointments (LTC): *see* consultancy appointments, long-term appointments (LTC)

Lynk Report into treatment of African staff (1999) 227.18, 236.3–29

administrative review by Managing Director who had initiated report 236.4–8

appeal to Appeals Committee

as alternative to administrative review 236.9, 236.11, 236.15, 236.18–20

failure to meet time limits 236.9–29

request for new administrative review 236.7–8

Management Review Group (Staff Rule 4.02)

comments by staff member/opportunity to answer criticisms, importance 192.20, 200.15, 225.55, 226.8

composition/impartiality 23.56, 150.47–9, 170.14, 188.20, 197.91, 198.9, 198.29

recommendations, revision to meet criticisms 133.35–6

role 23.24, 188.19, 197.91

management/staff relations

see also abuse of discretion; fairness, impartiality, non-discrimination and proper process (Principles 2.1 and 9.1); staff records (Staff Rule 2.01); work program/terms of reference (including allegations of due process/abuse of discretion)

alleged lack of support in fulfilling managerial functions 271.132–3

assignment to a post considered by applicant as unsatisfactory 239.60–1

Bank's right to organize, assign and transfer staff to meet evolving needs and circumstances (Principle 5) 457.42, 457.46

evolution post-1945 1.5

good communications, importance 180.14

level of decision-taking 188.19

non-intervention policy 201.16, 239.53–4

personality conflict

management's right to restructure 239.56–61

rudeness of manager towards member of staff, whether abuse of discretion 239.39–41

Realigning the Provisions of Support Services 161.5–8, 162.5–8

redundancy consequent on 161.10, 162.10

reorganization following 161.8–10, 162.8–10

time limits for claims as means of protecting 230.11, 230.14, 262.27, 269.8

managerial inefficiency/irregularity, Bank's liability for

abuse of discretion distinguished 239.54

improper motive distinguished 188.22, 211.71, 319.38

timely correction of error and 39.30–4

Managing Director (OPE)

responsibility for determining disciplinary measures 246.54

on basis of OPE report 246.54, 340.76

mandatory termination (Staff Rule 3.01/Staff Rule 8.01)

abuse of position for financial gain 246.35, 246.53, 300.3, 300.37, 305.12, 305.38, 305.72, 373.78–81, 388.57–64, 489.63–8

revision of rule (1996) 373.78–81, 381.66–8

conviction of felonious offence 373.2–89, 455.3–56

conflation of admissions/guilty pleas and potential charges 455.10–13

discontinuation of inquiry without filing of charge 455.9

EBC's fact-finding obligations 455.19–31

EBC's obligation to establish existence of conviction 455.15–31

felonious acts not incurring automatic termination 455.9, 455.32–53
discretion not to terminate, relevant factors 373.48–88, 455.14, 455.16
criminal act not a felony in all jurisdictions 373.14–19, 373.43–52, 373.72–3
extenuating circumstances 373.59–61, 455.22
frequency of offending conduct 207.28–9, 373.68, 388.57–64
interests of the Bank 373.64–7
long good service 142.44, 143.40
proportionality 142.39, 142.43–6, 143.37–42, 373.49–51, 455.32–56, 487.69–82, 489.65–8
seriousness of the matter 373.55–8, 373.70, 455.35, 455.44–52
situation of staff member 304.52–3, 373.62–3, 373.69, 373.73
due process including allegations of abuse
by reference to handling of other cases 373.74–81
EBC decision not to undertake fact-finding exercise 455.20–31
failure to consider circumstances of individual case 455.15
misuse of Bank Group funds for personal gain 487.69
non-retroactivity principle in relation to 1997 amendment of Rule 304.49
notification to Ethics Office of possibility of (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 5.01) 246.42, 246.44, 246.57
scope of Tribunal review, “full and sole” discretion of Bank’s President or designee and 373.43, 373.47

maternity leave (Staff Rule 5.01)

continuity of service and 309.28–33
gender discrimination 309.28–33
Non-Regular staff and 309.28–33

media: *see* press (including allegations of abuse of discretion)

mediation (Staff Rule 9.01)

Note: Mediation (Staff Rule 9.01) was introduced in 1999 in replacement for administrative review (Staff Rule 9.01).

conclusion as *dies a quo* for challenge to administrative decision 276.41
confidentiality (Staff Rule 9.01, para. 4.08) 479.50
consensual nature 239.57–9, 335.36
offer as recognition of failure to observe Staff Rules 248.33
performance evaluation (OPE) 471.15–18
performance improvement plan (PIP) 256.14
as preferred option 312.20
reinstatement problems 469.18–23
stay of proceedings pending 334.16, 469.18–23
termination, staff member’s opposition to 443.71
time limits (para. 4.02(b)) 279.9–10, 280.9–10
appeals following unsuccessful mediation 276.41, 279.9–10, 280.9–10, 323.33–7, 443.34–5
time limits (para. 4.02(c)) 323.33–8
successive mediations 323.16–18, 323.33–8
withdrawal of application following successful mediation **Order 2002-19**

medical condition (including allegations of abuse of discretion)

see also disability pension (SRP 3, s 3.4); Disability Program; Workers’ Compensation Program (Staff Rule 6.11)

applicant’s acceptance of diagnoses, effect 154.33
assurance of re-employment on recovery from illness, burden of proof 277.14–15
burden/standard of proof (Staff Rule 6.11, para. 2.01) 364.32, 364.47–50, 425.37
evidence of 177.13–17, 177.19–31, 195.5–6
authenticity 177.15, 195.5–6
cause of skin complaint 349.30–5

- permanency 177.19–31
- as exceptional circumstance: *see* exceptional circumstances justifying failure to meet time limits for submission of application (Statute II(2))
- failure to provide individual office 277.11
- failure to take into account in making offer of probationary reassignment 139.56
- fitness for duty assessment (Staff Rule 6.07, Health Program and Services), desirability 470.42–7
 - discretionary nature 470.43, 470.47
 - unreasonable exercise of discretion 470.44–7
 - failure to require as unfair treatment 470.51
- illness postdating notification of decision not to confirm appointment 277.12–13
- non-disclosure of relevant information
 - differences between the parties relating to 470.34–41
 - effect 311.13–20, 311.23–5
- non-renewal of fixed-term contract and 247.16–23
- performance evaluation, relevance to 247.17, 470.1–51
- personality problems 12.43–4
- privacy, right of 247.24
- “psychiatric disorders”, as sorting category 239.31, 239.44–5
- retroactive application of regular appointment following final medical clearance 154.33
- selection process, relevance to 247.18
- vocational rehabilitation, justification for 349.51–3
- medical examination, requirement for (Staff Rule 4.44) 98.32–44**
 - see also* disability pension (SRP 3, s 3.4); Workers’ Compensation Program (Staff Rule 6.11)
 - (including allegations relating to due process/fairness)
 - “established policy” relating to 98.38–41
- Medical Insurance Plan (Staff Rule 6.12/Circular N. 85/06)**
 - see also* Retiree Medical Insurance Plan (MIP)
 - right to see doctor of own choosing 473.47–8
- medical records**
 - change of procedures 239.44–5
 - confidentiality (Staff Rule 2.02) 147.56, 239.31, 239.46, 244.65–70
 - unauthorized consultation as misconduct 244.67–9
 - correction and amendment following Appeals Committee finding of management error 239.34
 - electronic, constraints posed by 239.28–9
 - sorting categories
 - psychiatric disorder 239.31, 239.44–5
 - suppression of entry 239.31
- mental illness, settlement of claim and Order 1998**
- misclassification:** *see* Non-Regular Staff (NRS), misclassification as; redundancy consequent on abolition of position or change in job requirements (general issues) (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8) (including allegations relating to abuse of discretion/failure to observe due process/fairness), misclassification of grounds for redundancy
- misconduct, classification as (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 3.01 [para. 2.01]/Principle 3/breaches of Staff Rule 3.0)**
 - absence from office without justifiable cause (para. 3.01(a)) 244.62, 244.74
 - abuse of authority (para. 3.01(a)), contravention of procurement policies 305.7–11, 305.18–37
 - abuse of position to obtain commercial favors/financial gain (para. 3.01(d) [para. 2.01]) 244.61–3, 300.1–39, 388.2–64, 451.9–10, 451.17, 451.97, 489.36, 489.42–59
 - acceptance of favors 305.7–11, 305.38–46
 - award of contracts in disregard of Bank’s procurement rules 305.36–7, 489.54–6, 489.59
 - conflict of interest arising from failure to disclose financial interests distinguished 389.56–8

failure to notify applicant of allegation [in timely fashion] **451.17, 451.42–7, 489.70–5**
 “gain” **300.23–5, 304.27, 304.29–31**
 “not proven” decision/staff member’s reluctance to facilitate investigation **487.20–2, 487.52, 487.64–6**
 use of Bank contractor for private work **305.38–46**
 acceptance of remuneration from entities or persons in connection with World Bank Group
 appointment (para. 4.05) **304.32**
 acceptances of gifts, benefits or hospitality (Staff rule 3.01, para. 10.01) **492.22–6**
 acts and omissions in conflict with the general obligations of staff members (para. 2(c)) **387.55–6**
 apology to complainant, relevance **201.10, 201.15**
 conduct compromising independence (Principle 3.1(b)) **388.42, 388.46–64**
 abuse of position for personal gain distinguished **389.56–8**
 apparent conflict, sufficiency **389.50–2, 486.100**
 failure to appreciate conflict/approval by another member of staff as defence **489.41**
 conduct leading to real or apparent conflict of interest (Principle 3.1(a)) **389.42, 389.46–86, 482.23, 486.50–5, 489.39–40, 492.24–6**
 conduct unbecoming an employee of an international organization (Principle 3.1(c)/Staff rule 3.0, para. 6.01(c)) **366.64–73, 381.56–65, 387.25–30, 388.42, 389.46–64, 396.31–4, 492.22**
 currency speculation (para. 7.04) **300.33–6**
 engagement in outside business activities (para. 6.01(a)) **304.17–20, 327.34, 396.27–34**
 standard of compliance **304.43–6**
 failure to comply with disclosure of financial interests obligations **389.41–64, 396.27, 396.35**
 failure to cooperate in INT investigation (para. 4.06) **389.97–113**
 failure to correct errors **352.21, 381.62–4, 388.62**
 failure to discharge duties solely with the interest and objectives of the Bank in view (Principle 3.1(a)) **389.42, 389.46–64, 486.50–5, 486.66–7, 486.78, 486.89, 486.98, 486.100, 486.122, 492.23**
 failure to disclose personal/financial relationships/disqualify him/herself from procurement process
 connect with **486.13, 486.48, 486.54, 486.67, 486.108, 486.112, 486.113, 486.122**
 failure of spouse **486.79, 486.123, 486.198**
 failure to observe Principles of Staff Employment (para. 3.01(a) [para. 2.01(a)]) **388.45, 388.55–63, 396.27–37, 489.12, 489.36**
 failure to pay court-ordered spousal support **325.24, 325.52–4, 325.58, 325.63**
 false expenses claims **352.2–44, 380.2–43, 388.2–64**
 former employee’s unauthorized entry to Bank **243.27**
 furthering the business of a company **389.65–86**
 grade, relevance **300.38**
 harassment (para. 3.01(f)) **143.23**
 improper interaction with staff member regarding investigation **389.87–96**
 improper professional conduct below standard required under Principle 3 **389.87–96**
 inappropriate facilitation of employment for relatives, friends and acquaintances **486.99–122**
 insurance claim based on false declaration of marital status **105.2–52**
 leaking of Bank Board minutes **448.35–44, 448.82**
 lying during OPE investigation **244.74**
 malice or guilty purpose, relevance (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 3.01 [para. 4.02]) **140.32, 246.34, 352.17, 352.35, 387.25–30, 388.58, 448.51, 451.74, 487.62, 489.12, 492.25–6**
 misrepresentations in financial disclosure statement **486.180–99**
 misuse of Bank Group funds **486.123–79**
 authorization of double payment **486.143**
 authorization of inflated contract price **486.142, 486.159–67**
 fraudulent contract **486.135–43, 486.168–74**

receipt of improper payments **48.144–58, 486.125–34, 486.175–9**
 misuse of Bank resources/unauthorized use **487.41–52**
 in case of employment outside the Bank Group (Staff Rule 3.02, para. 3.03) **487.44**
 for friend’s business **487.13–14**
 “misuse of Bank funds” **489.57–8**
 use of Bank Group offices, equipment or computer resources (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 2.01(a))
 487.12, 487.43
 see also email communication (AMS 12.10)
 use of Bank Group services, supplies or facilities for private gain (Staff Rule 3.01, para. 12.10)
 487.46
 use of Bank’s names and symbols (AMS 1) **487.45**
 private obligations and: *see* disciplinary measures (Staff Rule 8.01 [Staff Rule 3.0]), limitation to
 misconduct adversely reflecting on reputation or integrity of Bank or IFC
 reckless or intentional failure to observe generally applicable norms of professional conduct (para.
 3.01(b) [para. 2.01(b)]/Staff Rule 3.00, para. 6.01(b))
 admission of/apology for **476.33**
 alcohol abuse **244.61, 244.64**
 conduct lacking intent to defraud **380.27, 381.57–64**
 contravention of procurement policies **305.7–11, 305.47–53**
 inappropriate personal relations **366.6, 366.64–73, 378.10–11**
 interest-free loan to client of bank **304.17–20, 304.24–40**
 personal loan from government official involved with Bank projects **492.24**
 pornography involvement **304.17–20, 304.47–8**
 retaliation against staff member who uses Conflict Resolution System (Staff Rule 3.01, para. 6.01(g))
 482.107, 485.63
 sexual relationships between supervisors and subordinates: *see* sexual relationships between
 supervisors and subordinates failure to resolve conflicts of interest
 steering of contracts to a favored contact **486.47–98**
 “steering” **486.48–9**
 summary of/examples **486.200–7**
 taxes
 failure to pay **158.3–36**
 false certification of payment **158.3–36**
 misuse of tax allowances **158.3–36**
 misuse of tax exoneration form **246.37–40**
 unauthorized consultation of medical records **244.67–9**
 “unlawful acts” (para. 3.01(e)) **143.23**
 willful misrepresentation of facts intended to be relied upon/failure to know and observe Bank’s
 policies (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 2.01(b)) **426.91–103, 426.114–18, 487.15–19, 487.53–63,**
 489.36, 489.62
 elements **487.54**
 malice or guilty purpose, relevance (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 3.01 [para. 4.02]) **140.32, 487.62**
 obligation of staff member to familiarize him/herself with rules **487.75, 489.51, 489.55–6**
 reckless disregard **487.56, 487.61, 487.78**

misconduct, evidence of

see also disciplinary proceedings (Staff Rule 8.01), procedure and scope (including allegations of
 procedural flaws/abuse of discretion); preliminary inquiry (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 5.02 [para.
 4.02]); sexual harassment
 burden/standard of proof (“substantial evidence”/“reasonably sufficient” requirement)
 (*Arefeen/Dambita*) **142.32, 143.25, 207.17, 243.18–22, 244.42, 246.20, 300.20, 304.23,**
 305.16, 366.32–62, 369.53, 369.56–74, 369.81, 378.28–40, 380.18, 381.53, 386.19, 387.19,

388.45–54, 389.19, 396.15–26, 426.91–119, 448.33, 451.20, 476.31, 486.40, 487.39, 489.22, 489.62

circumstantial evidence 369.60, 378.38–9

INT’s failure to apply Staff Rules properly 426.91–204

conflicting signals from Bank 242.31, 242.37

corroboration, need for 201.4–10, 201.15, 201.23–4, 201.29–31, 369.69, 369.93

submission after completion of investigation 201.23–4

email communications 486.71–7

evasiveness 486.98

exculpation 246.37–40

failure to explain payments 486.135

finding based on assumption/speculation 246.25–7

inappropriate facilitation of employment 486.99–122

inconclusiveness 105.41–53

misuse of Bank Group funds 486.123–79

“steering” 486.60–98

mobility premium (Staff Rule 21), Bank/IMF couples (para. 3.05) 446.3–50

see also expatriate benefits (Staff Rule 6.17 [6.13 and 6.14]), eligibility criteria

Note: In 1998 “home country travel” (Staff Rule 6.13) and “education benefits” (Staff Rule 6.14) were replaced with the Mobility Premium.

determination of lawful application to applicant as limit of Tribunal’s competence 446.34

differential treatment, justification 446.44–7

“eligibility for” and “receipt of” distinguished 446.10–12, 446.37–43

IMF expatriate benefits/Bank mobility premium, requirement to choose between (pre-April 2003) 446.33

payment of expatriate benefits by each organization without spousal component (post-April 2003) 446.33

reasonableness of application of Rule 446.38–41, 446.50

Monitored Work Program (MWP) (including allegations relating to due process)

see also work program/terms of reference (including allegations of due process/abuse of discretion)

MWP as informal procedure not covered by Staff Rules 377.78

OPE overlap 377.78–80

special measure designed to deal with serious problems, whether 377.79–80

mootness of proceedings: *see* withdrawal of application/mootness

motive: *see* improper motivation (including bad faith/*mala fides*), allegations of; misconduct, classification as (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 3.01 [para. 2.01]/Principle 3/breaches of Staff Rule 3.0), malice or guilty purpose, relevance (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 3.01 [para. 4.02])

mutually agreed separation (MAS)/settlement agreement (MOU) including waiver of right of

appeal 25.24–34, 29.28–39, 35.2–25, 144.42–59, 342.20–49, 395.21–6, 425.15–19, 425.47–52, 465.16–34

see also Enhanced Separation Package (Staff Rule 5.09, para. 7.06) (Package B); severance payments; Standard Separation Package (Staff Rule 5.09, para. 9.03) (Package A); termination grant

acceptance of general offer, effect 53.30

allegations relating to motivation of Bank, failure to substantiate 144.53

alleged failure of Bank to resolve issues under 443.69–70

alleged non-disclosure of terms 467.24–8

burden of proof 467.27

desirability of clear guidance to staff members on impact of signing MAS/MOU 467.28

staff member’s obligation to check terms of package 113.27–44, 467.27–8

as alternative to termination for unsatisfactory performance 139.13, 139.52–6, 150.56, 152.29

assurances about opportunities to seek consultancy appointments as part of 159.31–41, 173.19
assurances of diligent and good faith efforts to find alternative position within the Bank 144.54–8
Bank’s offer to suspend portion of wage deduction in dispute 325.18, 325.67
benefits accruing under 342.21–3, 443.73
benefits other than those provided for in settlement agreement 29.38–9
in case of severance payments on termination for unsatisfactory performance 188.23
confidentiality clause 425.47–8, 443.54–61
 acceptance of employment outside the Bank 342.26–9
 applicability to mediation proceedings 479.50
continuing applicability following, extension to temporary assignment 342.30
denial of remedies, whether 29.37, 35.24
disability pension and 153.36
duress and (*Mr. Y/Kirk/Gamble*) 25.30–3, 29.35, 35.25, 55.25–7, 94.51, 113.37–42, 115.34, 130.14, 130.20–7, 144.42–53, 342.23–5, 376.42–58, 395.22–6, 443.77–80, 465.25
 Note: Tribunal discussion of duress almost invariably distinguishes between duress and the pressures attendant on having to balance the benefits of the different options open to him/her. See, for example, *Kehyaian (No. 2)* (Decision No. 130, para. 26)
 applicant’s unjustified delay in signing MAS and 376.53–4
 burden/standard of proof (*Malekpour*) 322.29, 376.45
 sufficiency of time for consideration 376.48–51
 vulnerable staff members and 242.39, 246.58
Enhanced Separation Package (Staff Rule 5.09, para. 7.06) and 53.30
ex gratia payment, effect 55.21–7, 310.37
as exceptional circumstance justifying failure to comply with time limits for exhaustion of internal remedies 46.46
failure of Bank to implement in timely fashion
 as unfair treatment 467.72
 unforeseen circumstances as justification 466.46–69
finality/binding effect (*Mr. Y*) 25.25–6, 25.33, 29.15, 29.35, 29.36, 35.23, 55.25–6, 115.31–4, 130.24, 159.30–7, 310.37, 342.24, 395.21, 466.42, 467.25, 479.42–3, 479.50–2
generalized complaints relating to alleged failure of the Bank to observe Staff Principle 2.1, inclusion in waiver 425.50–2
interpretation
 evidence of negotiations, exclusion 479.51
 mediation proceedings, exclusion 479.50
 plain and ordinary language 465.33, 479.43–5, 479.51
mental capacity of applicant and **Order 1998**
modification by Bank 466.38–45
non-invocation by Bank in JGAB proceedings, effect 29.31, 35.20, 53.23
notification to Tribunal 278.1–3
nullification 342.14–15, 342.31–2
public policy considerations and 29.36–7
redundancy, parallel consideration as alleged abuse of discretion 297.51–4, 302.56
reentry guarantee
 alleged interference with attempts to find employment opportunities 342.41–3
 validity 342.33–9
removal of references to from personnel records 342.14–15, 342.31
scope of waiver (“any and all claims ... which might exist ... without limitation”) 479.44–8
 potential claims 479.47
scope of waiver (“arising out of circumstances occurring ... on or before”) 35.18–19, 35.21–3
 potential claims relating to 465.26–34

validity and enforceability, Tribunal's finding 479.49
validity of general unilateral release 53.24–9, 54.25–6, 376.58–9, 443.76–8
validity as matter for determination by Tribunal 53.23
withdrawal of application following settlement agreement 36.1–4, 37.1–4, 278.1–3

national courts

see also applicable law (other than Bank's internal law); spousal support claims, court order for support payment
allegations of interference in 443.62–8
enforcement of judgments 325.2
interpretation
“mortgage”, Bank Housing Loan repayments 325.27, 325.28–41
support orders 325.26, 325.31, 383.32–5

national criminal investigations, Tribunal's assumption of jurisdiction in matters relating to term and conditions of employment and 268.9, 268.11, 272.26

national public office

see also public office, candidacy, appointment or activity in pursuit of (Staff Rule 3.01, para. 5.02)
international organization, equivalence 242.32

nationality, discrimination based on 230.4, 248.47

appointment 217.68–75
termination distinguished 260.39
failure to substantiate allegation 214.44, 316.42

natural justice 275.37, 308.6

Net Plan: *see* Staff Retirement Plan (SRP)

Non-Regular Staff (NRS), entitlement to benefits under SRP (Staff Retirement Plan) 252.37–9, 301.21, 336.9–11

1998 changes 214.12, 231.4, 232.7, 233.4, 234.4, 235.4, 240.5, 252.37, 336.10

ex gratia exceptions on grounds of age 306.27–9

temporary staff, extension of right of participation to 214.12, 215.18–22, 215.24, 336.10

2002 changes (Schedule F) 301.9, 301.20

continuous service rule 306.5–30, 309.10–13, 309.15–33, 336.11, 336.27, 336.32–3

détournement de pouvoir/détournement de procédure, whether 306.10–26, 309.15–33

as *ex gratia* benefit 301.29

legitimate expectation and 301.23–8

date of entitlement to participation 253.32–3

express limitation to on or after 15 April 1998 231.4, 233.4, 234.4, 235.4, 252.37, 269.11

time limits for challenge to 231.7–16

ignorance of the law, relevance 270.21

long-term service, relevance 214.19–43

maternity leave and 309.28–33

“person employed ... for a specified term of one year or more” (SRP Art. 2, s 2.1(b)) 214.33–5, 215.42–4

terms of appointment as unambiguous statement of position 270.21

Non-Regular Staff (NRS), misclassification as

abuse of discretion, whether 252.23–36

expediency as basis of decision 214.23, 215.29

burden/standard of proof 233.25, 234.25, 235.25, 252.24–36

comparability of work with that of Regular Staff 214.19–26, 215.31, 252.23–36

procedure for establishing 230.12–13, 232.28, 233.30, 234.30, 235.30

retrospective evaluation 214.16, 214.18, 215.23, 215.24, 269.5–7

time limits for establishing 230.12–13, 233.23–8, 234.23–8, 235.23–8, 240.21–2, 269.2–9,

270.11–16, 298.8–15, 336.35–9
abuse of discretion in initial decision, relevance 269.7
creeping error 214.16, 215.23, 232.27, 233.23, 233.27–8, 235.23, 235.27–8
date of conversion to open-ended appointment, relevance 232.29–32
Environment Sector Board’s decision not to regularize appointment 270.14, 270.17
reasonable awareness of misclassification 232.29–32, 233.23–8, 240.18, 240.24–6, 270.11–16,
298.8–10
SRP letter referring claim to Appeals Committee, relevance 269.9, 270.15

oath: *see* witnesses

obligations of the Bank (general) (Principle 2)

see also alternative employment in case of redundancy, Bank’s obligation to assist search (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8.06); fairness, impartiality, non-discrimination and proper process (Principles 2.1 and 9.1)
policies and practices to promote environment conducive to high standards of performance (Principle 2.1(e)) 241.29
see also hostile working environment
action reinforcing applicant’s sense of isolation 217.88
assistance in adapting to Bank environment 217.54, 217.84–7, 225.22, 225.40–4
clearly defined expectations of work place behaviour 320.9, 322.8
clearly defined work program 266.44–50, 320.9, 322.8, 322.12–14, 363.25–6, 461.32–4,
464.17–25
explanation of strategy 225.22, 225.40–1
impact of work environment on performance 211.56–63, 211.78–9
obligation to provide appropriate levels of compensation/salary 301.19
standard of care towards field staff 185.20–1, 194.8, 207.35, 213.37, 244.51, 279.18, **Order 2002-21.5, 293.74, 305.66**
standard of care towards particularly vulnerable member of staff 241.39
time and care over redesign of position 254.44
promotion of harmonious relations 241.29
respect for accrued rights (Principle 2.1(c))
see also accrued leave, withhold as disciplinary measure (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 4.01(c)/para. 4.01(d)), as breach of obligation not to deprive retroactively of compensation for services already rendered (Principle 2.1(c))
benefits available at time service rendered, limitation to 301.19, 336.31
respect for the essential rights ... identified by WBAT 408.30–4
to apply Staff Rules in accordance with the letter and spirit 295.30, 343.63
to apply Staff Rules consistently 295.30, 306.14–19
to counsel staff member on options related to resignation decision 201.12–13, 201.36
to develop and articulate business plan to satisfy redundancy requirements 302.55
to establish programs and arrangements for staff training and development 321.43–52
to inform staff member of complaints against them 293.57
to inform staff members of rights of consultation and appeal 12.52, 174.8, 237.22, 238.23,
279.16–18, 280.14–15
to inform staff of US legislation affecting taxing of pension payments 78.41–6
to maintain up-to-date personal file 192.21
to make provision for retirement (Principle 6.2(d)) 301.20
to manage staff careers effectively 176.29, 200.2, 200.13, 200.19, 239.62–77, 266.25–6, 332.70,
485.62
to protect against sexual harassment: *see* sexual harassment
to protect personal privacy (Principle 2.1(a)) 243.15, 371.2–52

to provide supervision and training
 period of consideration for promotion 178.15
 probationary period 157.46–7, 157.48–9, 225.38–44, 293.43–4
to provide timely notice of any problems concerning career prospects, skills or other relevant aspects
 of work 19, 192, 188.21, 377.76, 430.80–8, 431.68–75, 450.96–101
to provide timely notice of possibility of redundancy 192.19–20, 203.12–14, 297.50–1
to respect good name and dignity 183.9, 317.38
 non-renewal of fixed-term contract and 187.18
to respond quickly to requests for clarification 295.30
to support staff member in case of professional concerns giving rise to interpersonal conflict
 211.68–70, 211.78
to support staff undergoing an Ethics Office investigation 237.22

OED: *see* Operations Evaluation Department (OED)

Office of Professional Ethics (OPE): *see* disciplinary proceedings (Staff Rule 8.01), scope of Tribunal review of (including *Carew/Mustafa/Cissé/Koudogbo* formulation); Ethics and Business Conduct, Office of (EBC); INT, general allegations of mismanagement/hostile working environment; Jennings Report into facts relating to Conthe case (Decision No. 271); preliminary inquiry (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 5.02); sexual harassment, independent investigation

Ombudsman

Note: Cases 408-423 have an identical para. 8 and 17

advice to await results of parallel appeal as justification for late application 78.34–8
attempts to obtain feedback information 254.9
attendance at Grievance Panel 408.17
attendance at performance review meeting 157.11, 157.57
Bank's disregard/rejection of advice 93.9–10, 93.20, 254.4, 362.35
Bank's follow-up action 30.10, 30.23, 85.23, 93.12, 177.11, 200.5, 209.15, 359.35, 360.6, 440.9–10
complaints to about applicant 408.8, 409.8
confidentiality and 394.27–8, 394.30
consultation with outside expert 341.51, 341.58
legal status of advice 133.35
mediation efforts 85.4, 239.19, 256.14, 319.8, 402.90, 402.94, 402.125
as member of advisory team 176.19, 254.8
reference to as basis for alleged retaliation 427.42–4, 427.53–4
reference to by applicant 51.13, 105.2, 105.9, 105.12, 105.19, 132.28, 136.8, 137.4–5, 137.12–13, 147.4, 183.3, 187.3, 194.2, 198.7, 198.11, 206.7, 206.15, 217.44, 229.8, 251.14, 251.40, 257.34, 318.12, 318.14, 318.16, 331.79, 331.81, 339.42, 353.4
Tribunal's recommendation for referral to 312.20
'unresponsive' reply to 318.18, 318.30

on-call compensation (including allegations related to due process and discrimination) 488.1–81

absence of Staff Rule/aborted attempt to establish 488.21–3, 488.27–30, 491.29
alleged discrimination 488.52–73, 488.81, 491.62–84
 comparability to other Bank staff performing on-call duties/comparator group 488.56, 488.59–62, 491.68, 491.69–72
 justifiable differential treatment, grounds 488.57–73, 491.67–84
 existence of alternative compensation for being on-call 488.70, 491.68, 491.81
 incorporation of on-call pay in salary 491.68, 491.79–80
 market survey of security officer salaries 488.67–9
 on-call duties as part of security personnel job description 488.63–6, 491.68, 491.73–8
 practice of other international organizations 488.71–2, 491.68, 491.79, 491.82–3
discretionary right of Bank to determine 488.81, 491.91
review of Bank's policy (1990-2011) 488.5–23, 488.48–51, 491.5–23

draft Staff Rule 6.24 (On-Call Compensation and Shift Differential) 488.21–3, 491.21–3
eligibility provision 491.22
as flexible tool 491.5
object and purpose 491.6, 491.60–1
On Call and Shift Differential Compensation Policy Review (2002) 488.12–21, 491.12–17
absence of records relating to 488.77
Bank practice at time of Review/effect of Review 488.49–51, 491.59
email of 4 March 2003 summarizing 488.18–19, 491.18
transparency/fairness 488.74–81, 491.29, 491.85–91
inability of Bank to explain policy or provenance of Shift Differential and On-Call Policies
document 488.77–8, 491.88–9
obligation to publish benefits to all staff regardless of eligibility 488.75, 488.81, 491.86–7,
491.91
prejudice caused by lack of 488.80–1, 491.90

Operations Evaluation Department (OED)

planned periodic reassignment 23.8, 23.13, 23.15, 23.54
role 23.5

Standards and Procedures for Operations Evaluation 23.44

optional survivor annuity 210.22, 210.25

oral proceedings (Tribunal Rule 14 [17])

at applicant's request

agreement to 253.1, 369.6, 455.2

inadmissibility of application and 175.27–8

refusal 2.intro, 2.2, 6.intro, 7.1, 18.1, 22.1, 27.1, 32.1, 34.1, 197.41, 217.1, 254.1, 341.1, 342.1,
344.1

at both parties' request 337.2

at order of Tribunal 245.1, 245.24, 448.2

cancellation at applicant's request 252.1

postponement at applicant's request 252.1, 253.1

scope and procedure 369.7

witnesses, refusal of request for hearing of 11.intro, 34.1, 271.42

oral statements (Tribunal Rule 12(3)) 309.1

overtime work (Staff Rule 6.03)

ex gratia compensation 328.55–6

fraudulent claims 142.2–46, 143.2–42

prior authorization requirement (para. 2.02) 327.34, 328.16, 328.28–35, 328.54–6

staff member's obligation to ensure compliance 328.56

work performed on Bank Group premises requirement 143.25–30

Package A/B: *see* Enhanced Separation Package (Staff Rule 5.09, para. 7.06) (Package B); Standard
Separation Package (Staff Rule 5.09, para. 9.03) (Package A)

parallelism: *see* IMF, parallelism with

Peer Review Services (PRS) (admissibility, competence and procedure)

disputed employment matter (Staff Rule 9.03, para. 2.01) 453.48

misconduct investigations, exclusion (Staff Rule 9.03, para. 6.04(d)) 448.29–30, 457.80, 478.47–8

provisional relief, exclusion 457.40–1

Peer Review Services (PRS) (decisions on requests for review) (Staff Rule 9.03, para. 11)

Bank's rejection of recommendation

to pay compensation for problems caused by lack of transparency for on-call compensation
488.29–30, 491.31–2

to perform another review of claim for resettlement benefits 460.22

to perform another SRI with new comparators 458.18–19
 designation of alternative decision-maker to decide on acceptance of panel’s recommendations (Staff Rule 9.03, para. 11.01) 458.17, 458.57–8
 rejection of recommendation 458.18–19
 notification of reasons for rejection to Applicant 458.59

Peer Review Services (PRS) as replacement for Appeals Committee (Staff Rule 9.03) 433.10, 436.15
 applicability to requests filed on or after 1 July 2009 433.10

Pension Benefits Administration Committee (PBAC)
see also Staff Retirement Plan (SRP)
 administrative nature, relevance to due process requirement 424.74–5
 composition 153.38, 177.8
 discretionary nature 153.38
 decisions, binding effect 424.47
 jurisdiction
 “any claim of any person for benefits or other payments” 214.17, 424.47
 Bank’s failure to challenge, effect 214.17–18, 215.24
 interpretation of SRP and pension entitlements (SRP Art. 10, s 10.2(f)) 230.12–13, 262.16, 263.9, 264.9, 281.6, 281.13–15, 281.17
 review of documentation and Medical Advisor’s conclusion 177.8
 reasons for decision, need for 177.37, 262.28–9, 263.6, 263.14, 264.6, 264.14
 time limits for appeal to 114.6–14

Pension Benefits Administration Committee (PBAC) decisions, appeal to Tribunal (including *Courtney (No. 2)* formulation of scope of review)
 Note: It was established in *Courtney (No. 2)* (Decision No. 153, [1996]) that when it reviews PBAC decisions the Tribunal “may examine (i) the existence of the facts, (ii) whether the conditions required by the Staff Retirement Plan for granting the benefits requested were met or not, (iii) whether the PBAC in taking the decision appealed has correctly interpreted the applicable law, and (iv) whether the requirements of due process have been observed”.

best or more effective alternative, exclusion from consideration 205.17, 400.46
 compliance with SRP conditions 153.33–8
 correct interpretation of applicable law 205.17, 358.23–46, 398.24–9, 400.28, 400.46
Courtney (No. 2) formulation 153.30, 177.12, 182.4, 265.22, 403.20
 decision of PBAC 424.49–52
 direct application by agreement of the parties (Statute II(2)(i)) 153.30, 205.11
 due process/proper exercise of discretion, allegations relating to 238.28
 Bank’s obligation to notify of rights and procedure 238.22–3, 398.27–9
 determination of capacity of spouse to manage her own affairs 358.41–5
 membership of PBAC 153.36
 PBAC procedures 358.46
 prejudice of PBAC members 153.39
 existence of facts/evaluation of the evidence 153.31–2, 177.22–35
 time limits for application (“from date of communication of the contested decision”)
 “contested decision” 114.24–43, 238.19–29
 repeated requests for reconsideration of case, effect (*Agerschou*) 114.42, 238.26–7

pension scheme rights: *see* Non-Regular Staff (NRS), entitlement to benefits under SRP (Staff Retirement Plan); severance payments; Staff Retirement Plan (SRP)

performance effectiveness plan in case of unsatisfactory performance (Staff Rule 7.01, paras. 10-11) 188.10–11, 188.14–15
see also termination for unsatisfactory performance (AMS 1.08/Staff Rule 7.01, para. 11) (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion/fairness)

failure to seek supplementary evaluation 188.19
flawed implementation 188.14–15
generalized reports making no mention of individual staff member 430.82–8, 431.70–5,
450.99–102

performance evaluation (non-OPE) (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion) 430.76–104, 471.23–43

failure to disclose material forming basis of decision 430.102, 431.89, 450.115
failure to give adequate warning of possibility of adverse decision/opportunity to respond to
430.79–88, 430.97, 430.103–4, 431.69–75, 431.90–1, 450.96–117
failure to give meaningful opportunity to comment on report 430.87, 431.74
failure to incorporate comments in report 430.87, 431.74
failure to interview 430.85, 431.74
merging of performance evaluation and other non-performance related procedures 85.62,
266.43–50, 430.89–101, 431.76–88, 450.102–14
Supplementary Performance Evaluation 250.112, 430.77–104, 431.66–91, 450.99, 450.119
failure to comply with Staff Rule 5.03 (performance evaluation) 430.103–4, 431.90–1,
450.116–17

performance evaluation (PRR/OPE/PEP) (Staff Rule 5.03, para. 2.02 [para. 2.03]) (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion/fairness)

see also discretion, limitation of Tribunal review of decisions involving to determination whether
decision an abuse (*Saberi*), performance evaluation including termination for unsatisfactory
performance (*Suntharalingam/Broemser*)
360 degree feedback procedures: *see* Jennings Report into facts relating to Conthe case (Decision
No. 271)
adequate warning of possibility of adverse decision/opportunity to respond to 3.23, 6.31–9, 23.55,
28.14, 117.36, 127.40–1, 127.45, 157.56, 188.21, 192.18–20, 198.30, 200.15, 225.37, 247.21,
248.51, 271.102, 293.45–57, 293.74, 294.36–7, 338.28–30, 434.38–44, 471.28, 471.41–2,
483.32–7
administrative review by person responsible for declaring redundancy 200.15
amendment after transmission to applicant 254.40
amendment by countersigning officer consistent with original text 199.12–13
bias/discrimination 6.27–9, 12.45–6, 117.25–38, 150.52, 156.19–20, 164.14–21, 199.12–18,
213.31–3, 299.17–18, 312.31–4, 480.46
burden/standard of proof 478.49
compliance with performance evaluation, PIP and termination procedures 256.27–9, 434.63
compliance with Performance Management Process guidelines 211.72–5, 332.49
confidential contributions from colleagues, admissibility 156.19–20, 247.20
confidentiality of personnel information (Staff Rule 2.01) and 332.39[7], 332.69, 338.27
confusion of level/competencies against which evaluation takes place 200.13
consistency of report over long period 150.42–51
consultation with line managers 27.36–9, 390.102–5
delay in completing PPR/OPE 188.20, 200.14–15, 211.74, 213.36, 332.65–8, 334.19, 390.93–6,
418.49–51, 421.42–7
frequency, exceptional circumstances 404.91
pending completion of EBC review 478.49–50
deterioration in performance rating from a previous year 72.2–65, 226.24, 322.21, 483.19
descriptive explanatory statement 226.24, 483.19–22
failure to acknowledge satisfactory work 217.63–6, 217.93
failure to check credibility of persons making allegations 28.14
failure to comply with Staff Rules 188.19–21
failure to provide appropriate assignments 152.26–7

failure to provide means to complete project 217.63–6, 217.93
failure to take into account all relevant facts for period of review 164.17–20, 189.17–21, 211.68, 338.28, 483.19, 483.27–30
failure to take into account work done in another Division 152.16–17
failure to take proper account of work environment 211.511–63
failure to undertake promised evaluation 176.21–4
fairness/impartiality 139.50–1, 211.55–78, 434.19
feedback comments
 Bank's request to Tribunal for *in camera* review 474.60
 choice of feedback providers 390.83, 390.85
 mixed assessments 483.23–6
 multi-rater process 434.27–30
 staff member's right to see comments/know identity of person providing feedback 390.83–4, 474.59–60
feedback report, right to 23.55, 271.166–84, 294.32, 314.29–30, 332.58–60, 334.19–20, 338.16–17, 338.25–7, 377.76, 439.24–7
 Bank's responsibility to take initiative 338.27
 ongoing/informal feedback 337.54, 338.25–6, 390.67–8, 434.40, 434.45–7, 462.41–56, 471.26–9
fixed-term contract: *see* fixed-term contract, renewal or extension, right to, performance evaluation and
flexibility in applying to senior staff 271.64, 271.100–1
harassment involving close monitoring of performance 199.15, 199.18
hostile working environment, effect 314.34, 322.26–7
imposition of quarterly performance reviews 199.16–18
improper motivation 27.32–3, 198.27, 211.71, 292.26–9, 313.58–62, 313.66, 332.46–57, 341.37–78, 413.42–3
inclusion of comments relating to period of administrative leave 390.80–2
inclusion of criticisms 198.31, 211.38
incomplete assessment 181.7
inconsistencies and discrepancies in reports 24.35–6, 198.28, 315.28, 315.29–34, 338.28
inconsistency between feedback comments and line manager's assessment 434.29–34
insufficiency of evidence to support assessment 175.7
interpersonal skills/personality/behaviours, importance/right to include 7.26–7, 12.43–50, 28.35–6, 147.38, 152.14–15, 176.11, 178.21, 188.9–10, 188.17–18, 322.24–5
investigation of complaint used as basis for change to work program and PPR 176.13–17
management inefficiency/irregularities, Bank's liability in case of serious impairment 28.43, 97.86–7, 200.13
Management Review Group: *see* Management Review Group (Staff Rule 4.02)
medical condition, relevance 247.17
misjudgement of applicant's abilities/mismatch between strengths and requirements of job 139.52–8, 152.29
Monitored Work Program (WPA) and 377.78–80
monitoring of performance 199.19
motivation, relevance 315.17, 315.26, 332.47, 390.54
multiple line-managers/reporting to more than one supervisor (Staff Rule 5.03, para. 2.01(D)) 480.31–2
 as optional rule 480.32
negative comments, right to include 12.49, 117.37, 332.39, 332.44
opportunity to defend himself/improve performance 10.29–30, 457.69–72, 462.53–5, 471.48–9, 480.43–5

see also probation (PMS 4.02/Staff Rule 4.02), confirmation/non-confirmation of appointment (including allegations of unfairness/breach of due process in relation to), opportunity to answer allegations/defend himself (*Samuel-Thambiah*)

participatory and inclusive nature of process 410.53, 418.47

performance management process and 332.65, 338.19–31, 377.74–6, 464.33

previous involvement of review committee members and 28.14

probationary period assessment, priority 147.51

procedure for completing 188.20

 PIP evaluation. 437.24–68

ratings definitions 480.20–1

reasonable and observable/objective basis, need for 315.23, 315.26, 390.53–74, 434.19, 434.25–37, 434.62, 439.28–45, 450.78, 464.26–32, 471.32–43, 478.49, 480.19–33, 483.15–31

 balanced report 156.20, 211.35–6, 211.56–70, 211.78–9, 332.46–57, 341.37–78, 351.39–42, 390.64, 474.47–58, 483.23–31

 “manifestly unreasonable” test 439.35–42

response to points made by applicant, desirability 85.72

responsibility for evaluation 103.40, 198.25, 198.29

Results Agreement (para. 202(c))

 need for 390.97–8

 unilateral amendments to 410.49–53, 418.42–8

retroactive application of criticism in assessment to earlier assessments in which the criticism had not figured 464.33, 464.53

Reviewing Manager’s role (review and signature of performance evaluations) (Staff Rule 5.03, para. 2.02(g)) 332.65, 471.30

selection process distinguished 247.22

severance payments on termination for incompetence, effect on 188.22

staff member’s refusal to cooperate/participate in 127.42–5, 390.58, 390.69–70, 390.75–8, 390.88–92, 390.96, 390.98–101, 404.93, 483.41, 483.43

staff member’s right to comment on 97.55–7, 150.57, 152.18, 188.20, 200.15, 211.72–5, 225.54–5, 297.41

substantiation of allegations/criticisms, need for 85.68–70, 139.51, 152.26–7, 176.13–17, 211.64–7, 217.58–62, 313.82–4, 314.19–37, 315.15–17, 315.19–37, 332.52–7, 337.39–45, 351.37–46

survey of staff attitudes, appropriateness 254.36–7

transparency, need for 24.36, 85.72, 156.20, 188.20, 439.43–5, 439.50

 confidentiality of management review meeting discussing comparative performance 480.43–5

Tribunal recommendation to reconsider procedure 271.166–84, 313.71

truncation of reporting period at staff member’s request 339.44–7

withdrawal of OPE, effect on appeal proceedings 334.17–18, 334.26–7

work program and: *see* Monitored Work Program (MWP) (including allegations relating to due process); work program/terms of reference (including allegations of due process/abuse of discretion)

written evaluation, right to 217.61–6

written records, need for 27.38

performance improvement plan (PIP) (Staff Rule 5.03, para. 3.02) (including allegations of abuse of discretion) 408.42–9, 410.42–8, 414.40–53, 434.49–54, 437.22–69

 discretionary nature 402.109

 extension to PIP (para. 3.02(a)), failure to follow proper procedures 337.42–5, 337.51–9, 341.34, 341.79–83, 414 dissenting opinion.14, 414.450

 failure to clarify existence of PIP 434.50, 434.53

 imposition of PIP in absence of reasonable and observable/objective basis 434.19, 434.52, 434.62

 imposition of PIP on basis of information not seen by applicant 256.18

compensation, training funds and cost as remedy 256.18
 imposition of PIP following predominantly positive performance 483.47
 imposition of PIP following unsatisfactory MWP 377.70–80
 improper influence and 256.21–30, 408.47–8
 improper motivation and 408.46–8, 410.45–8, 414.43–6, 421.42–52
 interference by senior management in line-manager functions 256.21–30
 management problems 341.74–7
 mediation of 256.14
 performance evaluation, interrelationship 432.38, 434.49–54
 PIP evaluation, need for reasonable and observable/objective basis 437.24–68
 reassignment within a vice-presidential unit (Staff Rule 5.01, para. 2.04) as alternative to, exclusion 471.44–9
 record of performance/feedback (para. 3.02(c)) 178.15, 257.16–17, 257.41, 257.58, 332.61–8, 337.51–9, 437.59–65
 responsibility for deciding on/informing staff member 483.45–7
 retaliation, allegations of 152.25–6, 188.6, 188.12, 257.41, 257.53–7, 337.46–50, 402.108–28, 414.51–2
 retroactive application 37657
 as serious measure 227.40, 408.49, 410.48, 414.53, 420.52
 staff member's refusal to cooperate 432.33–40
 termination of services recommendation (para. 3.02(d))
 failure to give due consideration to PIP evaluation 437.62–5
 opportunity to respond to PIP evaluation, need for 437.66–8
 right of staff member to comment on evaluation prior to 341.87–90
 time limits for decision on 341.91
 underemployment, appropriateness in case of 227.39–40
 Volcker Report and 408.10
 Note: Decisions 408-23 have an identical para. 10
 work program/expected professional behaviors as part of 402.108–27, 437.22–4, 437.69
 written evaluation within 14 workings from end of formal PIP (para. 30.2(c)) 341.34, 341.84–90
performance improvement program/special evaluation period (PMS 4.01)
 final evaluation, need for balance 17.40
Managing People (1982) and 17.38
 mandatory requirement where termination for unsatisfactory performance under consideration 152.20–5
 performance evaluation, flexibility of arrangements for 17.35–8
 requirements 17.31–7
 responsibility for carrying out 17.39
 retaliation, allegations of 152.24–5
Performance Management Process Guidelines (1996) 211.23, 211.72–5, 332.63, 332.65, 332.67
 see also performance improvement plan (PIP) (Staff Rule 5.03, para. 3.02) (including allegations of abuse of discretion)
personal property, right to privacy 157.64–6
political activities: *see* public office, candidacy, appointment or activity in pursuit of (Staff Rule 3.01, para. 5.02)
practice of Bank as term and condition of employment (*de Merode*)
 Note: The principle that a consistent practice pursued by the Bank in the belief that it was legally obliged to do so was became an integral part of the terms and conditions of service was established in Decision No. 1 (*de Merode*) the relevant section of which has been regularly quoted with approval in subsequent cases. These references are not included in the index which focuses on examples of the application of the principle and its occasional reformulation.

belief in legal obligation to observe/consistency of practice, need for 1.23, 1.111–12, 38.64–6, 38.72–3, 108.48
 consistency with Staff Rules, need for 98.41
 public availability of “rule”, need for 32, 382, 98.38–40
 in relation to
 communications with spouse 382.22–5, 382.29–32
 mandatory retirement age 348.24–5
 medical clearance 98.37–41
 Non-Regular Staff pension rights 214.35, 215.44, 252.37–9
 performance evaluation 418.51
 public office, candidacy, appointment or activity in pursuit of (Staff Rule 3.01, para. 5.02) 242.32
 salary review/adjustment 1.92–112, 38.6, 38.62–7, 38.79, 38.89, 39.27, 56.40, 66.26, 70.29–30, 71.30–1, 106.32, 107.24
 severance 205.27
 surviving spouse 210.13–19, 210.27
preferred status system 257.9, 257.49–52, 276.43–5
preliminary inquiry (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 5.02 [para. 4.02]) (including allegations relating to due process) 201.28–31, 304.55–71, 340.78–82, 451.21–37, 489.69–89
see also disciplinary proceedings (Staff Rule 8.01), procedure and scope (including allegations of procedural flaws/abuse of discretion); disciplinary proceedings (Staff Rule 8.01), scope of Tribunal review of (including *Carew/Mustafa/Cissé/Koudogbo* formulation)
 alleged bias 489.76–8
 alleged conflict of interests 393.44–5
 applicant’s email account, INT access to 340.82, 451.33–7
 authorized investigator 201.27–8
 as challenge to management’s decision-making authority 427.53–5
 delay in establishing 369.94, 489.84–7
 discretionary nature of decision to initiate 131.42–8, 371.41–50, 451.27
 establishment of sufficient evidence to warrant further proceedings as key function 145.9, 194.12, 201.28, 242.6, 352.15–18, 362.10–14, 362.23–7, 362.35, 397.43–5, 426.68–79, 489.72–3
 credibility issues 430.99, 431.86, 450.112, 489.79, 489.81
 as fact-finding process 426.84, 430.90, 431.86, 450.112
 prima facie case/“sufficiently credible” test 426.71–7, 451.22, 451.38–91
 selection of witnesses 426.76–7, 426.79
 substantiation of investigation distinguished 426.76
 evidential basis for initiating 340.66, 340.73, 340.77–9, 345.11–16, 352.8, 371.40–4, 393.40–3, 397.18, 426.64–7, 427.53–5, 430.90, 431.77, 451.22–7
 “reasonably sufficient” 427.55
 rumors and questionable allegations 145.8–11, 246.43, 304.57–60, 304.63, 340.78, 343.15–17, 371.42
 substantiation of allegations (*Malekpour*) 371.27–34
 unsupported evidence, use of 242.6
 failure to correct errors following notification of 352.21
 failure to interview staff member 426.101
 failure of witness to cooperate, effect 304.71
 interviewing techniques 489.82
 investigation by line manager 246.42, 246.44, 246.45–6
 presumption of innocence requirement 489.76–8
 procedure 304.56
 “reasonable investigation” test 489.80

timely notification of determination 201.29–31, 201.33, 201.37, 304.64–5, 426.69, 426.82–3
timely notification of initiation/opportunity to respond to allegations 304.65, 340.80–1, 362.23,
430.97–8, 431.84–5, 450.110–11, 451.28–32, 487.93–101
decision not to notify as reasonable exercise of discretion 451.32, 489.75
INT Standard 5.3 426.81–3
written response to unsubstantiated allegations, insistence on 246.44

preliminary measures: *see* provisional relief, request for
press (including allegations of abuse of discretion)
see also disclosure of confidential Bank documents/leaks to the press
failure to answer adverse comment 192.24–5, 384.52
failure to investigate leaks 369.96–8, 389.142–50, 389.154–5, 397.13–14, 397.38–50, 448.52,
451.90–6
notification of termination of appointment 246.55–6

presumption of innocence (including allegations of violation of principle) 206.32, 353.28–31,
362.12–30, 378.35, 381.76, 388.73, 489.76–8

prima facie case, need for/sufficiency 183.13, 183.16–17, 229.25, 269.11, 336.30–4, 336.43,
354.32–3, 355.32–3, 356.20, 367.25, 368.25–7, 402.25, 406.28–9, 443.25–6
Appeals Committee 130.14, 187.4
proceedings beyond preliminary inquiry and 426.71–7, 451.22
undertaking to provide additional evidence at merits stage 368.26, 368.30–1

Principles of Staff Employment (general)
see also individual headings such as fairness, impartiality, non-discrimination and proper process
(Principles 2.1 and 9.1); management/staff relations
adoption (1983) 38.7
object and purpose 38.7
as part of contract of employment or terms of appointment 1.25–9, 356.19, 368.23, 370.50,
426.52–5, 427.33–5

privacy: *see* anonymity of allegations; anonymity of applicant (Tribunal Rule 28); confidentiality of
contributions of colleagues to performance evaluation (OPE); confidentiality of personnel
information (Staff Rule 2.01); disclosure of personal information to outside authorities (Staff Rule
2.01, para. 5.01); email accounts, Bank’s right of access to (Information Security Policy (AMS
6.20A)) (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion); medical records,
confidentiality (Staff Rule 2.02); personal property, right to privacy

private obligations of staff members: *see* disciplinary measures (Staff Rule 8.01 [Staff Rule 3.0]),
limitation to misconduct adversely reflecting on reputation or integrity of Bank or IFC

private obligations of staff members, privileges and immunities (Principle 3.3) and: *see* immunity of
Bank, private obligations of staff members (Principle 3.3)

**probation (PMS 4.02/Staff Rule 4.02), confirmation/non-confirmation of appointment (including
allegations of unfairness/breach of due process in relation to)** 157.32, 157.44–57, 225.21–59,
271.50, 271.56–107, 314.28–41
see also Jennings Report into facts relating to Conthe case (Decision No. 271); reassignment in
context of non-confirmation of assignment at end of 2-year probation
6-month progress report (PMS 4.02/Staff Rule 4.02, para. 2.02(b)) 271.49
delay in carrying out 10.45–6, 157.50–1, 293.41–2, 293.50, 327.37–42, 351.26–36, 351.50,
351.59
applicant’s failure to provide draft OPE as requested 351.27–31
extension of probationary period following unsatisfactory report, implications 7.15–24, 10.28,
16.4–6, 16.36
failure to give adequate time to demonstrate improvement 157.55, 157.57, 225.47–50,
293.51–7, 327.43–5
flexibility of approach to 157.51, 271.100–1

non-confirmation of appointment in absence of **293.41–2**
 official and unofficial drafts **197.8**
 transfer following unsatisfactory report **197.7**
 written assessment requirement **351.26–36, 351.59, 461.36–7**
 alleged investigation by President of Bank and **271.134–9**
 applicant’s credibility in light of reaction to Jennings Report and related evidence **271.75–107**
 applicant’s omission of key material **271.70–3**
 assurance of confirmation, exclusion **351.56–7**
 assurance of extension and **225.22, 225.57–8**
Checklist for Managing Staff on Probation **271.52**
de minimis procedural failures **10.48, 30.26–8, 30.30**
 decision “at any point during or at the end of the probationary period” **225.58, 293.59**
 discretionary nature of decision (*Salle*) **7.26–7, 10.27, 31.22, 157.30, 157.44, 157.301, 225.26–7, 277.9, 293.38, 327.31, 351.58, 387.19, 461.31, 461.45**
 early non-confirmation and **225.51–6**
 entitlement to ‘all appropriate staff benefits’ **10.29**
 extension of period of probation, relevance **225.58**
 feedback opportunities **31.28–30, 157.46–7, 271.78–80, 293.74, 294.32, 327.49–50, 351.31–2**
 flexibility in case of senior staff **271.64**
 interpersonal skills/personality/behaviours **225.25–31, 271.96–104, 351.45–6**
 arbitrariness in determining **351.45–6, 351.59**
 professional/technical skills distinguished **351.43–4, 351.58**
 intervening redundancy decision **294.30–9**
 matters not essential to decision, relevance **157.38–43**
 medical condition as basis of non-confirmation **470.1–51**
 non-confirmation of appointment, motivation/undue influence **474.42–6, 474.63**
 notification of confirmation, need for **441.48, 441** (dissenting opinion).10
 notification of decisive factors in decision **157.52, 157.55**
 one-year period (Staff Rule 4.02, para. 2.02), extension **197.7, 225.22, 225.57–8**
 opportunity to answer allegations/defend himself (*Samuel-Thambiah*) **133.35–43, 147.43, 157.53, 157.54, 157.56, 225.44–6, 225.54–6, 474.38–9**
 see also performance evaluation (PRR/OPE/PEP) (Staff Rule 5.03, para. 2.02 [para. 2.03])
 (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion/fairness), staff member’s right to comment on
 opportunity to prove suitability to specific requirements of the Bank **225.36**
 purpose of probation (PMS 4.02/Staff Rule 4.02, para. 1.02) **10.27, 157.30, 225.25, 271.56–7, 327.42**
 reassignment, right of **31.31**
 requirements for disciplinary proceedings distinguished **157.35, 157.53**
 responsibility for decision not to confirm (para. 3.03) **351.54–5**
 responsibility for determination of suitability for confirmation (para. 3.02) **351.58**
 retaliation, allegations of **314.38**
 review of grounds for non-confirmation post-dating recommendation for **157.56–7**
 strict compliance with requirements, importance (*Salle*) **10.50–3, 30.28, 31.24, 133.31, 147.43, 157.32, 225.35–6, 277.6–9**
 suitability for continued employment/satisfactory performance, dependence on
 applicant’s failure to take criticisms on board **157.33, 157.37, 271.99–100**
 bias **10.54–7, 30.23–4**
 Buranavanichkit formula **7.4–30, 10.60, 12.47, 16.39–40, 28.35, 45.19–32, 157.29–30, 157.35, 157.44–57, 225.25–7, 225.35, 225.47–56, 271.56–107, 271.144, 271.166–84, 277.9, 293.38–9, 293.40, 293.41–2, 293.58, 327.31–4, 461.31, 474.37**

compliance with due process requirements 470.30–3
 conclusive evidence of weak performance 157.37, 197.83–9, 277.6–9
 experience of probationer, relevance 157.47, 461.51
 failure to take account of all relevant information 7.29
 interpersonal skills, importance 225.25–31, 271.96–104
 prejudgment on basis of previous employment 7.28
 range of skills going beyond technical competence 7.27
 suitability to specific requirements of Bank 157.34, 225.32, 293.58–72, 327.32–5, 351.58, 461.38–45
 supervision and training 10.31–44, 31.25–7, 157.46–7, 157.48–9, 225.38–44, 293.43–4, 327.36–50
 evidence of 10.36, 30.25, 45.25–7
 language training “in exceptional cases” (PMS 4.02-5) 10.38–43
 right to 10.31–44, 31.25–7, 157.46–7, 157.48–9, 225.38–44, 293.43–4, 327.36–50, 351.51–3
 suspension pending outcome of investigation into misconduct 197.15, 197.90
 tacit confirmation 271.159
 terminal performance review (Staff Rule 4.02, para. 2.02(c)) 271.49, 441 dissenting opinion.12
 ambiguity 271.152–8
 extension beyond two years, possibility of 271.152–9
 failure to allow sufficient time after interim review 157.57
 failure to complete process 157.57
 HR error in relation to, relevance in case of decision not to confirm 314.35
 Tribunal review, scope 157.29–30, 157.35–6, 157.44
 two-year period (Staff Rule 4.02, para. 2.01), interrelationship between first and second sentences 271.153–4
 undue haste in deciding not to confirm 225.55
 visa entitlement and 133.40
 warning of possibility/probability of adverse decision 5.23, 10.28, 10.50–3, 45.28–30, 133.32–4, 147.43–6, 157.56, 225.37, 293.45–57, 293.74, 351.34–5, 351.47–50, 351.59, 461.46–54
 work program/individual performance plan (Staff Rule 4.02, para. 2.01(a)) 157.45–7, 294.34, 351.22–5
procedure (appeal against administrative decision) (Staff Rule 9.03, para. 5)
 attorney, need for 280.20
 confusion over, prejudice to applicant, whether 257.69
 requirements
 agreement of Bank, relevance 296.13–14
 detail sufficient to identify and clarify basis for appeal, limitation to 279.15
procedure (independent investigator): *see* sexual harassment, independent investigation
procedure (Tribunal)
 see also admissibility; consolidation of proceedings; disclosure of documents, request for; evidence; Jennings Report into facts relating to Conthe case (Decision No. 271); jurisdiction (Tribunal); oral proceedings (Tribunal Rule 14 [17]); revision of judgment in the event of the discovery of a fact which might have had decisive influence (Statute XIII(1)); standing, requirements; stay of proceedings; time limits; withdrawal of application/mootness; witnesses
 cause of action, need for clear statement 374.23, 374.28, 377.79
 corrections to application (Tribunal Rule 7, para. 9) **Order 2000-3.2-5, Order 2002-3, 467.2**
 time limits 10.1, **Order 2000-3.3-5, Order 2002-3.2**
 dispatch of application 194.9
 form, importance 38.51
 frivolous argument/unfounded allegations (*Mahmoudi*) 219.12, 221.12, 227.31, 324.31, 332.41–2, 332.62, 342.38, 368.27, 374.28, 404.94, 456.14–17
 independent legal advice, refusal of request 222.1, 223.1, 224.1

joinder: *see* joinder/disjoinder of jurisdiction and merits

judicial nature 85.54, 211.53

late submission of documents/written pleadings 128.1, 129.1, 144.1, 331.2

precise specification of remedies sought, need for (Tribunal Rule 7) 374.18–22

proper respondent 427.36–8

rejoinder

- new facts 256.1
- right of, applicant’s non-exercise of 75.1
- time limits 139.1

reservation of application (Tribunal Rule 7, para. 11) **Order 2000-3.4, Order 2002-3.1, Order 2002-7.1, Order 2002-10.2, Order 2002-11.1, Order 2002-12.1, Order 2002-10.1, Order 2002-18.1**

Rules of Procedure

- adoption and promulgation by Tribunal (Statute VII) 426.45
- as applicable law 426.45, 427.29–31
- binding effect 426.45
- special hearing, refusal of request 219.1, 220.1, 221.1
- stay of proceedings: *see* stay of proceedings
- summary of previous proceedings relating to applicant 332.1–7
 - claims remaining for consideration by Tribunal 332.38–40
- supplementary information **Order 2002-20.1-3**

promissory estoppel: *see* assurances, evidence of

promotion as discretionary right of Bank 83.57, 131.78–9, 145.19–20, 148.29–44

- alleged assurance of 454.26–33
- alleged gender discrimination 454.34–8
- failure of applicant to challenge Bank’s repeated statements of intent in relation to 148.44
- in situ* promotion 454.34–8
- practice of Bank in relation to 148.41–3
- pre-condition assented to by applicant 148.37

proper respondent 427.36–8

proportionality: *see* disciplinary proceedings (Staff Rule 8.01), scope of Tribunal review of (including *Carew/Mustafa/Cissé/Koudogbo* formulation), proportionality of sanction/accordance with the law of the Bank (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 4.01)

provisional relief, request for

- see also* access to Bank premises, Bank’s right to impose restrictions/flag in file, as preliminary safeguard

PRS competence, exclusion 457.40–1

refusal 128.1, 257.1, 277.1, 369.5

- in case of untimely request for administrative review 237.27

requirements

- risk of irreparable harm 51.2, 52.2, 53.2, 54.2
- urgency 40.2, 41.2, 42.2, 43.2, 44.2, 45.2, 46.2, 47.2, 48.2, 49.2, 50.2

suspension of action on challenged decision pending outcome of appeal (Staff Rule 9.03, para. 7.01/Tribunal Rule 13) 157.18–22, 463.3

suspension of action on challenged decision pending outcome of PRS proceedings 457.41

public notification of termination

- appropriateness 246.55–6
- discrimination/inequality and 246.55–6
- e-mail to staff announcing applicant’s departure from Bank 276.26, 276.52–3, 277.16
- local practice 246.55–6

public office, candidacy, appointment or activity in pursuit of (Staff Rule 3.01, para. 5.02)

242.18–32
see also resignation following decision to seek or accept public office (Staff Rule 3.01, para. 5.02)
 “activity in pursuit of public office” 242.22, 242.28
 activity relating to “duties” 242.22, 242.24
 burden/standard of proof 242.31
 conflicting signals from Bank 242.32
 “decides to become a candidate” for national public office 242.21
 “other public office” 242.21
 practice of the Bank 242.32
 resignation, timing 242.21, 242.24–5

public policy, Bank’s obligation to observe 210.24

publication of decision (Rule 24)
 anonymity and 16.2, 25.2, 317.57, 332.72
 full record of case distinguished 171.12

Purchased-TAP, status implications 132.23–39

racial/ethnic discrimination
see also Dewey Ballantine investigation into treatment of African staff (1996-7) (DB); Lynk Report into treatment of African staff (1999)
 burden/standard of proof 294.16–17, 318.28, 344.43, 402.39–42, 452.48–51, 463.28
 prima facie case 402.40–8
 non-renewal of fixed-term contract 175.15, 175.17, 175.24, 175.26
 performance evaluation 199.18
 ‘Racial Equality in the Bank Group’ 344.43
 redundancy and 326.20
 redundancy decision as independent issue 303.17–19
 selection process 344.42–54, 367.76, 402.74–7, 435.47–8, 437.70–1

***ratione temporis* jurisdiction:** *see* time limits

re-employment bar (Staff Rule 4.01, para. 8.05)/no-hire flag, notification requirement 312.11–12, 370.33–6, 370.38, 370.41–4, 447.82–3
 constructive notice 370.42
 hiring/selection policy as discretionary matter 438.39
 limited time bar 370.43
 notification of reasons 447.82–3
 as reasonable and necessary precaution 370.38–9, 438.39
 removal of flags
 at Bank’s initiative 370.51
 as remedy 370.51, 492Decision

reappointment, termination of appointment other than on grounds of misconduct 242.33–5

reasonable person test, *see also* estoppel; fairness; legal/legitimate expectation

“reassignment” (Staff Rule 5.01, para. 1.03) 11.20–1, 457.43

reassignment as alternative to termination: *see* termination for unsatisfactory performance (AMS 1.08/Staff Rule 7.01, para. 11) (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion/fairness), reassignment as alternative

reassignment at Bank’s initiative (Staff Rule 5.01, para. 2) (including allegations of abuse of discretion) 411.49–53
 as disciplinary measure 430.67–76, 431.58–65, 450.84–92
 confusion of terminology 430.72–3, 430.76, 431.63
 disciplinary measure distinguished 28.38–9
 failure to take all relevant factors into account including positive performance assessment 430.74–5, 450.91–2

use of flawed OPE 430.75
“when the interests of the Bank Group require it” (para. 2.03) 411.53, 430.68–76, 450.84, 450.92

reassignment on basis of unsatisfactory performance (including allegations of abuse of discretion/failure to follow due process)
failure to take due account of performance evaluation 338.40–50, 338.57–60
transparency, importance 338.50, 471.48

reassignment in context of non-confirmation of assignment at end of 2-year probation
as abuse of discretion 271.140–60
as demotion, relevance 271.144
text of letter proposing 271.38

reassignment following redundancy (Staff Rule 5.01) (including allegations of abuse of discretion)
see also alternative employment in case of redundancy, Bank’s obligation to assist search (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8.06)
applicable rules 161.31, 162.31
reassignment support, obligation to provide 185.20–1, 493.52–4
transparency requirement 326.42–57
unreasonable exercise of discretion 185.22–5

reassignment (PMS 4.04) (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion in search for alternative position)
Bank’s failure to identify alternative position despite “best efforts” 12.51, 24.30
candidate on probation and 31.31
as “censure” 23.47
conditional retention, fairness 27.35
fairness of procedure 23.40–3
“forced placement” 11.21, 23.56
increased effectiveness in job as objective 5.27, 12.51
interests of the Bank and 5.27, 12.51, 23.42–8
language skills as “overriding factor” 23.49–50
limited duty of Bank in regard to 5.27, 27.34
non-referral of disagreement to Vice President, AOP 11.22, 11.24, 11.26–7
outplacement assistance as part of termination package 11.5, 11.7, 21.32
performance evaluation reports, relevance 23.51–4
“planned periodic reassignment” (OED non-managerial staff) 23.8, 23.13, 23.15, 23.54
qualification for position as essential requirement 5.27, 24.31
“reassignment” 11.20–1
reassignment panels
 role and composition 23.8–9
 suitability for OED staff 23.12–13, 23.41–3
rejection of candidate without interview or written reasons 11.6, 11.25
relevant factors for purpose of (general) 23.45–6
sole candidate obligation 11.22–3
tourism projects, memorandum on staff implications of phasing out (14 February 1978) 11.17–30, 18.22, 19.19, 20.19

reassignment within the department to non-managerial position (Staff Rule 5.01, para. 2.05) (including allegations relating to abuse of discretion/due process) 254.29–47
anonymity of allegations 254.34–5
assessment of skills and 254.29–31
business reasons for 434.58–61
Dewey Ballantine investigation into treatment of African staff (1996-7) (DB) and 254.33–5
discretionary nature 434.58–61
failure to take into account positive performance assessments 189.17–21, 211.68

false denial to candidate of staff complaints as reason for reassignment 254.40
responsibility for reassignment (Staff Rule 5.01, para. 2.05) 254.31
retaliation, allegations of 254.26–8, 254.46
training/opportunity to prove managerial competence as alternative 28.15–16

reassignment within a vice-presidential unit (Staff Rule 5.01, para. 2.04) (including allegations relating to abuse of discretion/due process) 457.42–72
as alternative to performance improvement plan (PIP), exclusion 471.44–9
discretionary nature 457.44, 471.46, 471.48
interests of Bank as prime consideration 457.68
legitimate and fair decision based on business reasons 457.62, 457.63
opportunity to defend himself/improve performance. 471.48–9
transparency, importance 471.48

reassignment/restructuring in interests of Bank including reassignment under Staff Rule 5.09
see also selection process (appointment/reassignment) (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion/fairness)
abuse of discretion/unfairness, allegations of 81.3–22, 88.3–25, 92.23–7, 100.12–66, 239.48–9, 239.63–77
Bank’s training obligations and 84.36–45, 94.48, 100.57–8, 101.35, 101.43, 101.45, 101.47
on basis of business need 328.49–50
criteria for termination distinguished 90.39
discretionary nature 227.45, 239.48–9, 239.56–61, 239.74–6, 328.49–50, 329.28, 457.44
job grading procedures (Staff Rule 5.09, para. 8), procedural irregularities/alleged misgrading 92.20–33
reassignment on hardship grounds 227.7, 227.46–51
reassignment to post considered by applicant as unsatisfactory 23.44–59, 239.60–1, 239.65–77

record-keeping: *see* staff records (Staff Rule 2.01)

redesign of position: *see* redundancy consequent on redesign of position (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8.02(c))

reduction in number of positions: *see* redundancy consequent on reduction in number of positions (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8.02(d))

redundancy, classification of grounds for (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8.02)
change of classification in case of deferred redundancy 200.8–12
clarification of nature of applicant’s position, need for 260.28–9, 260.31–3
compensation for Bank’s failure 260.36, 260.56
identity of Bank’s obligations under paras. 8.02(b) and (c) 260.35
importance of correct classification (*Arellano/Aziz*) 161.31, 162.31, 191.19, 367.63
notification of, need for 297.49
overlap 185.17–18, 241.26, 260.34–6, 273.34, 326.29–34

redundancy consequent on abolition of organizational unit (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8.02(a))
156.13–15, 326.20, 326.23–34
“in the interests of efficient administration” requirement 156.13
Realigning the Provisions of Support Services and 161.10, 161.27–37, 162.8–10, 162.27–37
reassignment of staff, applicable rules 161.31, 162.31, 326.23–31
redistribution of tasks to other members of unit, relevance 156.14–15
selection process, need for transparency 326.34

redundancy consequent on abolition of position or change in job requirements (general issues) (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8) (including allegations relating to abuse of discretion/failure to observe due process/fairness) 165.2–27, 166.19–22, 181.2, 191.23–7, 227.35–53, 248.24–6, 248.30–42, 254.41–4, 256.5
applicability to open-ended, term, regular or local staff regular appointments (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8) 482.55
appointment of inappropriately qualified person to new post 303.15–16

arbitrary abolition of specific position 347.28–37
arbitrary reclassification of position 203.7
assurances of protection against redundancy and 156.18, 260.40–2
bias/discrimination 185.19, 191.10–22, 226.14, 226.25–32, 241.28–32, 292.42–5, 292.76–9, 482.51
 age 165.2, 165.11, 165.20, 192.23, 203.17, 297.48, 493.61–2
 gender 297.48
 race 326.20
burden/standard of proof 85.57, 93.61–2, 292.54–7, 292.74
 inconsistency of decision with Bank policy 294.24–5
change of classification 200.8–9
discretionary nature of decision 185.11, 185.14, 191.9, 192.11, 200.19, 226.26, 227.24–7,
 241.30–1, 248.28, 266.29, 273.27, 273.49, 292.46–53, 292.64, 302.23, 328.49, 331.47,
 347.31, 372.32–7, 482.43, 482.45, 493.34, 493.36
 selection process 292.65–75, 292.79
 training/development assignment, relevance 168.29
early notification of possibility of, desirability 192.19–20, 203.14, 260.50, 261.41–4, 294.36–7,
 303.20–1, 347.46–7, 357.42–4, 482.55
failure to consider for lower-level position 302.5
failure to establish work program for new position 200.16, 266.44–50
failure to follow correct procedure 493.58–60
failure to keep written record of evaluation process 241.34–7, 273.70
failure to notify applicant of reassignment efforts 347.43–6
failure to provide timely notice of possibility of 192.19–20, 203.12–14, 297.50–1, 347.38–47,
 357.61, 372.51–7
failure to provide training to improve skills 100.57–8, 168.26–7, 248.51, 303.21, 321.75, 493.40–3
failure to record in writing each step in the process 181.14, 192.74–5
failure to respect time limits 203.11
failure to secure appropriate approval for decision (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8.03) 169.15–16, 178.22,
 181.9–13, 191.23–7, 192.8–11, 227.27–56, 292.42–5, 297.47
 failure to consider applicant for post due to become vacant shortly after completion of
 redundancy process 302.49–51
 failure to find alternative employment, relevance 297.30
 previous comparable problem, relevance 192.22
 retaliation 203.9–10, 308.7, 308.9
 selection for redundancy 169.16–17, 191.10–22, 260.52, 261.30–3, 292.26–9
 subsequent transfer of staff to unit 308.7–8
failure to treat termination because of abolition of post as redundancy (*détournement de procédure*)
 482.64
improper application of Staff Rules, efforts to assist applicant, relevance 292.60–4
improper motive, weight accorded to extraneous factors 266.44–7, 266.51
intention, relevance 248.38–9, 266.33
“in the interests of efficient administration” (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8.02) 482.43–7
 alleged failure to observe as abuse of discretion/improper motive 156.11–13, 161.36–8,
 162.36–8, 169.10–15, 191.8–22, 200.4–7, 200.19, 203.3–6, 302.27–54, 372.48–50
 budgetary considerations 227.47–9, 302.49–51, 302.55, 303.9–12
 “efficiency” 185.14
 genuine business reason requirement 363.18–24, 372.36, 493.35–9
 new work strategies 185.14, 192.10–11, 302.28–32, 302.54–5
 see also under separate “redundancy” headings
misclassification of grounds for redundancy 161.27–35, 162.27–35, 168.25–7, 192.16–17, 200.8–9,
 227.16, 241.24–6, 260.27–36, 297.29

mutually agreed separation agreement, parallel negotiation 297.51–4, 302.56

notification of precise Staff Rule on which decision based, right to 248.36–9, 260.27, 260.35–6, 482.60–3

notification in writing of decisions and reason for it, right to (Staff rule 7.01, para. 8.04/Principle 7.1(b)) 90.42–3, 347.6–7, 347.46–7, 482.53–69, 482.109

obligation to provide actual reason 248.24

personal position, relevance 200.10

probationary period and: *see* probation (PMS 4.02/Staff Rule 4.02), confirmation/non-confirmation of appointment (including allegations of unfairness/breach of due process in relation to), intervening redundancy decision

procedural flaws 241.34–7, 273.70, 292.36–41

procedural legitimacy 292.70–5

“provided no vacant position ... exists ... for which the Staff Member is ... eligible” (Principle 7.1(iii)) 90.30–2, 113.36, 321.65–7, 367.55–75, 464.51
see also alternative employment in case of redundancy, Bank’s obligation to assist search (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8.06)

racial/ethnic discrimination, as independent issue 303.17–19

redistribution of tasks to other members of abolished unit 156.14–15, 203.7, 294.29

rescission of redundancy decision, as remedy 248.50, 256.5, 274.7

responsibility for decision (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8.03) 191.23–7, 273.58–9, 493.60
 Sector Board, consultation with 297.44–5, 321.71–3, 331.58–9, 331.62

retaliation
 redundancy decision 181.9–13, 185.14, 185.15–16, 185.19, 203.9–10, 273.60–8, 308.7, 308.9, 347.35–7, 357.34–45
 redundancy threat 313.40
 rescission of redundancy decision 181.2, 181.9–13, 254.26–8, 254.46

rules governing, need for greater clarity 156.7

separation at the initiative of the Bank when position no longer necessary or staff member no longer qualified to meet changed requirement (Principle 7.1(b)) 88.25, 90.30–2

Severance Review Group (SRG) procedures 326.35–41

special leave/severance payments 222.3–4, 222.6–16, 223.6–16, 224.6–16
see also Rule of 50; special leave (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 13)

termination for unsatisfactory performance distinguished (*Jassal*) 100.31, 101.32, 128.34–6, 152.28–33

transparency, need for 241.33–7, 248.28, 260.20, 266.50, 273.27, 292.49, 292.63, 302.24, 302.30–55, 326.34, 331.47, 357.57–62, 372.33, 372.44, 372.47, 405.31

underemployment as basis for decision 227.25–8, 248.41, 294.18–23

unfairness
 failure to consult appropriately 303.20, 303.22
 treatment following redundancy 161.43, 162.43, 185.22–5

voluntary departure distinguished 255.46

redundancy consequent on abolition of post (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8.02(b)) (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion/fairness) 185.8, 331.13–17, 331.22–3, 331.42, 331.47–56, 347.28–56

“abolition of set of functions” requirement 347.32–3

appointment of another member of staff to carry out some of the tasks of “abolished” position 274.6, 294.29

clear and effective work program for new/revised position 266.44–50, 322.12–14, 363.25–6

comparability of new and old positions 165.23–6, 185.17–18, 294.26–8, 482.48–9
 burden/standard of proof 331.51, 331.61

educational qualifications, relevance 26.37–8

illness, obligation to delay redundancy on grounds of 331.26–8, 331.42
 budgetary considerations 303.9–12
 as response to problems associated with a single job 266.32
 “in the interests of efficient administration” requirement 161.28, 161.36–7, 162.28, 162.36–7,
 165.22–6, 178.19, 200.19, 226.14, 226.25–7, 260.30, 266.29–33, 294.18–25, 363.15–24,
 367.61, 367.63, 464.34–43
Managing Staff in a Demand Driven Environment — Guidance to Managers, alleged breach
 260.53–4
 open-ended appointment, conversion to in knowledge of likely redundancy 321.32–8
 performance evaluation, relevance 266.23–5, 266.29–50, 464.40, 464.44–8, 482.49
 failure to provide opportunity to answer allegations relating to performance 266.43–9, 266.51
 redesign of position (para. 8.02(c)) distinguished 168.26, 192.16–17
 reduction of positions (para. 8.02(d)) distinguished 161.31, 162.31, 168.26, 185.18, 200.8–9,
 260.20, 464.41
 review by Tribunal of process leading to decision 464.49–52
 skills-mix considerations 168.26–7, 192.12–17, 331.22
 specialized nature of original functions 321.39–42
 “specific position” 367.63–6
 strategy changes (*Rural Development: From Vision to Action* (1996)) 260.30
 unwillingness of applicant to adapt to changing requirements 363.18–24
 volunteers, Bank’s right to seek 303.14

redundancy consequent on redesign of position (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8.02(c)) (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion/fairness) 248.24, 254.20–4
 clear guidelines for redesigned position/identification of changed requirements, need for 100.34–5,
 178.23, 227.42–5
 creation of new position distinguished 128.37–8
 criteria for determining eligibility of incumbents for new job 178.20
 ex post hoc rationalization, exclusion 227.27, 227.36–52, 248.30–8, 248.51, 261.35–9
 broad view, need for 192.10
 “in the interests of efficient administration” requirement 178.19, 191.8, 191.10–22, 192.8–11,
 192.16, 227.25–7, 248.28, 248.30–5, 261.30–2
 new job description, right to see 248.31–4, 248.39, 248.51
 notification of process to staff member concerned, need for 85.63–5
 opportunity to apply for redesigned position 261.40–4
 parallel APR process as breach of fairness/due process 85.65–6
 possibility of using abilities and experience elsewhere in the Bank Group (“fungibility”)(para.
 8.03(b)), relevance 191.17–20
 “redesign” as formal requirement 85.62
 explanation of grounds for redundancy, need for 85.62
 rescission of redundancy decision, relevance 85.66, 254.24–6, 254.42–3
 skills-mix considerations 226.27–31, 227.24–52, 241.25, 248.44–6, 261.35–9
 alleged bias in selection process 100.29, 100.46, 100.52–8, 169.15–19, 178.22, 226.29–31
 comparison with colleagues and 191.19, 241.33–8
 conflicting evidence 248.46
 consistently positive performance evaluations, relevance 100.29–61
 discretionary nature 192.13, 226.28, 459.35
 explicit link to redesign of position, need for 85.63–4
 performance evaluation, relevance 178.16–22, 226.29, 248.24
 work programs process, misuse 248.45
 underemployment as justification 227.45–8, 248.40–2

redundancy consequent on reduction in number of positions (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8.02(d)), factors

to be taken into account (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8.03) 185.6–7, 241.25–7, 241.30
see also alternative employment in case of redundancy, Bank’s obligation to assist search (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8.06)
 applicant’s previous role 273.44–9, 273.70
 appointment of another member of staff to carry out some of the tasks of “abolished” position 185.12–13
 existence of volunteers 181.14, 273.55–7, 297.46, 303.14, 372.45–6
 late call for 292.75
 limitation of search to same professional team, whether abuse of discretion 273.56–7
 obligation to accept offer, whether 297.46
 “in the interests of efficient administration” requirement 169.10, 169.15, 181.5, 185.7, 185.12–14, 200.19, 203.3–6, 241.30, 292.51, 297.25–8, 302.25–55, 357.32, 357.36–45
 budgetary considerations 185.14, 292.54–64, 302.49–51, 302.55
 new work strategies 302.28–32, 302.54–5
 managerial discretion 273.71, 297.26–8, 308.8
 performance of staff members (para. 8.03(a)) 166.21–2, 181.14, 273.37–49, 292.31–5, 292.50–2, 292.54–60, 292.64, 297.42, 357.46–56, 357.63–6, 372.38–42
 comparison with colleagues 292.46–53, 292.57–8, 297.32–40, 357.48–54, 357.66, 372.38–42
 promotion of candidate for redundancy during or shortly after completion of redundancy process and 302.35–48, 302.52–3
 possibility of using abilities and experience elsewhere in the Bank Group (“fungibility”) (para. 8.03(b)) 191.17–20, 273.50–4, 292.31–5, 292.74, 297.43–5, 302.36, 302.44, 302.47, 357.54–6, 372.24, 372.43–4
 redundancy for reasons other than reduction in number of posts distinguished 191.19
 reduction of professional staff performing similar services within a team, applicability to 273.31–5, 321.42
 redundancies at same level as evidence of correct classification 297.29
 right of appointment to remaining post, comparability of original and new post 196.17–27
 selection process, need for transparency 326.34, 357.57–62
 skills-mix considerations (para. 8.03) 169.16–17, 241.25, 273.48–9, 302.31, 303.15–16
reentry, right to/assurance of
 see also consultancy appointments; reinstatement as remedy (Statute XII(1))
 development assignment and 168.28, 181.8–13
 external service (Staff Rule 5.02, para. 4.01) and 168.28, 368.34–46, 384.44–5
 leave without pay (Staff Rule 6.06, para. 6.03) and 168.28, 421.48, 421.50–1, 435.50–1
 conditional reentry 435.58
 redundancy severance package, acceptance on false assumption of 173.20–1
references on a personal basis (Staff Rule 2.01, para. 5.06) 428.36
 generic reference, recommendation for 428.38–9
 MOU provision for 428.36–9
regrading of position: *see* Job Grading Program (1982)/implementation (Staff Rule 5.09); review of assignment of grade at staff member’s request (Staff Rule 6.05, Section 3)
regression analysis, refusal to provide, abuse of discretion/fairness 245.25–30, 245.34–8, 245.49–56
regularization of Non-Regular Staff (NRS)/conversion of fixed-term contract (Staff Rule 4.01, para. 7 (pre-1998)), assurances relating to
 alleged failure to honor 209.2–22, 247.12–23, 316.28–45
 as breach of contract 209.20
 authority to give 209.9–10, 209.20
 conditional assurance 103.25–8
 as decisive element in acceptance of contract 209.8
 evidence of 103.25–8, 209.6–8

“meets the requirements of the position” condition 16.38
performance evaluation, relevance 209.11–19, 209.21–2

regularization of Non-Regular Staff (NRS)/conversion of fixed-term contract (Staff Rule 4.01, para. 7 (pre-1998)) (including allegations of abuse of discretion)
see also fixed-term contract, renewal or extension, right to
Note: Staff Rule 4.01, para. 7, amended in November 1991, governed regularization of NRS from 1986 to July 1998

applicant’s failure
to apply for suitable vacancies 215.37–9
to challenge decision 214.31, 215.36, 215.40
to take opportunity to convert 214.5–11, 214.27–32

burden/standard of proof 253.27–8

criteria (including 1991 memorandum)
adoption of new policy 214.38, 215.10, 215.47, 252.14, 253.15–16
appropriate skills 215.31–4, 253.22–6
continuing requirement for the work 253.22–6
efficient and effective functioning of institution 316.44
failure to comply with 253.25–8
four years continuous service in same job 252.16–20, 253.20–1
fulfillment, entitlements/bank obligations consequent on 252.16, 253.19, 253.25–8
performance record/staffing needs 252.21–2

de facto/implied regularization 16.37, 214.33–5, 215.42–4

definition (Staff Rule 4.01, para. 2.01) 132.35, 253.6

discretionary nature of decision 209.20–2, 252.16, 253.19, 253.25, 316.43

failure to consider regularization despite fulfillment of requirements 253.28, 253.32–3

performance evaluation and 103.25–39

refusal
as “adverse decision” 233.19–28, 234.19–28, 235.19–28
clarity of reasons, need for 209.16–19

rigorous application of contract, need for 252.40–1

selection on competitive basis against qualified external candidates (Staff Rule 4.01, para. 7.01)
257.49–52
limited opportunities in relevant field 215.9–16
“preferred candidate” system 257.9, 257.49–52, 276.43–4

successive temporary contracts 214.5

reinstatement as remedy (Statute XII(1)) 369.100, 369 Decision, 372.62–3
see also compensation as alternative to rescission or specific performance (Statute XII)

assignment to post of comparable responsibility 239.34, 317.8, 317.15, 317.26–7, 329.2–24, 369 Decision

in case of misconduct 244.75

clarification of Tribunal decision relating to 469.7–8

conditionality 131.10, 131.69, 380 Decision

consultation and accommodation, need for 469.8, 469.39

difficulty of implementing 267.15, 317.8, 329.15, 469.9–23, 472.11–13
mediation 469.18–23

discretion 469.8

dissatisfaction with implementation of Tribunal decision 267.6–16, 317.1–58, 329.1–24, 469.1–42
burden of proof 472.39–40
exhaustion of internal remedies requirement 469.8, 469.37–42
résumé of Bank’s efforts to identify suitable post/negative response of applicant 472.15–34

improper declaration of redundancy 227 Decision, 248 Decision

improper reassignment to non-managerial position **189** Decision
retroactive **246.15**
special treatment, exclusion **317.8, 329.13–16**
temporary **274.7**
termination as disproportionate sanction for misconduct **448.83, 448** Decision, 455. Decision
unsuitability of applicant for **12.43–4**
“when practical” **372.63**

relocation grant (Staff Rule 6.17, para. 3), recoverability of hotel costs 449.42–63
authorization to move to hotel distinguished from agreement to meet costs **449.63**
Bank’s alleged failure to complete work on house in timely manner **449.58–62**
staff member’s contributory negligence **449.58–62**
Rule pre- and post-1 October 2008
applicability **449.46–57**
comparison of texts **449.46–57**

relocation of operations to Paris, Bank’s right 239.76
obligations to staff **239.76**

remedies (miscellaneous)
see also alternative employment in case of redundancy; compensation for; declaratory judgment, possibility of; reinstatement as remedy (Statute XII(1)); removal of documentary material from file/amendment as remedy; rescission of contested decision relating to

additional salary payment **242.17**
administrative leave with pay **239.34**
applicant’s misconduct, relevance **244.74–6, 489.89**
appointment to suitable post **242.17**
assistance in finding new post **338.68, 338** Decision
bridging for retirement benefits purposes **200.19**
change of medical records procedures **239.44–5**
compensatory leave **328.56**
competence of Tribunal, limitations **324.34**
consultancy appointments following payment of severance, confirmation and extension of authorization **159.42, 173.10**
correction and amendment of medical records **239.34, 239.45, 239.46**
discretionary nature **172.7**
discrimination/inequality of treatment, relevance **239.45**
ex gratia payment **180.13, 180.14, 192.7, 328.55–6**
facilitation of accommodation arrangements for disabled persons **467.71**
feedback, recommendation for **164.4**
financial compensation **239.34**
grandfathering **173.10**
independent salary review **354.8–12**
job audit **69.7–14**
merit salary adjustment **172.3, 239.34**
new investigation **246.57**
new SRI review **463.40, 463** Decision
non-recording of termination of employment as being for misconduct **492.58, 492** Decision
open/generic letter of reference **428.39, 428** Decision
past pension credit **246.15, 309.33, 309** Decision
payment of legal costs, *see also* costs
prejudice to applicant, relevance **217.81, 217.82, 239.45, 239.46, 239.47, 276.53, 277.16**
production of documents necessary for preparation of applicant’s defense **272.33, 272** Decision
reappointment following resignation **239.75, 242.41**

reassignment to position that would restore career and reputation 172.4, 172.7
 recognition of right to participate in SRP and assistance in meeting obligations 253.32–3
 reinstatement of workers' compensation claim 228 Decision
 release of suspended pension payments 424.70, 424 Decision
 reopening of investigation into allegation of sexual harassment 197.36
 request to Bank for efforts to support staff member's career advancement 485.62
 retraction notice 246.15
 retrieval of applicant's property 369.102
 review of Bank handling of job applications from staff declared redundant 260.22
 salary comparison result, notification to applicant 463 Decision
 setting of time limit for completion of investigation 353.41, 353 Decision
 special leave, revision of start date 196.11
 symbolic contribution to costs 271.181–5
 termination of spousal support deductions from salary pending clarification 325 Decision
 training 226.14, 256.18
 transitional arrangements for staff adversely affected by changes to SRP 265.32
 Tribunal decision as 447.132
 inclusion in file 366 Decision, 369 Decision
 voluntary redress 239.64
 waiver of restriction on re-employment following redundancy 405.37, 406.8
 waiver of time limit for seeking free-lance work with Bank 178.15
removal of documentary material from file/amendment as remedy
 adverse comments 12.43–50, 164.4, 172.3, 315.16, 315.34
 AER and accompanying memoranda 139.17
 amendment to Performance Record 175.7–8
 Appeals Committee report 105.58
 documents from Management Review Record 209 Decision
 flag from file 242.40, 242 Decision, 243.28, 243 Decision, 370.51, 370 Decision
 investigation report 105.58, 145.21, 145 Decision, 369 Decision, 492 Decision
 memoranda relating to redundancy decision 317.23
 memoranda relating to SRI 338.62–3, 338 Decision
 memoranda relating to termination of PIP 337.68, 337 Decision
 memorandum recording ban on re-employment by Bank 345.17
 misconduct decision 492.58, 492 Decision
 notice of performance improvement 172.3
 references to MAS 342.14–15, 342.31
 references to PIP placement 408.36–7, 408.43, 408.49, 410.48, 414.53, 414 Decision, 420.42,
 483.48, 483 Decision
 references to SRI rating 434.20, 471 Decision
 replacement of draft PPR 192.6, 211.39, 211.72
 reprimand and warning 131.75
 tax data 32.57, 32 Decision
 unproven/rejected allegations of misconduct 28.15, 366 Decision, 369 Decision
 written reprimand 131.10–11
**reorganization and restructuring of Bank (1987)/Staff Rule 5.09 (1987), background and Staff
 Association challenge to 40.5–88**
 see also Enhanced Separation Package (Staff Rule 5.09, para. 7.06) (Package B);
 reassignment/restructuring in interests of Bank including reassignment under Staff Rule 5.09;
 Standard Separation Package (Staff Rule 5.09, para. 9.03)
reorganization and restructuring of INT, improper motivation 415.41–3
reprisal: see retaliation (including Staff Rule 8.01, para. 3.02)

reputation of applicant, damage to: *see* compensation for, damage to career prospects and reputation

reputation of Bank: *see* disciplinary measures (Staff Rule 8.01 [Staff Rule 3.0]), limitation to misconduct adversely reflecting on reputation or integrity of Bank or IFC

res judicata: *see* finality of Tribunal decision/*res judicata* (Statute XI)

rescission of contested decision relating to

see also compensation as alternative to rescission or specific performance (Statute XII); disciplinary measures (Staff Rule 8.01 [Staff Rule 3.0]), rescission of decision

bar on employment following a finding of misconduct 105.55, 242.17, 242.33–5, 242.40

demotion 28.48, 28 Decision, 131.10

hardship allowance 184.21

ineligibility for hiring order 366 Decision

Job Grading Program decisions 56 Decision, 66 Decision, 70.27, 70 Decision, 71.28, 71 Decision, 73.43, 73 Decision, 74.52, 74 Decision

non-appointment to post remaining vacant following 1987 Reorganization 101 Decision, 100.61–2, 100 Decision, 101.51

non-confirmation of appointment 197.97

OPE/INT investigation report 145.17, 145. Decision, 242.40, 242 Decision, 304.72, 304 Decision

OPE/INT misconduct memorandum 145.17, 145 Decision, 242.40, 242 Decision

PBAC decision relating to disability pension 177.35, 177 Decision, 182.19

performance evaluation report/PPR 131.76–7, 164.22

performance evaluation report/PPR/PEP 434.20

reassignment to non-managerial position 190 Decision

grounds for refusal of request for 430.105

reconsideration by Bank following new performance assessment 431.93

redundancy decision 165.27, 200.19, 227 Decision, 248.50, 248 Decision, 274.7

reorganization of INT 417.50

restitutio in integrum principle 131.66–82

retaliation, whether 254.26–8, 254.46

salary award based on flawed PPR/PEP 164.22, 434.20

salary award below applicant's expectations 34.2–25

salary award in breach of Staff Principle 5(1)(f) 66 Decision

substitution of decision less favorable than the contested decision, exclusion 254.46, 256.18, 256.23, 256.25

Supplementary Performance Evaluation 430.106, 430 Decision, 431.93, 431 Decision, 450.119, 450 Decision

termination for misconduct 142 Decision, 143 Decision, 158.44, 304.72, 304 Decision, 369.100, 369 Decision, 380.42–3, 380 Decision, 455 Decision

withhold of accrued annual leave entitlement 305.74, 305 Decision

resettlement benefits (Staff Rule 7.02)

90-day time limit following termination (PMS 6.05) and 14.55–8 components

costs of preparations for move 460.20, 460.44

costs of resettlement 460.20

excluded payments 460.35

one-way Bank Group-provided travel 460.33

shipment or Optional Removal Grant 460.33

definitions (Staff Rule 7.02, para. 1.03)

exclusion where staff member already resident in place of resettlement 478.33, 478.34

“place of resettlement” 460.33

“resettlement” 460.33

disability pension (SRP 3, s 3.4) and 204.2–13, 204.19

duplication of benefits (Staff Rule 7.02, para. 10.05) 260.1–59
Information/Benefits Upon Ending Employment Memorandum (19 May 2010) 460.7–8,
 460.35, 490.33
 mixing and matching 460.58
 text 460.37
 UN Assignment Grant, whether 460.16–17, 460.20, 460.43–54
 fair and proper process requirement 460.21, 460.22
 notification to staff member affected, alleged shortcomings 460.56–7
 “reasonable assistance to staff members who resettle” as purpose (State Rule 7.02, para. 1, 01)
 460.33

resignation following decision to seek or accept public office (Staff Rule 3.01, para. 5.02) 242.2,
 242.18–25, 242.33–5
 applicant’s decision not to proceed with termination and 21.32
 reappointment, right of 242.33–5

resignation (general) (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 2)
 Bank’s obligation to counsel on options/implications 201.32–6, 247.5, 247.25
 Bank’s right to reject and terminate for cause/misconduct (para. 2.02) 378.30, 378.59
 dissatisfaction with performance evaluation as ground 201.12–13, 201.34
 duress as ground 201.34
 legal consequences 201.36, 239.71–7, 242.41
 resignation in protest 239.71, 239.77, 338.66, 393.58

resources, lack
 failure to undertake ethics investigation and 246.46
 as ground for redundancy 227.47–9

responsibility of Bank/IFC for acts of
 IMF in relation to Joint Bank/IMF Library 447.105, 447.108–9
 INT 427.36–8
 Staff Association 384.49–50
 staff member acting within apparent authority 159.37, 209.10, 209.20
 staff member acting without authority 384.47–8

responsibility of staff member
 in absence of conclusive proof of fault and causation 430.105
 diffused responsibility, problems arising from 430.84, 430.105, 431.71, 450.119
 due process, transparency and fairness, need for 430.66, 431.57

Restoration Pension Plan: *see* Staff Retirement Plan (SRP), Restoration of Pension Plan

restructuring of responsibilities: *see* reassignment/restructuring in interests of Bank including
 reassignment under Staff Rule 5.09

retaliation (including Staff Rule 8.01, para. 3.02 [para. 2.03])
see also abuse of discretion; improper motivation (including bad faith/*mala fides*), allegations of;
 regularization of Non-Regular Staff (NRS)/conversion of fixed-term contract (Staff Rule 4.01,
 para. 7 (pre-1998)) (including allegations of abuse of discretion)
 alleged cause
 accusation by name of unfairness and discrimination 255.24, 255.26
 adverse management decisions 417.42–9
 adverse professional treatment 366.8, 366.39–62, 369.74
 appeal against administrative decision 22.19–22, 34.25, 402.78
 appeal against demotion 357.38–41
 appeal against failure to review grade 319.37, 319.39
 appeal in unrelated matter 238.51–2
 attempt to expose improper practices 211.9–38, 244.71–2
 complaint about error by supervisor 203.9–10

complaint about handling of OPE 427.5, 427.53-5
complaint about INT management 411.41-6, 412.42-8, 416.39-50, 417.39-50, 419.51, 420.42-52, 422.39-48
complaint about PPR 152.24-5
complaint of racial discrimination 402.83-8
complaint of sexual harassment 181.9-13, 183.2-8, 197.3, 273.8-10, 273.25, 273.60-8, 308.7, 308.9, 369.74, 401.22-4, 401.36-44
complaint to Conflict Resolution System (CRS) 322.28
complaints about handling of leave 239.48-9
complaints about handling of project 188.6, 188.12
complaints about job classification 261.30
criticism of supervisor 313.40
decision not to appoint/delay in appointing to Open-Ended position 257.59-66, 422.42-8
decision not to shortlist 402.106-7
disagreement with line manager 322.28-9
disclosure of harassment complaint 394.2
email messages maligning staff member 419.50-4
frustration of job search 394.2, 401.38-42
frustration of preparation of terms of reference 402.90-6
harassment 271.110-31
imposition of MAS 144.53
interference with management of project 402.103-6
memorandum requesting inquiry into employment practices 255.41
non-confirmation of appointment 207.24, 314.38
non-promotion 313.40
non-renewal of contract 183.2-8, 401.42-4, 475.57-9
open-space comments on Bank's use of technology tools 257.41, 257.46-62
performance evaluation (OPE) 188.6, 188.12, 211.9-38, 211.71, 313.40, 320.9, 413.42-3
performance improvement program/PIP, placement on/extension of 152.25-6, 188.6, 188.12, 257.41, 257.53-7, 337.46-50, 402.108-28, 413.45, 414.51-2, 420.42-52
performance-assessment memorandum implying possibility of dismissal without due process 337.60-8
placement on administrative leave 393.37
preparation and dissemination of paper outside applicant's terms of reference 377.81-2
recruitment from outside to senior staff 271.111
redundancy decision 181.9-13, 185.14, 185.15-16, 185.19, 203.9-10, 273.60-8, 308.7, 308.9, 347.35-7, 357.34-45
redundancy threat 313.40
refusal to comply with line manager's directives 419.42-9
refusal to volunteer for redundancy 303.23-5
rejection of sexual advances 366.39-60
rescission of redundancy in favor of reassignment 254.26-8, 254.46
salary review decision 22.19-22, 34.25, 411.41-6, 412.42-8
sexual harassment complaint 197.3, 207.24-5, 244.71-2
termination of appointment 147.49, 377.81-2, 416.39-50
termination of payment of Individual Learning Plan tuition fees 418.53-6
undermining of role as team leader 402.97-102
whistle-blowing 337.48-9, 337.63-5, 347.35-7, 347.50, 357.38, 374.23, 374.30, 428.47, 438.30
withdrawal of request for investigation 271.108-9
alleged retaliation, restructuring of tasks 239.48-9

burden/standard of proof 313.50, 337.47–50, 347.35–7, 356.34, 377.81, 393.37, 402.80, 402.126, 439.47–8, 457.66–7, 475.58–9, 485.63–4
causality, need to demonstrate 320.9, 328.51–2, 401.36, 482.106–7, 485.64
insufficiency of evidence 438.30, 443.74–5
complaint about PIP 414.51–2
EBC review of allegation (Staff Rule 8.02, para. 3) 494.42
failure to substantiate claims 271.110–31, 273.68, 313.43–50, 313.82–4, 322.29, 327.51–3, 337.47–50, 363.29, 377.81–2, 401.42, 401.44, 402.89, 402.127, 428.47–9, 457.67, 459.38
good faith report of misconduct (“whistle-blowing”) 257.48, 257.57, 257.74, 319.37, 428.48
improper motive distinguished 257.48, 257.74
retaliation by applicant, allegations of 244.55–9

Retiree Medical Insurance Plan (MIP)

see also Medical Insurance Plan (Staff Rule 6.12/Circular N. 85/06)
differential treatment, whether discriminatory 229.30–2, 473.36–9
Medicare, mandatory enrollment in
1985 policy 473.4–9
2012 reforms 473.10–13
alleged arbitrary and discriminatory nature 473.16, 473.32–51
Bank’s policy in relation to problems of doctors’ not accepting Medicare patients 473.49, 473.454–546
processing of claims 473.50
parallelism with IMF 473.40–3
termination date
retroactive revision for Rule of 60 purposes 229.9–32
special leave, relevance 229.29–32

retirement age (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 4.03(a)), possibility of extension of employment beyond (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion/fairness) 348.2–37, 391.2–42

arbitrariness 348.17–18
in the [business] interests of the Bank 348.10–14
discretionary nature 348.29, 348.37
guidelines for interpretation and application of Rule (Stern memorandum) 348.18, 348.23–5, 348.29, 348.36
improper motivation 348.19–20, 348.34–6
legal/legitimate expectation 348.28–33
unfairness 348.19–20, 348.31, 348.35–6

retroactive amendment of Staff Rules: *see* terms and conditions of employment, Bank’s right to make changes to (*de Merode*)

retrospective evaluation of Bank’s conduct, grounds

alleged discrimination 230.10
arbitrary, whether 205.33
misclassification as Non-Regular Staff (NRS) 269.5–7

review of assignment of grade at staff member’s request (Staff Rule 6.05, Section 3) (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion) 135.25–39, 319.1–41

see also finality of Tribunal decision/*res judicata* (Statute XI); Job Grading Program (1982)/implementation (Staff Rule 5.09)
consultation and “review” distinguished 319.31–2
critical date 135.34
dependence of grade on work program 319.24, 319.26–7
discretionary nature 135.37, 319.26–8
failure of Bank to distinguish clearly between core and voluntary work 319.38

“request for” 319.28–30
requirements

Compensation Unit participation 319.32
third party involvement 319.31–2

revision of judgment in the event of the discovery of a fact which might have had decisive influence (Statute XIII(1)) 13.1–31, 33.2–26, 171.3–12, Order 1999-1.2-3, Order 2000-1.3-4, Order 2000-2.3-4, 259.10–12, Order 2002-10.6, Order 2002-11.3-6, 308.6–14, Order 2003-3, 350.1–28, 495.1–27

admissibility of new documentation 350.26

anonymity, request for 171.9–11

“decisive influence” requirement 33.25, 87.17, 350.19, 375.29, 477.29

discretionary nature 350.21

exhaustion of internal remedies/direct resort to Tribunal 138.6

medical condition giving rise to worker’s compensation claim, relevance 308.10

natural and reasonable interpretation 308.6

new claim (Statute II) distinguished 13.31, 308.12–14

“new fact”, classification as/exclusion

application as repetition of previous unsuccessful applications 477.32–7, 490.32

compliance with Tribunal decision 13.26, 18.21–2, 19.17–19

fact arising after delivery of judgment 13.25, 33.23–4, 350.20, 495.26

fact known at time of original case 495.18–24

itemized costs 87.16

memorandum whose content was known at time of application and judgment 170.2–23,
375.28–9

new witness, relevance Order 1999-1.2-3, Order 2004-1

re-opening of case/appeal distinguished 13.28–9, 495.25

right to request, third party 301.7–8

strict interpretation, need for 9.7–8, 13.22, 13.29, 350.18–22, 495.16

time limits 259.10–14, 375.12–20, 375.28–9

unsupported evidence relating to actions of third party 308.11–14

Rule of 50

alternatives, consideration prior to 1998 reform 205.17

application for Rule 50 pension, need for 403.25–6

normal retirement pension in absence of 403.13

critical date for entitlement 216.7, 400.28–48

definition 205.6

discriminatory, whether 212.6, 219.2–12, 220.2–11, 221.2–12, 222.2–21, 223.2–21, 224.2–21,
400.47

active service on critical date as distinguishing factor 212.8, 216.8, 216.9

as between persons in active service and on special leave 222.11–16, 223.2–16, 224.2–16

as between voluntary and non-voluntary termination 205.24–6, 205.30–2

financial implications 205.28–9, 205.34, 212.10–13, 212.15

as incentive to mobility 205.5, 205.9, 205.30–2, 205.33, 212.50, 400.36

as new benefit 205.21, 212.9

redundancy, relevance 205.28–9

rescission of Rule, rejection of request for 212.14

retroactive applicability, exclusion 403.13

retroactive change of terms of employment (Principle 2.1(c)), whether 205.18–21

severance payments and: *see* severance payments

Strategic Compact and 216.6, 216.8, 222.17–19, 223.17–19, 224.17–19

Transfer of Service Agreement, interrelationship 400.29–34

exclusion of service under 400.35–41
motivation for transfer back, relevance 400.41
object and purpose of SRP provisions 400.36
WB–ADB Pension Transfer Agreement and 400.10, 400.34

Rule of 60, retroactive revision of termination date and 229.9–32
Rule of 75 205.7, 205.11, 205.19, 205.32, 222.3, 222.9, 222.11, 224.3, 224.9
ex gratia extension of service and 200.19
Rule of 85 205.7, 205.26, 205.32, 208.3, 222.9, 224.9

salary (individual issues)

additional payment as remedy 242.17
fair treatment requirement (Principle 9.1) 360.19–21
gender discrimination and 245.52, 245.57–8
review following reinstatement 317.35–7
“salary” 138.16–18, 138.27–8

salary policy objectives (Principle 6.1) (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion/fairness)

differential treatment (Principle 2.1), grounds for 360.19–21
hardship allowance (Staff Rule 6.17, para. 3) 149.21, 149.27
health and well-being of staff and financial protection 205.14
intention, relevance 245.45
internal equity 1.67–70, 106.37, 107.28, 107.30, 108.53, 112.33, 149.21, 149.27, 245.45–57, 360.19–21, 458.34, 463.29, 468.18–19
burden/standard of proof 245.46–8
“with due regard to cost” (Principle 6.1(d)) 468.18–19
recruitment and retention of staff of the highest caliber appropriate to job requirements 90.28–9, 99.32–4, 205.14, 255.30, 444.46
staff motivation 106.35–7

salary review including periodic review obligation and right to automatic adjustment reflecting cost of living increases (*de Merode*) 1.90–113

see also IMF, parallelism with; Job Grading Program (1982)/implementation (Staff Rule 5.09); Kafka System (1979)
comparator principle 1.110, 38.4–6, 38.57–8, 38.79, 38.108, 39.28, 86.2–10
disciplinary action and (*Pinto*) 56.40, 66.26, 70.30, 71.31, 73.43
discretionary powers of Bank 38.93–112
Hay review (1984), reports and implementation 38.8–24
Job Grading Program (1980) and 56.37–40, 66.21–6, 70.29–30, 71.30–1, 73.42–3, 106.31, 107.26, 108.50–1, 109.29–30
Joint Bank/IMF Committee on Staff Compensation (JCC)
delays 39.19–28, 86.6–10, 86.35–7
suspension of salary increases pending report, propriety 39.1929
terms of reference 86.5
letters of appointment/Personnel Manual 1.91
Bank practice 1.92–110, 38.72–3
PATC Survey (1980) 38.5, 38.88–91, 38.100–1
political pressure, allegations of 38.103, 38.108–9
Principles of Staff Employment (1983) 38.7
quality premium 38.80–2
relevant factors
austerity policy of member States 38.15–16, 38.104–6
Bank’s discretion in choice of 1.102–4, 1.112, 38.93–6, 38.103–12

- consensus amongst Executive Directors 38.107
- cost of living increases 1.111–12
- IMF, parallelism with: *see* IMF, parallelism with
- sharp deviation, need to avoid 38.4, 38.10, 38.86–7, 38.89–91, 38.94, 86.2, 86.29
- role/responsibility of Bank President for decisions relating to 38.7, 38.9–13, 38.15–21, 38.34–9, 38.42, 38.45, 38.54–7, 38.60–1, 38.64–5, 38.86–90, 38.100–10, 38.114, 38.123, 38.126, 38.188–9
- Staff Association right of participation 38.14, 38.85, 86.38–9
- triennial review, Bank’s obligations relating to 38.4, 38.84, 86.2–39
- salary review increase (SRI)/merit award (including allegations of arbitrary and unfair decisions relating to) 354.2–32, 471.23–43, 480.34–46**
 - adjustment following review of discrepancy with previous years 226.22–4
 - adjustment as remedy 172.3, 239.34, 315.34–6
 - arbitrary performance evaluation as basis 434.19, 434.57
 - alleged abuse of discretion 226.24, 245.57–8, 271.164–5, 360.17–52, 483.42–4
 - burden/standard of proof
 - failure to substantiate claim 363.30, 411.47–8
 - specific irregularities relating to individual staff member 409.42–4
 - comparators including selection criteria 360.27–33, 458.36–48
 - age 360.31–2, 463.41
 - educational qualifications 360.28, 360.30
 - experience/length of service and 360.31–2
 - flexibility of choice 458.43
 - function/job title/staff doing similar work 458.27, 458.36, 463.38–40
 - need for greater precision 458.45
 - statistically significant assessment, need for (including difficulties of assembling a sufficiently large group) 458.42–5, 458.46
 - transparency problems 458.45–6
 - two-stage process (quantitative/qualitative) 458.43–4
 - as decision for purposes of administrative review 167.22
 - discretionary nature 57.21–35, 127.37–46, 156.21, 167.17–18, 226.16–24, 255.39–43, 303.25, 363.30, 372.59–61, 458.31, 463.35–7
 - grandfathering (Staff Rule 5.06, para. 3.01), effect 106.33, 107.27–9, 108.50–1, 109.29, 110.33, 112.32–3
 - discrimination allegations 360.32–3
 - dissatisfaction with implementation of Tribunal decision 490.1–32
 - see also* reinstatement as remedy (Statute XII(1)), dissatisfaction with implementation of Tribunal decision
 - documents relating to
 - Ad Hoc Increase Guidelines 463.31, 463.38, 463.40
 - Consultant Guidelines 463.32, 463.34
 - re-review 463.40, 463 Decision
 - challenge to, admissibility 490.1–32
 - failure to give written explanation, effect 6.21–5
 - improper motivation 156.21, 226.18–20, 303.23–5
 - inconsistency in exercise of management responsibilities and 226.24, 338.31
 - increase below that of previous years 226.16–24, 255.39–43
 - independent review, need for/qualification as 360.42–4
 - methodology 354.17–18, 354.25–31, 360.35–41, 458.31–48
 - see also* comparators *above*
 - alleged absence of consistent, uniform and reasonable procedures (PRS Panel finding)

458.14–16, 458.18, 458.35–48
 consistency and transparency, importance 360.45–7
 period of SRIs for review purposes 360.41
 rescaling of SRI figures 360.36–40, 360.52, 463.42
 observable and reasonable basis requirement 483.42–4
 performance evaluation, interrelationship with 315.29–34, 334.30–1, 338.32–9, 353.13–32, 354.8,
 360.35, 390.72–4, 404.92–3, 418.52, 423.42, 434.55–7, 471.31, 480.38–42, 483.38–41
 established order of proceeding (*Prasad*) 338.57–60, 471.26–8, 483.38–41
 prompt notification of result, need for 458.55
 retaliation 411.41–6, 412.42–8
 staff holding positions lower than personal level and 22.19–22, 33.17, 34.2–25, 99.40–1, 106.31–7,
 107.25–30, 108.50–2
 transparency requirement 354.8–10, 463 Decision
sanction, Tribunal’s consideration of admissibility under law of the Bank 242.33–5
 procedural irregularities giving rise to doubt 246.57
scope of review: *see* Appeals Committee (findings/recommendations), Tribunal review of; disciplinary
 proceedings (Staff Rule 8.01), scope of Tribunal review of (including
Carew/Mustafa/Cissé/Koudogbo formulation); discretion, limitation of Tribunal review of
 decisions involving to determination whether decision an abuse (*Saberi*); Workers’ Compensation
 Administrative Review Panel Staff (Rule 6.11, para. 12), appeal to Tribunal (para. 12.04)/scope of
 review (*Chhabra (No. 2)* formulation)
security of employment, extent of right (Principle 2.1(d))
 co-location policy and 303.13
 “highest caliber” obligation (Principle 6.1) and 90.28–9, 99.30–4, 255.30
 non-renewal of fixed-term contract and 441.37
 security of position distinguished 239.61
 separation on grounds of redundancy (Principle 7.1(b)(iii)) and 88.25
 termination for unsatisfactory performance and 437.17
**selection process (appointment/reassignment) (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of
 discretion/fairness)**
 additional feedback and reference checks, appropriateness 475.29
 age discrimination 344.42–54, 367.77
 alleged failure to honour assurances relating to 402.2–37
 alleged improper denial of opportunity to apply for position 435.39–43
 alleged retaliation and 402.106–7, 459.38
 bias/failure to follow proper procedures 100.46, 100.52–8, 101.446–50, 156.16–17, 257.41,
 257.64–5, 344.39–41, 344.55–9
 burden/standard of proof 444.5, 444.25–6, 444.34–5
 Chief Economist, practice relating to 453.53–63
 choice of candidate other than first choice of interview panel 475.30–5, 485.57
 clear criteria for selection and guidance on process, need for 81.17–20, 156.16–17, 344.27,
 344.68–75, 482.75–80
 comparative skills, appropriateness as criterion 90.29, 482.73, 482.83–8, 482.97
 need to record discussion of 326.53, 326.57, 326.72, 482.92–5, 485.51–4
 competitive basis 81.17, 156.15, 247.18, 328.42, 328.45, 402.66–73, 482.74, 482.92
 consistent criteria requirement 482.97, 485.54–5
 consistent and uniform practice, failure to observe as breach of Selection Guidelines 444.56
 continuity principle 402.22–3, 402.30, 402.48–50, 402.59–65
 discretionary nature (*Riddell*) 71, 482, 21.26–7, 45.37, 81.15, 100.30, 100.37, 101.38, 169.18,
 255.23, 257.61, 261.45, 326.73–4, 339.48–50, 401.38–41, 402.73, 409.45–7, 410.55–7,
 419.48–9, 420.53–6, 423.43–5, 435.28–38, 438.39, 444.15, 444.20, 444.31, 444.41, 459.29,

459.35, 475.28, 475.30, 475.34, 482.74, 485.38
discrimination/unfairness **444.25–6, 444.34–5**
diversity requirement (Principle 2.1) **453.65–6**
documentation/transparency **444.21–2, 444.32–3, 444.57, 452.30–5, 485.56**
exceptions to rule relating to period for submission of application, fairness **344.61–7**
fixed-term contract, renewal/extension **255.23, 328.42, 328.45**
“highest caliber” requirement (Principle 4.1) **90.28–9, 99.31–4, 255.30, 391.31–2, 444.46, 482.73, 482.99–100**
Human Resources positions post-2012 reforms: *see* Human Resources reforms (2012), selection for post-reorganization positions
improper motivation **420.53–6**
improper/undue influence **255.24–30, 344.55–9**
inconsistency between advertised criteria and basis for decision **326.64, 326.74**
incumbency, relevance **84.43**
internal candidates at same or higher level grade with appropriate skills, preferential treatment (Staff Rule 5.09, para. 1.06(c)) **90.33–7, 99.33–4, 482.81**
internal candidates identified as ready for promotion (Staff Rule 5.09, para. 5.03) **90.33–41**
interviews
 alleged hostility towards candidate, failure to substantiate **482.101**
 consistency of panel decision with record **248.48–9**
 need for **344.27**
 Perea/BK (No. 2) criteria **482.90–105, 485.51–8**
 written record of interview/evaluation, importance **326.65–6, 326.72, 452.36–42, 482.93–7, 485.51–4**
“managers”, eligibility for consideration (Staff Rule 5.09, para. 1.05(b)) **91.24–32**
“manifestly unreasonable” test **444.14–45**
matrix, appropriateness/need for **255.31–3, 452.42, 482.94–7**
medical condition, relevance **247.18**
nomination of candidate with pending appeal against Department **21.26–7**
non-selection, need to give reasons for **482.103–4**
performance evaluation and
 alleged improper reliance on **435.44–6**
 decisions inconsistent with **100.29–61**
 inclusion of unjustified negative comments **16.42, 96.36, 99.35–8, 247.22**
 interview report allegedly at odds with/as assessment of skills in relation to particular job **482.98**
 lack of opportunity to address weaknesses **101.42–5**
policy differences, Bank’s right to take into account **81.16–19**
preferred status system **257.9, 257.49–52, 276.43–5**
racial discrimination **344.42–54, 367.76, 402.74–7, 435.47–8**
reasonable and observable/objective basis, need for **453.69, 482.72–89, 484.37–59, 485.55**
 evidence of **475.30–5**
role of President in appointment of staff (Principle 1.01) **453.53–63**
 abuse of power/improper motivation, allegations of **453.63**
 compliance with Staff Rules **453.54–62**
 Human Resources Managerial Hiring Process **453.59–60**
 Management Appointments Protocol (2008) **453.61**
Selection Panel, composition and role **344.68–70, 444.48–55**
 failure to comply with Selection Guidelines/Principle 4.1 **444.52, 444.54**
severance pay, relevance **326.67–71**
Shortlisting Committee (SLC)/shortlisting process

alleged discrimination 459.38
alleged retaliation 459.38
criteria (*Perea/BK (NO. 2)*/Shortlisting Guidelines) (objectivity, transparency, rigor and diversity) 444.46, 444.52, 444.56, 482.94–7, 485.40–1
discretionary nature of selection process 459.35
follow-up review in light of candidate’s OPEs 458.34
independent review of evaluation 459.33
membership 459.32
obligation to give reasons for non-inclusion 459.36, 482.82
 non-inclusion of very negative assessments 459.36
shortlisting of candidate failing to meet selection criteria 255.23–38
shortlisting of candidate not included on HRC list of recommendations at Hiring Manager’s request 485.42–9
Shortlisting Guidelines 444.14, 444.21, 444.46, 444.48–57, 459.32
withdrawal of vacancy, notification to candidates 453.70–2
 delay in taking decision 453.69

settlement agreement: *see* mutually agreed separation (MAS)/settlement agreement (MOU) including waiver of right of appeal

severance payments

see also mutually agreed separation (MAS)/settlement agreement (MOU) including waiver of right of appeal; Rule of 50; termination grant
absence of financial compensation provision in termination agreement, effect 113.27–42
accrued rights and 205.18–21
administration 205.16
as bar to eligibility for Rule 50 pension 205.6, 205.7, 205.9–36, 222.9, 223.9, 224.9
 breach of Staff Rule 7.01, whether 205.27
 fairness 205.22–3
 non-discretionary nature of SRP terms 205.11
 reasonable, whether 205.22–3
 retroactive, whether 205.18–21
as bridge 205.15–16
as compensation for loss of pension and other benefits 205.15
constituent elements 159.7–41, 208.4–6
consultancy appointments, effect on right to seek in case of assurances as part of termination package, *see also* consultancy appointments
definition (SRP Art. 3, s 3.3(a)) 222.7, 223.7, 224.7
funding as abuse of discretion 205.28–9, 212.7
linkage with pension rights as abuse of discretion 205.13–36, 212.7
lump sum and installment payments, discriminatory treatment on basis of 222.20–1, 223.20–1, 224.20–1, 229.31
pension rights distinguished 205.14–16, 208.5
purpose 205.10, 205.23, 222.8, 223.8, 224.8
repayment, effect 216.9
selection process, relevance to 326.67–71
temporary appointment as “continuous service” for purposes of 154.26–31
termination on grounds of redundancy (Staff Rule 7.01, para 8.08) 482.64–5
termination for unsatisfactory performance (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 11.4) and 188.22–5, 199.20
 possibility of 188.22–5
 50% limit 188.22, 188.23
 amount equivalent to redundancy payment 188.23–4
 lump sum payment, Bank’s right to make 188.23, 188.25

waiver of claims and appeal rights, Bank's right to require 188.23
professional incompetence and interpersonal relations problems distinguished 188.22
redundancy benefits, exclusion 188.23-5
waiver of right to 205.24, 205.27, 219.3-12, 220.3-10, 221.3-12, 227.19
human rights and 219.12, 221.12

sexual discrimination: *see* gender discrimination

sexual harassment

abuse of discretion, allegations relating to
delay in responding to complaint 197.48-52
complainant's withhold of information pending attempt at settlement 197.49
Bank's obligation to protect against 194.12, 197.42-6, 197.56, 197.78-80, 401.22-4
complaint as alleged retaliation 197.3, 207.24-5, 244.71-2
complaint as cause of retaliation 181.9-13, 183.2-8, 273.8-10, 273.25, 273.60-8, 308.7, 308.9,
401.22-4, 401.36-44
contributory fault of complainant 197.56, 197.80
failure to make clear unacceptability of approaches 197.76-7
definition 197.77
delay in making complaint 197.75, 207.25, 244.35-6
evidence
absence/insufficiency 139.51, 181.10-11, 194.2-5, 239.55, 244.31-43, 244.73, 476.46
burden/standard of proof ("substantial evidence" requirement) 366.32-62, 369.56-74
complainant's failure to pursue claim 273.68
credibility 197.27, 197.38, 197.74-6, 206.34, 207.22, 207.25, 207.27, 244.31-43
events giving rise to claim 197.16-17, 206.4-18, 239.4-15, 244.17-30
Guidelines for Implementation of the World Bank Group Policy on Eradicating Harassment (2000)
366.43
hostile working environment, Bank's obligation to protect against 197.95-6, 244.15-16,
244.31-43, 369.98, 401.25-30
inappropriate behaviour short of harassment 197.36, 197.78-80, 366.67-9
Preventing and Stopping Sexual Harassment in the Workplace (1994) 194.12, 244.14-15
as term and condition of employment 194.12
termination of appointment for 207.28-9

sexual harassment, independent investigation

abuse of discretion, allegations relating to
acceptance of investigator's report
four days after rebuttal 197.36, 197.67-9
sufficiency of evidence to justify 197.72-3
competence of investigator 197.53, 197.69
conflict of interests 197.54
credibility, weight given to 197.74-6
evidence of 197.53
improper influence of Bank 197.55
oath, relevance 197.63
recording of evidence 197.64-5
complainant's discussion with witnesses about discrepancies 197.65
reopening of investigation as result 197.36-41, 197.69-70
witnesses
failure to hear all suggested 197.59
presence at interview, examination and cross-examination 197.62
administrative nature 197.63
applicable law

- Bank policies and procedures 197.21
- Preventing and Stopping Sexual Harassment in the Workplace* (1994) 197.27
- at suggestion of complainant 197.49, 197.53
- male interviewer, right to 366.74
- report
 - Bank's acceptance of findings 197.30, 197.40
 - challenge to 197.28–9, 197.39
- standards and procedures 197.22
 - confidentiality of proceedings 197.23
 - transcripts of interviews with non-party witnesses, right to 197.22, 197.41, 197.60–1, 257.75, 369.88–91
 - transcripts of interviews with parties, right to 197.22, 197.41, 197.60
- terms of reference 197.55, 197.58
- timely notice of charges 366.74
- sexual relationships between supervisors and subordinates, failure to resolve conflicts of interest** 1000
 - failure adequately and promptly to resolve conflict of interest 426.104–19, 427.3–10
 - measures taken 426.105
 - “manager/supervisor and subordinate relationship” 426.18
 - inaccurate designation by INT of applicant's official position 427.45–52
 - reporting relationship, need for 416.74, 426.78, 426.104–15, 427.45–52
 - Staff Rule 3.01, para. 4.01 (1999) 426.17
 - Staff Rule 3.01, para. 4.02 (2004) 426.19
- sick leave (Staff Rule 6.22)** 331.42
- special leave (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 13)**
 - see also* administrative leave (Staff Rule 6.06, para. 9) (including allegations of abuse of discretion); leave; maternity leave (Staff Rule 5.01)
 - change of Bank practice, effect on severance payments 222.8, 223.8, 224.8
 - consent of staff member, need for 222.9, 223.9, 224.9
 - external service without pay distinguished 222.15–16, 223.15–16, 224.15–16
 - leave without pay distinguished 222.15–16, 223.15–16, 224.15–16
 - payment for regular employment activities carried out during 115.41–4
 - revision of start period
 - in case of inappropriate work assignment 196.11
 - eligibility for vacancy 196.14–15
 - search period for alternative employment and 196.11
 - rights and obligations of staff member, right to during (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 13.02(b)) 17.46, 115.37–44, 216.6, 222.11–14, 223.11–14, 224.11–14
 - severance distinguished, *see also* Retiree Medical Insurance Plan (MIP); Rule of 50 Staff Retirement Plan (SRP), amendment during 222.4, 222.6–16, 223.6–16, 224.4, 224.6–16
- spousal benefits (IMF/Bank) couples** 446.5
 - see also* mobility premium (Staff Rule 21), Bank/IMF couples (para. 3.05)
- Spousal and Child Support Policy (1998)** 325.10–11, 325.23–4
 - see also* family obligations, spouse and/or child support (Staff Rule 3.06)
 - disclosure of personal information to outside authorities (Staff Rule 2.01, para. 5.01) and 443.45, 443.49–50
 - lawfulness/excess of powers 325.25, 383.37–9, 443.58–60
 - MOU circumvention of legitimate objective, exclusion 443.60
 - SRP differences 325.22, 325.51
- spousal support claims** 325.2–67, 484.1–65
 - see also* disclosure of documents, request for, refusal, correspondence between Bank and applicant's

estranged wife's attorney, refusal; family obligations, spouse and/or child support (Staff Rule 3.06); Rule of 50; surviving spouse benefit (SRP Art. 4, s 4.1(a)(ii))
1995 amendment (SRP 5.1(c))
object and purpose
 avoidance of immunity-related problems 325.20–2, 424.58–9
 protection of retired staff members' former spouses/prevention of evasion of court orders 424.58–61, 484.37, 484.41, 484.61–2
text 403.7, 424.57, 484.36
US Retirement Equity Act 1984 and 403.5–6
applicable law (internal law of Bank (SRP) vs national law) 424.57, 484.40, 484.48
in case of two valid divorce decrees 383.1–65, 403.2–32, 425.2–76
Bank's right to communicate with spouse and counsel 383.59–61
clarifying order 383.41–51
compliance obligation 424.62–70
deduction from salary 325.24
division of property rights distinguished 383.72, 424.71–3
enforcement as matter for DC courts 325.31, 403.29–31
failure to pay as misconduct (Staff Rule 8.01) 325.24, 325.52–4, 325.58, 325.63
immunity (Bank) and 325.10, 325.20–2, 403.23, 424.58–9, 424.67–70
immunity (personal) and 424.64–6
implementation, allegations of abuse of discretion 383.30–65
interpretation by Bank 325.26, 325.31, 383.32–5, 403.28
non-punitive nature 325.24, 325.64
notification of order and arrangements for payment 383.55–8
partial payment, INT's authority in respect of 325.29
court order for support payment, clarity of language 383.39–51
divorced and separated spouses, direct payment to 403.2–31, 424.69, 443.64–5
 dependence on retiree's commencement of pension 403.10–12, 403.24
EBC role 325.44–5
evidence requirements (SRP 5.1(c))
 legal separation or divorce 484.39, 484.42–8
 “decree of legal separation” 484.45–8
 “final order” 484.55–63
 staff member's obligation to pay spousal support from pension 484.39, 484.49–63
guardianship order (Illinois state court), applicability 338.1–46
 SRP 4.1, 12.6 and 31.1, precedence 358.23–46
INT role 325.10, 325.21, 325.42–67
investigations, INT authority 325.21
modification of the payment obligation by Pension Benefits Administrator 484.63
suspension of payments pending resolution of dispute 424.2, 424.21–2
time limits/critical date, date of Orders calling for deduction of support from Applicant's pension 484.64–665

Staff Association

Bank responsibility for actions of 384.49–50
object and purpose 40.3, 384.49
role in formulation of Bank policies (Principle 10.1/Staff Rule 10.1) 10.4, 40.5, 86.38, 425.46
structure 40.3

Staff Association–Tribunal relationship

amicus curiae brief, standing 40.88–9, 76.1, 76.5, 86.1, 106.1, 106.39, 107.1, 107.31, 108.1, 108.54, 109.1, 109.31, 110.1, 110.34, 111.1, 111.32, 152.1, 152.38–42, 205.1, 205.12, 208.1, 208.10, 208.29, 214.1, 214.36–7, 215.1, 215.45–6, 232.1, 232.16–20, 233.1, 233.15–18,

234.1, 234.15–18, 235.1, 235.15–18, 240.20, 271.41, 373.1, 425.4, 430.1, 431.1
 cases involving
 attempts to secure pension benefits for Non-Regular Staff **231.4, 240.19–20, Order 2002-15.2, Order 2002-1.2, Order 2002-4.2, Order 2002-5.2, Order 2002-6.2, Order 2002-8.2, Order 2002-9.2, Order 2002-13.2, Order 2002-14.2, Order 2002-16.2, Order 2002-17.2**
 challenge to 1987 Bank reorganization including Staff Rule 5.09 implementing **40.1–89, 41.1–33, 42.1–20, 43.1–20, 44.1–20, 45.1–20, 46.1–20, 47.1–20, 48.1–20, 49.1–20, 50.1–20, 51.1–35, 52.1–27, 53.1–31, 54.1–27**
 right to file application
 as an intervening party **40.87**
 on behalf of staff member **40.85–6, 41.19–24**
 Executive Committee member on behalf of staff member **41.19–24**
 on its own behalf **40.80–3**
 overview **40.78–84**
“staff member” status
 home leave and **14.49–54**
 standing to make application to Tribunal, dependence on **40.78–86, 41.19–23**
staff records (Staff Rule 2.01)
 Bank’s obligations (para. 7.01) **406.37–46**
 paper records, sufficiency **406.38**
 updating of computerized database **406.46**
 correction of clarification by staff member (para. 6.03) **406.42–4**
 definition (para. 1.03(f)) **406.43**
 paper records, ongoing validity **406.45**
 alleged inconsistencies **406.40, 406.42–4**
 review of paper records for pension credit purposes **406.39**
 transfer of pre-1995 computer records to **406.38**
 Peoplesoft, Bank’s updating obligation **406.46**
 reasonableness of Bank’s policy **406.41**
Staff Retirement Plan (SRP)
 see also Pension Benefits Administration Committee (PBAC); Pension Benefits Administration Committee (PBAC) decisions, appeal to Tribunal; Retiree Medical Insurance Plan (MIP)
 acceptance of withdrawal benefit resulting in exclusion from **258.4–9, 258.27–9, 265.3–4, 265.7–14, 265.27–31**
 Bank’s failure to draw attention to risks **265.27–31**
 compensation for **265.31**
 critical date
 “active service” requirement **212.50, 216.6, 216.8, 222.13–14, 222.21, 223.13–14, 223.21, 224.13–14, 224.21**
 arbitrary, whether **216.7**
 date of action or event giving rise to contested decision **265.15, 336.25–7**
 date of request to rejoin SRP **265.25**
 date of entitlement to participation
 abuse of discretion and **253.32**
 obligation to make contributions, effect **253.33**
 differential treatment, justification **205.24–6, 219.8, 220.8, 221.8, 222.11–14, 223.11–14, 224.13–14, 224.21, 301.11–18**
 equitable, whether **306.14–19, 309.19–33**
 disability pension: *see* disability pension (SRP 3, s 3.4)
 funding

- contributions, role **205.34, 212.11**
- financial implications of Rule 50 **205.28–9, 205.34, 212.10–13, 212.15**
- severance payments and **205.28–9**
- as unjust enrichment **324.31–3**
- Gross Plan, country office service, exclusion from **262.8, 262.21, 263.12, 264.12, 281.20**
- Non-Regular Staff and: *see* Non-Regular Staff (NRS), entitlement to benefits under SRP (Staff Retirement Plan)
- pension
 - commutation arrangements **398.23–32**
 - exchange rate considerations **398.23–32**
 - ratio to contributions **324.29**
 - as recruitment incentive **205.13–14**
 - tax liability **208.5, 208.9–19**
 - see also* tax allowance (Staff Rule 6.04)
- Principle 6.2(d), compliance with **301.20**
- reform
 - 1998 changes: *see* Human Resources Policy Reform (1998)
 - 2002 changes: *see* Non-Regular Staff (NRS), entitlement to benefits under SRP (Staff Retirement Plan)
 - discretionary right to **265.23–5, 324.31–3**
- Restoration of Pension Plan, notice of
 - Bank’s obligation to give **399.21**
 - email transmission, failure of applicant to read notice **399.2–29**
 - “receipt of notice” **399.20–8**
 - text of Restoration Plan (SRP 8A.1)/terms of arrangement **399.18–19**
- restoration of prior service
 - fundamental right, whether **265.23–5**
 - pre-1998 reform **265.23**
- Rule of 50: *see* Rule of 50
- scope of Tribunal review of decisions relating to **153.29, 306.17, 324.31–3, 383.31**
- spousal support claims, modifications relating to, *see also* Spousal and Child Support Policy (1998), SRP differences; spousal support claims
- staff member’s obligation to ensure compliance **328.56**
- surviving spouse benefit: *see* surviving spouse benefit (SRP Art. 4, s 4.1(a)(ii))
- termination grant distinguished **333.23–5**
- time limits for claim, *dies a quo*, decision establishing right **253.30–1**
- US tax liability, relevance **324.30**
 - as governmental plan for purposes of US law **210.23–4**
- Staff Rules:** *see* terms and conditions of employment, Bank’s right to make changes to (*de Merode*); terms and conditions of employment, sources/applicable law
- staff/management relations:** *see* management/staff relations
- Standard Separation Package (Staff Rule 5.09, para. 9.03) (Package A)**
 - see also* Enhanced Separation Package (Staff Rule 5.09, para. 7.06) (Package B); mutually agreed separation (MAS)/settlement agreement (MOU) including waiver of right of appeal
 - entitlement/grounds for refusal **83.44–61**
- standing, requirements/right of recourse to Tribunal**
 - see also* amicus curiae brief; Staff Association–Tribunal relationship
 - class actions, exclusion **219.1, 219.5, 220.1, 220.5, 221.1, 221.5, 240.19–20**
 - Decisions 408-422 have an identical para. 31
 - as essential condition of employment (*de Merode*) **1.21, 53.25, 408.31**
 - former member of staff **179.16, 318.32, 343.18, 370.34–8, 387.31–6, 406.30, 426.55, 443.37**

“member of Staff” (Statute II(1) and (3)), limitation to 40.78–86, 41.19–23, 104.15
any person designated or otherwise entitled to receive a payment under the SRP (Statute II(3))
424.46

non-observance of contract or terms of appointment of applicant causing individual harm or grievance (*Agodo*) 40.82–3, 41.23–33, 42.19, 43.19–20, 44.19–20, 45.19–20, 46.19–20, 47.19–20, 48.19–20, 49.19–20, 50.19–20, 51.27–9, 52.24–5, 53.221, 54.24, 118.30–1, 119.28–30, 120.30, 121.8–9, 121.30, 122.30, 123.24, 123.31, 124.29, 125.29, 126.27–9, 172.8–9, 214.41–3, 215.50, 233.19–21, 234.19, 235.19, 239.40, 240.19–20, 245.43–4, Order 2002-1.6-8, Order 2002-4.6-8, Order 2002-5.6-8, Order 2002-6.6-8, Order 2002-8.6-8, Order 2002-9.6-8, Order 2002-13.6-8, Order 2002-14.6-8, Order 2002-15.6-8, Order 2002-16.6-8, Order 2002-17.6-8, 294.17, 324.23–7, 356.28–30, 409.44, 409.47, 409.51, 446.30

Principles of Staff Employment 91 as basis 29.36

representative/non-representative actions (Tribunal Rule 26(2)) 1.11, 38.23, 446.48

right of intervention 26.34, 39.2, 40.87, 330.1, 358.1

third party communications 358.1

Tribunal Statute as basis of 1.21, 25.25, 29.29

state responsibility, application of principles to Bank 209.10

statute of limitations: *see* time limits

stay of proceedings

pending decisions which might render case moot 38.2, 38.25–30

pending discussions between intervenor and the parties 101.1

pending outcome of settlement discussions 294.2

preliminary investigation into allegations and 303.8

refusal of request for 76.1, 268.23

submission of additional appeal and 303.8

Strategic Compact

discriminatory, whether 222.17–19, 223.17–19, 224.17–19

Rule of 50 and 216.8, 222.17–19, 223.17–19, 224.17–19

Supplementary Performance Evaluation: *see* performance evaluation (non-OPE) (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion)

surviving spouse benefit (SRP Art. 4, s 4.1(a)(ii))

see also death benefit (SRP)

1974 amendment 210.15

divorced surviving spouse, entitlement 210.2–27

discriminatory, whether 210.26

optional survivor annuity distinguished 210.22, 210.25

Pension Benefits Administration Procedure Manual (1993) 210.17

practice of Bank 210.13–19, 210.27

“surviving spouse” (SRP Art. 4, s 4.1(a)(ii)) 210.11–13

tax allowance (Staff Rule 6.04)

applicability to Tribunal awards 468.17–20

Bank’s obligations

assistance to staff member 208.29

failure to explain calculations 208.20

calculation (US citizens) (Staff Rule 6.04, para. 3)

abuse of discretion, whether 208.21–9

disciplinary measures

proportionality 158.37–44

rescission of decision to terminate, effect 158.45

lowest taxation assumption (para. 2.06) 208.24–6
 Medicare/social security payments and (para. 7.01) 208.5–6, 208.21, 208.27–8
 part-year staff (para. 3.05) (“annualization”) 158.3–36, 208.7–8
 actual situation of staff member, relevance 208.17–18, 208.26
 effect of annualization on tax liabilities, right to compensation for 208.9–19
 pension, whether benefit for purposes of 208.5, 208.13–19
 ‘compensation’ (Staff Rule 6.04, para. 1.03(a)), “other payments” 468.17
 entitlement to tax allowance “reasonably related” to tax liability (IBRD By-Law 13(b)/Principle 6.2(g)) 468.18–19
 gross compensation (Staff Rule 6.04, para. 6), applicability to Tribunal awards 468.16
 misconduct relating to, classification as, *see also* misconduct, classification as (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 3.01 [para. 2.01]/Principle 3/breaches of Staff Rule 3.0), taxes
 purpose 208.2
 safety-net provisions 208.4, 208.18, 208.54–6
 staff member’s obligation to pay taxes (para. 2.01) 158.34

tax reimbursement (pre-1980)

AMS (1948) 32.5
 By-Law 14(b) 1.20
 Executive Directors’ Recommendation of 10 December 1946 32.3–5
 PMS 3.05 32.6

tax reimbursement system (Personnel Manual Circular 1/80)

abuse of discretion, whether 1.83–9
 annualization procedure/applicability to part-time staff 32.12–13, 32.33–47
 appeals against
 jurisdiction 1.10
 representative/no-representative actions 1.11
 confidentiality of tax data and 32.10–11, 32.18–19, 32.48–57
 retroactive amendment of condition of service, whether 1.49–82
 safety-net provisions 32.9–13
 summary of changes 1.8, 32.7–8

taxation of commuted pension payments, Bank’s obligation to notify staff of possible legislative changes 78.41–6

temporary appointment
see also fixed-term contract, renewal or extension, right to; Non-Regular Staff (NRS), entitlement to benefits under SRP (Staff Retirement Plan)
 eligibility for leave and severance payments 154.26–30

termination for abandonment of office (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 9) (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion/fairness) 478.20–40

“abandonment” (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 9.02) 478.22
 “fails without excuse acceptable to the manager...to make him/herself available” 478.29–31
 decision to terminate (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 9.3) 478.33
 notice of termination (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 9.04) 478.24
 absence of notice period/“reasonable notice and fixing of date for separation” 478.26–8
 email as acceptable form of communication 478.25
 Resettlement Grant entitlement 478.32–3
 UNAT jurisprudence 478.26, 478.30

termination, assistance available on (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 14.02), commutation to lump sum payment 155.25–33

termination grant
see also mutually agreed separation (MAS)/settlement agreement (MOU) including waiver of right of appeal; Rule of 50; severance payments

failure to modify letter of appointment to reflect payment of premium in lieu **Order 2002-21.5-6**
 fairness **17.45**
 payment on termination of country service
 as abuse of discretion **262.11–20, 263.7–14, 264.7–14, 281.15–18**
 as adverse decision for purpose of determining time limits **262.18, 263.10, 264.10, 281.16–17**
 premature, whether **262.6–8, 262.11–20, 263.7–8, 264.7–8, 281.15–18**
 reversibility **262.6–8, 262.21–7, 263.8–10, 264.8–10**
 time limits for challenging **262.7, 262.8, 262.13–14, 262.17–20, 262.22–7, 263.8–13, 264.8–13,**
281.16–17, 282.3–4, 283.3–4, 284.3–4, 285.3–4, 286.3–4, 287.3–4, 288.3–4, 289.3–4,
290.3–4, 291.3–4, 333.7, 333.17–25

termination for ill-health (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 7) 151.2–31
termination for misconduct or other misbehaviour (Staff Rule 8.01, para. 4.03(i) [Staff Rule 3.00,
para. 10.06(k)])
see also disciplinary measures *headings*; mandatory termination (Staff Rule 3.01/Staff Rule 8.01)
 appropriateness except where mandatory **492.27–59**
 review of Tribunal’s jurisprudence **492.49–51**
 failure to observe due process in disciplinary proceedings leading to **369.96–100**
 notice of **143.32–4**
 proportionality (para. 4.01 [para. 3.01]) **14.47–8, 28.41, 105.53, 140.41–2, 142.43–6, 143.37–42,**
158.37–44, 207.28–9, 242.33–5, 300.37, 304.49–54, 305.16, 305.70–5, 352.38–42, 369.54–5,
369.82, 373.49–51, 378.41–6, 389.114–18, 448.45–53, 448.83, 455.32–56, 492.27–59
 resignation as alternative **378.30, 378.59**
 unjustified assumption as to likelihood, adverse effects arising from **450.118**
 unjustified determination of misconduct and **366.9, 366.61–3**

termination of telecommuting arrangement
 allegations relating to abuse of discretion/fairness **478.35–6**
 for business reasons **478.14, 478.36**
 provision for six-month evaluation period **478.7, 478.13, 478.36**

termination for unsatisfactory performance (AMS 1.08/Staff Rule 7.01, para. 11) (including
allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion/fairness) 5.22–31, 6.2–39, 17.42–3,
96.2–44, 150.2–57, 152.2–37
see also mutually agreed separation (MAS)/settlement agreement (MOU) including waiver of right
 of appeal; performance effectiveness plan in case of unsatisfactory performance (Staff Rule
 7.01, paras. 10-11); performance improvement plan (PIP) (Staff Rule 5.03, para. 3.02)
 (including allegations of abuse of discretion); severance payments, termination for
 unsatisfactory performance (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 11.4) and; termination grant

allegations of
 collusion between Human Resources, Legal Vice-Presidency and World Bank Institute **432.24**
 discrimination **147.47**
 failure to pay overdue salary and benefits **2.33**
 improper motivation **2.26**
 retaliation **147.49**

alternative appointment, Bank’s right to point to performance shortcomings **96.33–6**
 disability as alternative ground **12.36–41, 12.53**
 as discretionary right of Bank **2.25, 5.23–5, 6.27, 14.38, 17.43, 27.31, 88.21–5, 147.41**
 evidence of strong performance and **437.20**
 “if performance remains unsatisfactory” **147.40–1**
 mutually agreed settlement as alternative **139.13, 139.52–6, 150.56**
 new regulations, need for/Bank’s failure to produce **5.29–30, 6.31, 10.50**
 notice of termination as controlling document **188.7**
 notification in press, appropriateness **246.55–6**

notification of true reasons 2.27–30, 14.33–6
period of notice 10.51–3
PIP and 432.41, 434.21–69
President’s powers (Articles of Agreement V.5(b)) 24.22–9
prompt notification of reasons for termination, need for 2.27–9
proportionality and 14.47–8
public notification of termination 276.26, 276.52–3, 277.16
reasonable period for improvement (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 11.02) 96.31–40, 147.45–6, 150.53–4
reassignment as alternative
 applicant’s rejection of, effect 24.32
 best efforts to find suitable post 150.55
 as discretionary right of Bank 96.41–3, 147.11–12, 147.14, 147.51
 probationary reassignment to post clearly beyond applicant’s competence 139.52–6
 procedure 14.12, 14.35, 14.37–48, 21.32
security of employment (Principle 2.1(d)) and 437.17
standard of care 241.39
visa entitlement following 5.28
voluntary resignation following unpaid leave as alternative 150.56
warning of possibility of termination 6.31–9, 17.44, 96.31–2, 150.9

terms and conditions of employment, Bank’s right to make changes to (*de Merode*)

see also interpretation of Staff Rules and comparable documents
classification as essential/non-essential 1.42–5, 173.14–19
 accrued leave 353.27
 accrued rights for services already performed concept (Principle 2.1(c)) 1.46, 173.26, 301.19, 305.74, 336.31
 in case of specific assurances 159.7–41
 consultancy appointments following termination with severance payments (pre-1994 Staff Rule 4.01, para. 8.03) 146.37–46, 173.26
 disciplinary measures 304.49, 396.41
 hardship allowance (Staff Rule 6.17, para. 4.01) 149.24–7
 Human Resources Policy Reform (1998) 205.18–21, 233.8, 234.8, 235.8, 252.8, 253.8, 265.26, 301.7
 non-discrimination principle 26.20–2
 regular appointment following departure with separation package 146.43
 salary review/adjustment 38.6, 38.84, 38.96, 38.124, 86.33, 106.30–4, 107.24–6, 108.51–2
 tax reimbursement system (Personnel Manual Circular 1/80) 1.49–82
 terms of MAS/MOU 159.29, 159.41, 466.42–5
explanation of terms distinguished 460.55
notification of amendments to Staff Rule 173.22–6
“for valid reasons and in good faith” 1.36, 1.45, 1.47, 1.48, 1.83–9, 38.69, 38.74–7, 58.46–8, 86.34, 149.24–6, 159.28–9, 173.22–4, 463.36

terms and conditions of employment, sources/applicable law

see also contract of employment; management/staff relations; practice of Bank as term and condition of employment; Principles of Staff Employment (general); salary review including periodic review obligation and right to automatic adjustment reflecting cost of living increases (*de Merode*); salary review increase (SRI)/merit award (including allegations of arbitrary and unfair decisions relating to)

Articles of Agreement 1.18–20
 Checklist for Managing Staff on Probation 271.52
 error in interpretation of Staff Rules 271.161–3
 Code of Professional Ethics 389.44, 389.62–3, 451.66

Development Assignment Implementation Guidelines **454.30**
 Disclosure of Information Policy (2002) **448.40**
 on feedback **254.45**
 General Services Department, Translation Department Staffing Strategy (1994) **178.7–8, 178.12, 178.20**
 Guide to the Staff Rule 8.01 Investigative Process (2008) **389.112**
 Guide to Staffing Policies **84.43**
 Guidelines for Implementation of the World Bank Group Policy on Eradicating Harassment (2000) **366.43**
 Human Resources Managerial Hiring Process 45359–60
 Information Security Policy (AMS 620A): *see* email accounts, Bank’s right of access to (Information Security Policy (AMS 6.20A)) (including allegations relating to due process/abuse of discretion)
 interpretation and application of Staff Rule 7.01, para.3.03(a) (mandatory retirement) **348.23**
 Management Appointments Protocol (2008) **453.61**
 Managing People – Guidelines for Managers (1982) **17.38**
 Managing Staff in a Demand Driven Environment — Guidance to Managers **260.53–4**
 on payment of staff moving from country offices to headquarters **262.15**
 Performance Management Process (1996) **211.23, 211.72–5, 332.49, 332.63, 332.65, 332.67**
 Preventing and Stopping Sexual Harassment in the Workplace **194.12, 197.22, 197.36, 197.72–80, 207.4, 207.19, 244.14–15**
 Procedures Guide for Managers (“Blue Book”)/1985 revisions **58.38, 58.46–8, 59.3–4, 60.3–4, 61.3–4, 62.3–4, 63.3–4, 64.3–4**
 Provision of Translation Services in the World Bank (1994) **178.6**
 ‘Racial Equality in the Bank Group’ **344.43**
 Standards and Procedures for Inquiries and Investigations (2001) (INT Standards) **304.55, 304.58, 304.63, 340.80, 352.28, 426.58, 427.33–5**
 Standards and Procedures for Operations Evaluation **23.44**
 status **23.44**
 tourism projects, memorandum on staff implications of phasing out (14 February 1978) **11.17–30, 18.22, 19.19, 20.19**
 World Bank Policy on Disclosure of Information (1994/2002) **272.13, 272.16**
 Bank guidelines and policy documents, Shortlisting Guidelines **414.14, 414.21, 444.14, 444.21, 444.46, 444.48–57**
 By-laws **1.20, 212.16–17**
 conflict of interest and **246.31, 389.55**
 critical date for determining applicable Rule **154.26–30, 387.31–6**
 applicability of rule in effect at time of misconduct **304.49, 386.36, 396.41–2, 396.48**
 exceptional circumstances (Statute II(2)) and **230.9, 236.21, 236.28, 237.21, 238.22–3, 240.27, 251.52, 279.16–18, 280.14–18, 307.8, 346.22, 395.30**
 general principles of law acknowledged by Bank **1.25, 38.23**
 generally applicable rules, objective nature **1.29, 1.30**
 ignorance of available remedies **129.23, 134.6, 134.21–6**
 ignorance of documents relevant to interpretation of Staff Rules/SRP **210.20, 215.35**
 ignorance of establishment of Tribunal **8.15, 8.19–20**
 internal law of Bank, limitation to **1.27, 1.36, 210.23–4, 242.23, 330.13–16, 379.38**
 language difficulties **280.12–13**
 letter of agreement for external service **384.34–46**
 letter of appointment **1.16–29, 112.49–53, 180.16–31, 262.15, 264.8, 412.51–4**
 misconduct and **143.35**
 misunderstanding of Bank’s right to amend Staff Rules **173.20–1**

NRS entitlement to participation in SRP 270.21
prior to the introduction of Staff Rules and Regulations 1.18
rules of procedure, need for constant development and refinement 425.46, 442.53
salary review guidelines (1984) 34.21
staff manuals and handbooks 1.22, 1.73, 7.4, 14.50, 17.38, 32.33
 Local Staff Benefits Handbook 262.15, 263.8, 264.8
 World Bank Group Staff Retirement Plan Handbook (1993) 214.35, 215.44
staff member's obligation to familiarize him/herself with 154.32, 174.7–8, 215.35, 230.9, 236.21,
 237.21–2, 295.28, 296.14, 300.21, 333.35, 467.27, 470.48–9, 478.37–40, 487.75, 489.51,
 489.55–6
time limits 230.9, 236.28, 237.21, 238.22–3, 240.27, 251.52, 279.16–18, 280.14–18, 307.8
Tribunal decision 267.8–9, 267.12, 447.131
Tribunal Statute 1.21

testimony: *see* evidence

time limits (administrative review (Staff Rule 9.01, para. 2.01)/*dies a quo*) (pre-2000)

amendment of rule relating to 295.15
Bank's willingness 'to look into' outside time limits, relevance 136.29
continuing injury vs re-iterated claim 136.31
decision not to extend resettlement benefits 204.15–24
disability benefits claim 479.36–9
failure to meet (applicant) 132.40–2, 136.23–30, 137.24–31, 141.20–3, 190.3–4, 232.21,
 237.13–18, 261.21–3, 262.19, 263.9, 264.9, 275.33–5, Order 2003-2, 467.21–3
failure to meet (respondent) 192.23, 203.16
informal discussions, relevance 313.67–71
mediation and 279.9–10, 280.9–10, 323.33–7
occurrence of event giving rise to application as trigger 467.22
receipt of payroll statement 89.38–46
reply to request for clarification of conditions of termination of services 155.2, 155.24
termination of 6-month search period 190.9–10

time limits (appeal to Appeals Committee against administrative decision (Staff Rule 9.03, para. 5.01)/*dies a quo*) (post-2000) 318.25–7, 323.16–18, 329.18, 346.12–24, 394.12–20

Note: administrative review (Staff rule 9.01) was abolished in February 2000 and replaced by new Staff Rule 9.01 (Office of Mediation) and Staff Rule 9.03 (Appeals Committee). Under the new Staff Rule 9.03, para. 5.01 appeal must be made within either 90 days of receipt of written decision or 30 days of termination of unsuccessful mediation.

in absence of authorized signature 327.4
"administrative decision" 392.23, 393.25, 394.14
appeal against preceding contested decision 261.27–8, 318.29
applicant's responsibility for meeting 251.52, 318.27, 346.22
Bank's agreement to reconsider matter, relevance 251.38–47, 359.37, 359.39–41
continuous complaint and 230.8, 313.42, 324.21–2, 324.28, 329.21–2, 336.26
date of inappropriate application to Tribunal 267.16
date of separation from Bank 270.18
decision of Appeals Tribunal relating to termination of contract 440.20–1
decision leading to conclusion that implementation of Tribunal decision defective 267.7
decision not to reassign 326.42
decision not to regularize appointment 270.17–18
decision of Tribunal 51.35, 52.27, 53.31, 54.27
delay caused by use of multiple lines of approach 257.67–70
direct submission of claim to Tribunal 336.5, 336.21–3
dispatch of request 194.5, 194.7–9

extension 279.14, 448.28
 issue of Personal Action Forms 316.42
 later decision as basis of recognition that earlier decision flawed, relevance 253.17–18, **Order 2002-1.3-6, Order 2002-4.3-6, Order 2002-5.3-6, Order 2002-6.3-6, Order 2002-8.3-6, Order 2002-9.3-6, Order 2002-13.3-6, Order 2002-14.3-6, Order 2002-15.3-6, Order 2002-16.3-6, Order 2002-17.6-7, 307.6**
 letter of appointment as Short-Term Consultant 295.16–21
 letter communicating text of Appeals Committee Report 175.20
 mediation, effect (Staff Rule 9.01, para. 4.02(b)) 276.41, 279.9–10, 280.9–10, 323.33–7, 443.34–5
 treatment of different stages of mediation as single process 323.16–18, 323.33–8
 notification by e-mail of appointment to new job on termination of Consultancy appointment 275.27–9
 notification by email of decision not to grant mobility premium 346.14
 notification of decision not to grant increased in termination grant 333.19
 notification of decision not to grant requested relief 166.18
 notification of decision on request for administrative review 276.41
 notification during OPE of Bank’s intention not to extend contract 250.12–14
 notification of intention to arrange conversion process and confirmation that contract would remain valid until expiry date 275.27–9
 notification of non-renewal of contract 270.18, 275.27–9, **Order 2002-20.2-5**
 notification of redesignation decision 261.24–5
 notification of rejection of request for administrative review 89.35–6
 notification of release of personnel information 268.14–20
 notification of termination for unsatisfactory performance 80.11–17
 notification/acceptance of mutually agreed separation package (MAS) 333.17–18, 333.20–1
 payment of termination grant 262.18, 263.10, 264.10, 281.16–17, 333.7, 333.17–18
 reasonable awareness of misclassification as Non-Regular Staff: *see* Non-Regular Staff (NRS), misclassification as
 reasonable awareness of wrongful conduct or treatment 230.10, 318.31, 346.15–16
 receipt of final decision from Pension Administration Department 258.28
 receipt of notification of approval of new position 261.24–5
 receipt of written administrative decision [to disclose documents] 385.17, 385.29–38
 regularization of appointment 269.6
 repeated notifications of failure of job search 394.20
 request for consideration with new evidence (*Tucker/Sharpston*), relevance 238.27, 251.27–43, 359.21–50, 365.35
 request for reconsideration without new evidence/later communication confirming earlier decision, relevance (*Agerschou/Sharpston*) 134.29, 141.27–8, 204.22–3, 236.22–5, 238.25–8, 250.16–18, 251.34–47, 259.7–10, 268.10, 275.34–6, 295.31, 318.25, 333.31–4, 359.31–49, 359.50, 385.37, 443.44, 478.45
 termination for misconduct (Staff Rule 8.02, para. 4.01) 237.9–10, 237.12–28
 Tribunal decision in comparable case 298.13–14
time limits for application to Tribunal (Statute II(ii)(a)) (“occurrence of event giving rise to the application”)
 alternative possibilities all falling outside the 90 day limit 231.7–16
 application of policy with detrimental effect 473.24–31
 continuous tort and 163.10–12, 163.14
 date of becoming aware in absence of Staff Rule/formal announcement of Bank policy 488.46–7, 491.56–7
 despatch vs receipt of application 194.7–8
 extension to first business day after 486.38

impossibility of identifying specific *dies a quo* 469.40
letter communicating Bank's acceptance of recommendations of Appeals Committee 296.7–11
spousal support Orders 484.64–5
unspecified event 163.8–12

time limits for application to Tribunal (Statute II(ii)(b)) (“receipt of notice that relief asked for/recommended will not be granted”)

applicant's proposed waiver of right appeal/'token' compensation, relevance 123.28–9
in case of applicant's notified absence from delivery address for report 249.10–24
in case of closely related decisions 12.36–42
correctness of decision rejecting request for administrative review, relevance 89.37
evidence of receipt 385.32–4
receipt of Bank's decision regarding Appeals Committee decisions 447.106, 447.110
receipt of decision rejecting appeal 89.29, 134.27
receipt of letter confirming finality of Appeals Committee decision 134.28
receipt of rejection of request for reconsideration of Appeal Committee's decision 89.29
receipt of written administrative decision [to disclose documents] 385.17, 385.29–38

time limits (challenge to jurisdiction) (Tribunal Rules 8(1)) 314.3–6, 327.3–6

time limits (direct application to Tribunal) (Tribunal Rule 7(8)) 426.41–8, 427.18–28

time limits (general)

see also claims for money owed and claims accrued (Staff Rule 11.01); exceptional circumstances justifying failure to meet time limits for submission of application (Statute II(2)); exhaustion of internal remedies (Statute II(2)(i)); Pension Benefits Administration Committee (PBAC); Pension Benefits Administration Committee (PBAC) decisions, appeal to Tribunal (including *Courtney (No. 2)* formulation of scope of review), time limits for application (“from date of communication of the contested decision”)

“after reasonable period” for cure of breach 442.38–9

corrections to application 10.1, Order 2000-3.3-5, Order 2002-3.2

events outside time limits as evidence of practice (“ball of wax” theory) 148.27, 148.34–5, 294.40, 320.7–8, 320.18–21, 322.7, 323.28–32, 334.36–40, 354.21–3, 379.22, 428.45, 478.44, 494.35–9

expedition of case and 40.2, 41.2, 42.2, 43.2, 44.2, 45.2, 46.2, 47.2, 48.2, 49.2, 50.2, 51.2, 52.2, 53.2

parallel claims with different time limits, need to handle as independent claims 230.13, 240.22, 445.29

purpose

availability of evidence considerations 230.11, 269.8, 428.44

avoidance of unlimited or undefined claims proceedings 230.11, 230.12, 230.14, 262.27

opportunity in case of work-related injury to address, manage and mitigate liability 228.18

protection of management/staff relations 230.11, 230.14, 262.27, 269.8

request for revision of Tribunal decision in event of discovery of decisive new fact (Statute, Article XIII(1)) 13.1–31, 259.10–14

as set by Tribunal 160 Decision, 183 Decision, 190 Decision, 195 Decision, 249 Decision, 268 Decision

waiver/extension, pending decision on similar applications 231.8–9, 233.7, 234.7, 235.7

time limits (PRS review), 120 calendar days of receiving notice 494.10, 494.33–4

time limits (Workers' Compensation Program) (Staff Rule 6.11/para. 3.01) 228.9, 228.18–20, 349.12–13, 349.38–44

tort, applicability to relationship between Bank and staff member 163.10–11, 163.14

training including Bank's obligation to provide

agreement to requests for as evidence of fairness 441.47

alternative employment following redundancy and 347.52

applicant's demonstrated responsiveness to 100.48–51, 100.56–8
applicant's failure to take advantage of opportunities 24.32, 132.48, 260.43
assurances related to 313.79
compensation for failure to provide 31.8, 31.27, 31.32, 132.48, 132 Decision
as exceptional circumstance 279.14
following redundancy 482.69, 493.40–3, 493.56–7
funding of university studies and 255.44
improvement of skills in order to meet changing job requirements and 101.35, 101.43, 101.45,
101.47, 168.26–7, 248.51, 303.21, 321.75
inappropriateness where expertise depends on lengthy experience 191.16
irremediable nature of performance problems 24.32, 277.17
language training "in exceptional cases" (PMS 4.02-5) 10.38–43
legal obligation (Principle 5(d)/PMS 4.03, s 1), whether 84.36–45
on-the-job opportunities, sufficiency 132.47
probation and 10.31–44, 31.25–7, 157.46–7, 157.48–9, 225.38–44, 293.43–4, 327.36–50
reassignment under Staff Rule 5.09 and 84.36–45, 94.48, 100.57–8, 101.35, 101.43, 101.45, 101.47
as remedy 226.14, 256.18
Rural Development: From Vision to Action (1996) 260.4–5
termination of arrangements for reimbursement of Individual Learning Plan tuition fees 53–6

transcripts

allegation relating to due process/abuse of discretion 197.60, 257.75, 369.88–91, 378.50–1,
389.140, 426.126, 433.18–19, 486.209
change of practice relating to 378.51, 389.140, 426.126
desirability 197.22, 197.41, 197.60–1, 257.75, 369.88–91
as sole record 433.19
transcripts of interviews with non-party witnesses 197.22, 197.41, 197.60–1, 257.75, 369.88–91,
486.209
transcripts of interviews with parties 197.22, 197.41, 197.60
as verbatim unedited record 433.19

Transfer of Service Agreement: *see* Rule of 50

translation services

absence of clear criteria 178.15
GSDTD Strategy Paper (1994) 178.7–8, 178.12, 178.20
Provision of Translation Services in the World Bank (1994) 178.6

travel management audit, procedural flaws including lack of due diligence 362.6–19

Tribunal decision

see also publication of decision (Rule 24); Tribunal decision, implementation
clarification 469.7–8
finality (Statute XI): *see* finality of Tribunal decision/*res judicata* (Statute XI)
interpretation of decision 76.28–32, 138.19–28
 exhaustion of internal remedies, relevance 138.23–6
 revision distinguished 138.19–22
 Tribunal's inherent power of 76.30–1, 138.24
obligation to consider/discuss all claims 341.37
reasons, need for 13.27–9
 application of general principle and 76.28–32
as term of employment 132.45, 267.8–9, 267.12

Tribunal decision, implementation

as alleged retaliation 19.21
applicant's obstructive conduct/attempt to impose conditions 19.20, 21.31, 317.9–55
automaticity of cancellation of redundancy 317.9(iv), 317.23

complaint against as complaint against administrative decision
 exhaustion of internal remedies, need for 132.45, 138.25, 229.26, 267.6–16, 469.8, 469.37–42
 time limits 267.7
discretion as to manner of 267.14
dissatisfaction with 490.1–32
interpretation distinguished 267.10–13
time limits for 317.39
unsatisfactory implementation as abuse of discretion 267.15

Tribunal Rules (general), matters not provided for, Tribunal's power to deal with (Rule 25) 16.2

Tribunal's powers: *see* disciplinary proceedings (Staff Rule 8.01), scope of Tribunal review of (including *Carew/Mustafa/Cissé/Koudogbo* formulation); discretion, limitation of Tribunal review of decisions involving to determination whether decision an abuse (*Saberi*); jurisdiction (Tribunal)

UN Assignment Grant 460.16–17, 460.20, 460.43–54

undue haste

acceptance of investigation report 197.67–9
accessing staff member's email files 304.58
administrative review decision 241.19, 241.40–3
Claims Administrator's decisions 311.35
disciplinary proceedings 430.76, 430.97, 430.100, 431.84, 431.87–8, 450.110, 450.113–14
finding of misconduct 369.103, 430.76
management review 100.92, 430.76, 430.87, 430.100–1, 431.74–5, 431.87, 450.100–1
non-confirmation of employment 225.55–6
performance evaluation 430.88
placement on administrative leave 340.37–8, 340.81
redundancy decision 192.19–20, 254.43–4, 273.70, 292.70–4, 331.77–8
termination of employment 147.14, 416.43, 416.48–50, 437.67–8

undue influence: *see* improper motivation (including bad faith/*mala fides*), allegations of

unfairness, allegations of

see also abuse of discretion; fairness, impartiality, non-discrimination and proper process (Principles 2.1 and 9.1); legal/legitimate expectation; probation (PMS 4.02/Staff Rule 4.02), confirmation/non-confirmation of appointment (including allegations of unfairness/breach of due process in relation to); redundancy consequent on abolition of position or change in job requirements (general issues) (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8) (including allegations relating to abuse of discretion/failure to observe due process/fairness)

acknowledgment of longstanding unfair practices 255.47
intention, relevance 245.45
investigation and remedial action, recommendation for 255.47
time limits and 194.8

unfairness, allegations in relation to

consideration for alternative employment 321.65–70
creation of supportive conditions 211.68–70, 211.78, 217.84–7
failure to ensure respect for applicant 217.88
fee, determination of 217.79
Loan Department (LOA) 255.47
management of probation period 157.44–57, 225.47–56, 271.56–107
notification of consequences of splitting six-month contract 217.80–3
obligation to provide supervision 217.44–55, 225.38–44
performance evaluation, failure to take proper account of work environment 211.56–63, 211.78–9
regression analysis, refusal to provide 245.25–30, 245.34–8, 245.49–56
reimbursement of expenses 217.84–7

Rule of 50 205.22–3

selection process 81.16–20

underemployment issues 248.51

Workers' Compensation Program 218.31

unforeseen circumstances as justification for Bank's failure to comply with MAS/MOU 466.46–69

unjust enrichment, remuneration of work in position graded on a personal basis 200.18

unpaid leave: *see* leave without pay (Staff Rule 6.06, para. 6.02)

Unreduced Early Retirement Pension: *see* Rule of 50

untimely application: *see* time limits

visa entitlement

dependence on contract 133.40

G-IV visa status 5.28, 393.55–7

G-V visa, allegations of misconduct relating to 140.30–3, 455.3–56

staff member on administrative leave 393.55–7

vocational rehabilitation: *see* Workers' Compensation Program (Staff Rule 6.11)

Volcker Report (2007) 389.112, 395.47–8

Note: Decisions 408-423 have an identical para. 10

applicability 426.125–6

PIP practice 408.10

volunteer: *see* redundancy consequent on reduction in number of positions (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8.02(d)), factors to be taken into account (Staff Rule 7.01, para. 8.03)

waiver of right of appeal: *see* mutually agreed separation (MAS)/settlement agreement (MOU) including waiver of right of appeal; termination grant

waiver of severance: *see* Rule of 50

whistleblowing on misconduct

absence of cause for suspicion of misconduct 448.44

allegation of retaliation for 337.48–9, 337.63–5, 347.35–7, 347.50, 357.38, 374.23, 374.30, 428.47, 438.30

as justification for unauthorized disclosure of Bank documents 448.41–4

protections (Staff Rule 8.01) 465.34

para. 2.02 (pre-June 2008) 448.41

para. 4.01 (June 2008) 448.42–3

US law, applicability 427.41–4

withdrawal of application/mootness

Bank's offer to pay costs 186.1–3

developments rendering case/claim moot 65.27–30, 68.36–9, 384.52–3, 407.24–8, 411.58, 412.59, 419.54

rectification of errors and measures to redress complaints 442.40–4

rectification of irregularities identified by Grievance Panel 410.54, 412.48, 412.54, 413.44, 414.42, 415.44, 420.52, 423.42

rectification of procedural flaws (disciplinary proceedings) 427.44

following settlement agreement 36.1–4, 37.1–4, 278.1–3

belated implementation of MOU as ground for review by Tribunal 466.36

following successful mediation **Order 2002-19**

Orders/Decisions recording 67 Decision, 80 Decision, 102 Decision, 116 Decision, **Order 2001-1, Order 2001-2, Order 2002-18.1-2**

request to reinstate

on basis of amended pleadings 77.1

on grounds of mental incapacity at time of making **Order 1998**

timely correction of error in decision 39.30–4

withdrawal benefit: *see* Staff Retirement Plan (SRP), acceptance of withdrawal benefit resulting in exclusion from

witnesses

see also evidence

allegations of tampering with 334.41

depositions, request to see, refusal 260.1

Ethics Office investigation, rights of person under investigation 197.59, 197.62, 206.28–33, 207.32–3, 244.44, 244.46–7, 300.29, 300.32, 305.58

expert witness 239.33

oath, practice relating to 197.63

oral testimony, refusal of request for 175.27–8, 271.42, 316.1

subpoena powers 371.37, 389.152

written testimony, refusal of request for 2.intro, 143.1

work program/terms of reference (including allegations of due process/abuse of discretion)

176.18–20, 217.38–55

alleged interference with preparation of as retaliation 402.90–6

Bank's obligation to provide clearly defined work program (Principle 2.1(e)) 266.44–50, 320.9, 322.8, 322.12–14, 363.25–6, 461.32–4, 464.17–25

Bank's right to change 217.40–2

discretionary nature 176.20, 432.29

during probation 157.45–7, 294.34, 351.22–5

fair and reasonable processes requirement 377.73–80, 432.32

following extended absence because of illness 247.17–18

mishandling by the Bank 176.18–20

for new position (redundancy) 266.40–50

as part of PIP 437.22

performance evaluation/OPE and 217.47, 217.55, 404.86–91, 441.39–47, 441.48, 441 (dissenting opinion).5–8, 463.33

seniority, relevance 217.53–4, 217.86–7

for short-term appointee 217.38–55

staff member's obligations in relation to 404.88–91, 432.26–32, 464.21–5

Workers' Compensation Administrative Review Panel (Staff Rule 6.11, para. 12)

administrative nature 193.15

appeal against decision taken in connection with the administration of a compensable claim (para. 12.01) 425.33

appeal to Tribunal (para. 12.04)/scope of review (*Chhabra (No. 2)* formulation) 193.7, 218.14, 228.2, 228.9–10, 311.6, 311.18, 349.14–15, 364.46, 364.57, 445.20–2

: *Note:* It was established in *Chhabra (No. 2)* that the Tribunal's task was limited to determining whether the Review Panel's conclusion could be reasonably sustained on the basis of the evidence before it and whether it had acted in accordance with the relevant legal rules and procedural requirements.

Panel's determination of applicability of D.C. Workers' Compensation Act 364.47–50

reasonableness of decision on basis evidence 311.6–30, 349.14–44, 349.54, 364.51–6

composition (para. 12.02) 193.15

conflict of interest and 193.15

disability claim (Staff Rule 6.22, para. 6.01) 425.34

time limit for transmission of decision (Staff Rule 6.11, para. 12.03) 311.33–5

Workers' Compensation Program (Staff Rule 6.11) (including allegations relating to due process/fairness)

see also disability pension (SRP 3, s 3.4); Disability Program; Staff Retirement Plan (SRP)

applicability
as appropriate remedy for employment-related illness 2.32, 7.30, 11.29
disability compensation distinguished 177.20, 218.4–5, 218.12, 218.16–20
fault, relevance 2.32
injury arising out of and in course of employment requirement 2.32, 311.22–6, 471.51, 471.52
burden/standard of proof 445.25–7
objective standard 193.8–13, 445.26
preponderance of the evidence 364.50, 445.25
Claims Administrator’s obligation to act with fairness and objectivity (Principle 2.1) 202.14, 218.31, 349.54–8
confusion between claims 349.55
decision to dismiss claim in case of failure to provide documentation 202.17–18
failure to answer allegations of lost documents and photographs 349.55
failure to apply correct Staff Rule 218.31
failure to communicate promptly with applicant 218.31
failure to ensure proper procedures by medical examiners 349.56–7
failure to explain relationship between workers’ compensation claims and disability pension provisions 218.31
incorrect application of earlier Tribunal decision 218.31
obligation to make “such investigations as deemed necessary” 445.28–35
coordination of benefits (Staff Rule 6.11, para. 10) 218.18–20
D.C. Workers’ Compensation Act as applicable law (para. 2.01) 193.3–12, 202.14, 202.23–5, 218.29, 311.25, 349.29, 364.32, 364.47–50, 445.23–7
provisions not specified in Staff Rules 202.14, 364.47–9, 444.25
delay in reaching a decision 445.36
discontinuance/denial of benefits in case of, non-participation in vocational rehabilitation (Staff Rule 6.11, para. 6.03) 218.5–6, 218.9–12
medical examination, Claims Administrator’s right to require (Staff Rule 6.11, para. 3.03)
Claims Administrator’s right to choose independent medical examiner 218.27
obligation to undergo 218.6–12, 218.21–30
recurrent requirements 218.12, 218.22–3, 425.38–46
medical examiners, evaluation of evidence of 349.33–7
medical expenses (Staff Rule 6.11, para. 5)
approval, need for
appropriate course of medical treatment (para. 5.01) 425.40–1
prior to an anticipated change in the course of treatment (para. 5.02) 425.40–1
“causally related” 193.6–14, 218.4–6, 218.9–10, 218.12, 218.17, 218.20, 218.26, 425.40
aggravation of condition 202.12, 202.19
autoimmune diseases and 193.10–12
“reasonable” 218.9–10, 425.41
medical and other documentation (Staff Rule 6.11, para. 3.02), Claims Administrator’s authority to request 202.15–16, 425.44–5, 445.29
medical and other information/medical examination, denial of benefits in case of failure to provide/present for (Staff Rule 6.11, para. 3.04) 202.2–25, 218.9, 218.10, 218.21–3, 218.28, 311.13–20, 311.23–5, 311.27–32, 425.44–5
automaticity 202.18, 311.32
billing information, adequacy 202.21
Claims Administrator’s right to determine requirements 202.20, 311.31, 425.42, 425.44–5
confidentiality of records 202.23–4
doctor’s unwillingness to provide records 202.5–25
applicant’s responsibility for securing compliance 202.25

relevance **202.23–5**
harsh, arbitrary or unreasonable outcome and **218.28, 311.32**
inconsistent claims relating to existence of records **202.22**
procedures, recommendation for improvement **425.46, 442.53**
redundancy decision, relevance to **308.10**
retroactive application of modified rules, arbitrariness **425.48–9**
time limits for claim (Staff Rule 6.11, para. 3.01)/*dies a quo* **228.9, 228.18–20, 349.12–13,**
349.38–44